

**The Academy of Religion
and Psychical Research**

1987 Annual Conference

PROCEEDINGS

**PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
AND
SPIRIT**

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

P. O. Box 614 • Bloomfield, Connecticut 06002

AFTERLIFE TRADITIONS AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
INTRODUCING A MESSIANIC GEOCOSMIC MODEL

Ry Redd

Drawing on concepts and conclusions of Edgar Cayce, Emanuel Swedenborg and others as well as on his own experiences and reflections, the author offers some speculation concerning the state and development of the human soul after death.

I will begin by describing afterlife traditions from around the world, past and present, including well known clairvoyant sources. I will then review recent research relevant to these afterlife traditions and will introduce a new reincarnation-afterlife hypothesis. I will conclude with some traditions concerning the Last Judgement and a summary.

AFTERLIFE TRADITIONS, EAST AND WEST

First, religious philosophy, mythology, and eschatology since deep antiquity--from Babylon (or Persia) to India, Tibet, China, Egypt, Greece, Rome, Israel, and many so-called primitive cultures--have seen an evolutionary cycle in the soul's reincarnations and literally cosmic experiences beyond death in the celestial afterlife of the planets and stars. The theme is as universal as it is specific, being found in Pythagorean sources and native mythologies as well as ancient Chinese sources.¹

For example, as if they had studied Pythagoras, the Maori tribe of New Zealand taught that each star has mountains and plains and was peopled with souls just like the earth. Mythological images of stormy caverns like Tartaros and rivers like the river Styx in Greek lore are references to the other world, with its cosmic rivers flowing through the heavens. For example, Numenius, an early expert on Plato, openly taught that these rivers and Tartaros, too, were the "region of the planets."²

Now, the study of the afterlife in religion and theology is formally called eschatology, meaning the study of last things, that is, the final end of physical life and of what happens in the life beyond. Of course, the most influential philosopher in the West was Plato. His system on eschatology appeared in his dialogues, for the most part in the form of myth, one of the most remarkable of which is his myth of Er. Er had a near-death experience in which he returned to life on his funeral pyre and told of what he had seen in the world beyond. Amnesia or forgetfulness concerning what he had experienced occurred in the last "station" in his descent back to earth life, symbolized by the image of being washed in the river called Lethe. Also, the great Roman poet-philosopher Virgil later repeats this

THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH

PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE

Frank C. Tribbe, Chairman

Rev. Lawrence W. Althouse
Mr. Boyce Batey
Mr. John R. Crowley
Rev. Paul B. Fenske

Dr. Michael Grosso
Rev. Paul L. Higgins
Mr. Leslie Price
Rev. William V. Rauscher

Dr. Mary C. Rose
Miss Rhea A. White
Dr. Edgar Wirt
Ms. Nancy Zingrone

PURPOSES OF THE ACADEMY

THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH was formed in October, 1972 as an academic affiliate of Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship. Its purposes are threefold:

FIRST, to encourage dialogue, exchange of ideas and cooperation between clergy and academics of religion and philosophy and scientists, researchers and academics of all scientific and humanistic disciplines in the fields of psychical research and new disciplines as well as the historic sciences.

SECOND, to conduct an education program for these scholars, the Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship membership and the general public, blending data already available in the area of their common interest with the interchange of views stimulated in these scholars, to the end that both the scientific and religious communities may be better informed about such facts and views and their propriety, value and respectability.

THIRD, to work closely with, and offer good offices to, all reputable organizations having related interests in the fields of education, religion, science and psychical research.

The ACADEMY will endeavor to sponsor conferences and symposia for the presentation of scholarly data, points of view and interchange of ideas in the area where religion and psychical research interface; publish papers resulting from such meetings and other appropriate materials on this area that will be of interest to academics, scientists and clergy; and encourage formation of local chapters.

The ACADEMY is governed by a Board of Trustees composed of people of academic stature holding a post-graduate degree or the equivalent in outstanding activity relevant to the interests of the ACADEMY.

CATEGORIES OF MEMBERSHIP IN THE ACADEMY

PATRON MEMBER: Open to anyone donating \$100 or more in a given calendar year. Includes full membership privileges for a one year period.

ACADEMIC MEMBER: Open to academic religionists involved in research or teaching or those who have the proper terminal degrees (Ph.D., Th.D., St.D., and sometimes St.M., and M.A.) Also, academically or otherwise qualified psychical researchers, pastoral counselors, behavioral and humanistic psychologists, parapsychologists, and other academics teaching or contributing to research knowledge. Dues are \$25 annually.

SUPPORTING MEMBER: Open to persons wishing to attend conferences and meetings, receive printed materials and desirous of helping finance the work of the ACADEMY. Dues are \$15 annually.

For information concerning the Academy of Religion and Psychical Research write Boyce Batey, Executive Secretary, P.O. Box 614, Bloomfield, CT 06002

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

Orphic-Pythagorean tradition of loss of memory upon re-birth.³

Consider the following truly cosmic myth from the dialogue Plato named after Timaeus, a Pythagorean adept. God, the Master Builder, "after making souls in equal number to the stars, distributed them," with each soul assigned to its specific star:

There, mounting them as it were in chariots, he showed them the nature of the universe and declared to them the laws of Destiny. There would be appointed a first incarnation one and the same for all....and they were to be sown, each one into that which was meet for it....And he who should live well for his due span of time should journey back to the habitation of his consort star and there live a happy and congenial life; but failing of this,...he should constantly be changed....When he [God] had delivered to them these ordinances... he sowed them, some in the Earth, some in the Moon, some in other instruments of time.⁴

Of course, Plato is referring here to the planets, to which souls were moved after being taken away by God from their respective fixed stars. Thus was the Time Machine switched on, with the first generation of souls being sown in the Earth, while the remainder waited their turn, disembodied--or rather not yet embodied--in the planets.

Plato's view of the origin and meaning of earth life and of the life beyond is related here in the Timaeus and in other dialogues through his mouthpiece Socrates. Plato said the teaching actually originated with the priests of Egypt, whose pyramids have since been found to have been used for out-of-body rituals, celestial travels, and guidance through the death transition for pharaohs and adepts. Plato also attributed the legendary if not mythical Pythagoras with being the one who first introduced this teaching to the Greeks. In fact, a prominent follower of Plato's, the second-century Roman philosopher-astronomer Macrobius, related a tradition ascribed to Pythagoras on why milk is the first nourishment offered the newly born: "The first movement of souls slipping into earthly bodies is from the Milky Way...the souls of the blessed proceed from here and return hither."⁵

Within the framework of traditions concerning the journeys of the soul in the afterlife, the conception was literally universal that souls dwelled in the Milky Way between incarnations. Macrobius even specified that, at death, souls ascend to the Milky Way by way of the constellation of Capricorn, and, then, in preparation for rebirth, descend through "the Gate of Cancer." Bear in mind that in his time, as in ours, the constellations rising in the East at the Summer and Winter solstices were Gemini--called the Gate of Cancer, as it immediately precedes Cancer--and Sagittarius. Macrobius goes so far as to explicitly state

PSYCHICAL RESEARCH AND SPIRIT

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH

TWELFTH ANNUAL CONFERENCE

ROSEMONT COLLEGE
ROSEMONT, PENNSYLVANIA

MAY 24-26, 1987

EDITED BY

MARY CARMAN ROSE

that this "Gate" is "where the Zodiac and the Milky Way intersect."⁶

The reason for going into such detail here is that the exact same afterlife tradition, i.e., that the Milky Way is the galactic gateway out of Time, is found on the other side of the world in the Austral Islands of Polynesia. There, centuries ago, the Manganian people taught that "only at the evening of the solstitial days can spirits enter heaven."⁷ The Maori people of New Zealand also considered the Milky Way to be "the road of souls as they pass to the spirit world."⁸ In an additional close parallel to Greek tradition, myths from Polynesia agree that souls cannot stay in the Milky Way "unless they have reached a stage of unstained perfection, which is not likely to occur frequently."⁹ In other words, for the most part Polynesian souls sooner or later have to reincarnate. This, too, is the teaching of the Marquesans of Polynesia, who similarly say, "all the souls of the dead, after having lived in one or the other place (i.e., Paradise or Hades) for a very long time return to animate other bodies."¹⁰

Other virtually identical myths dealing with the soul's galactic afterlife journeys are found in several Indian tribes in Central and North America. According to the Sumo people of Honduras and Nicaragua, "Mother Scorpion... is regarded as dwelling at the end of the Milky Way, where she receives the souls of the dead, and from her, represented as a mother with many breasts, at which children take suck, come the souls of the newborn."¹¹ (Note here Macrobius' parallel metaphor, already mentioned, concerning why milk is offered the newly born.)

Moreover, according to the Pawnee and Cherokee, "The souls of the dead are received by a star at the northern end of the Milky Way, where it bifurcates, and he directs the warriors upon the dim and difficult arm, women and those who die of old age upon the brighter and easier path. The souls then journey southward. At the end of the celestial pathway they are received by the Spirit-Star, and there they make their home [for a while]."¹² This Spirit-Star has been identified as Antares (alpha Scorpii), because it is at the Southern crossroads, where the Milky Way galaxy intersects the constellations of the zodiac.

Especially interesting here is that Macrobius also has souls ascending after death to the very same place as in Indian traditions, namely the southern crossroads between the zodiacal constellations Scorpio and Capricorn. Finally, a very similar, archaic version of our celestial journeys in the spirit world is found in the Vedic literature of Hinduism.

This afterlife tradition that our true residence is in the stars of the Milky Way galaxy, and that we dwell in the dimensions of the planets--including the earth, of course--between return visits to our galactic home, was very popular in ancient times and in culture throughout the world. The

THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
Annual Conference Proceedings, 1987

TABLE OF CONTENTS

KEYNOTE ADDRESS

The Spirit of Wholeness
C. ALAN ANDERSON
page 1

SYMPOSIUM I: PSYCHIC RESEARCH AND THE AFTERLIFE

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research
RY REDD
page 22

SYMPOSIUM II: PSYCHIC RESEARCH AND SCIENCE

Science and Religion Look at the Image of Guadalupe
FRAN" C. TRIBBE
page 43

Debunking the "Debunkers": Where is the Pike for CSICOPS?
CHARLES FRANKLIN ADAMS
page 53

SYMPOSIUM III: INTUITION AND THE SPIRIT

Intuitive Awareness
MARCIA ROSE EMERY
page 73

SYMPOSIUM IV: SPIRIT MANIFESTATIONS AND THE SPIRIT WORLD

An Exploration of C.G. Jung's Interpretation of
Occult/ Psychic Phenomena
ELIZABETH W. FENSKE
page 90

SYMPOSIUM V: PSI AND SPIRIT

Psychic Perception and Personal Integrity
CLAIRE G. WALKER
page 111

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

great astrologer-astronomer Porphyry taught it, as did Proclus, Cicero, and Dante, among many others. Cicero even taught that a life of justice and obligation to duty is, in his words, our "passport to the sky, to a union with those who have finished their lives on earth and who, upon being released from their bodies, inhabit...the Milky Way."¹³

Similarly, Dante, who elsewhere poetically relates images of the spirits in the Jupiter dimension, in an early poem entitled "You Who by Understanding Move the Third Heaven", ascends into the Beyond. He travels through three distinct realms and meets up with an old friend who tells him what it is like to be among the higher intelligences in the afterlife: "We circle in one orbit, at one pace, with one thirst, along with the heavenly Princes whom thou didst address from the world."¹⁴ Supporting not only Dante, but also Numenius, the Platonist already mentioned who saw the rivers of the other world as the orbits of the planets, is a work of late antiquity called the "Third Vatican Mythographer." According to this source, the circular territory surrounded by Dante's Red River in hell represented "the exact counterpart to the circle of Mars in the skies."¹⁵

As we have seen, the existence of an afterlife ultimately identified with the stars is a central belief in a wide variety of religions and cultures. Yet it is less well known that many of these faiths and philosophies identify the afterlife dimensions with the planets. Besides Plato's eight whorls around the cosmic Spindle in his myth of Er as representative of the planets geocentrically moving around the polar axis, there are Egyptian traditions in which the rivers of paradise correspond to the planets. According to one authority, "they are circles, seven in number and in them is found neither fish nor worm". The same source continues with the following summary:

In Hindu and Buddhist cosmography there is a central mountain called Mt. Meru which equates with the [polar] Axis, Tree, Ladder and Spindle. Again around this central hub there are seven concentric circles of golden mountains. For Siberian shamans the world pillar was symbolized by the centre poles of their tents; these poles were customarily marked with seven notches, representing the seven heavens. The Aztecs had nine hells or purgatories bounded by rivers. The imagery is literally universal.¹⁶

One of the best statements of the widespread planetary afterlife teaching is again found in Macrobius:

The soul, having started on its downward course from the intersection of the zodiac and the Milky Way to the successive spheres lying beneath,... acquires each of the attributes which it will exercise later [on earth]. In the sphere of Saturn it obtains reason and understanding,...in Jupiter's sphere, the power to act,...in Mars'

THE SPIRIT OF WHOLENESS

C. Alan Anderson

The basic pattern of reality is the creation and appreciation of wholes, which include and contribute to other wholes, all within an evolving all-inclusive whole. The finest inclinations of the human spirit, and probably of all entities, are in the direction of wholeness. Among aspects of wholeness considered are creativity; forms of knowing; production of physical and spiritual health; and ideal societal structures.

INTRODUCTION. It is an honor to be the keynote speaker at this meeting of The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research. This position gives me an opportunity to express my great pleasure in anticipating the presentations which will follow, and to offer a framework within which I, at least, find it meaningful to consider those papers. I am approaching our theme of "Psychical Research and Spirit" in terms of "The Spirit of Wholeness." Before elaborating on my topic I shall survey all too briefly the other papers, for which I shall provide a background, some questions, and some elements of responses to a few of them.

In this meeting one need only look at the titles and summaries of presentations which will be given in order to appreciate in some degree these admirable contributions to expanding our understanding of the nature of reality. Let us consider these papers in the order in which they will be given. Undoubtedly, they will be far richer than their abstracts and my even briefer looks at the abstracts can indicate. But we shall see here something of the types of contributions which they make to the theme of the meeting.

PREVIEWS OF THE PAPERS. (1) In "Haunted Houses: The Dark Side of Survival" Karlis Osis will direct our attention to what may be the appropriate balance to the "happily ever after" view of life after death. Although I suppose that he will be emphasizing the unhappy experiences of some disincarnate beings, it may be that here we shall have some suggestion of the dipolar nature of reality and the problem of evil. (2) In "Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research" Ry Redd relates starwalking traditions from widely varied traditions to psychical research in relation to out-of-body- and near-death experiences. Here there should be opportunities to explore what might be termed the "geography" of spirit and opportunities for experience in relation to spirit. (3) In "Science and Religion Look at the Image of Guadalupe" Frank C. Tribbe considers a puzzling instance in which the nonphysical seems to have come into expression in the physical, more obviously than in the case of haunted houses, and of course in the opposite direction from that in which conventionally living people seemingly have glimpses of the afterlife, as in the immediately preceding presentation. This should provide occasions for considering the

sphere, a bold spirit,...in the sun's sphere, sense-perception and imagination,...in Mercury's sphere, the ability to speak and interpret,...and in the lunar sphere, the function of molding and increasing bodies.¹⁷

Now, afterlife traditions in Hinduism, Platonism, gnosticism, and Jewish mysticism, as well as some native American myths, all agree that each of these realms of disembodied awareness is divided into higher and lower sections. The lower level of a given planetary dimension is a kind of purgatory to which a soul may be drawn--if it feels the need to do so--where it purges itself of the negative trait linked with that planet.

For example, the translator of a gnostic scroll considered sacred by the Mandeans, who survived as a priestly Essene-type sect from Persian antiquity into twentieth century Iran-Iraq, summarizes the afterlife experience of these planetary purgatories, called matarata. "The idea that the soul must pass through seven planetary spheres after death, shedding in its progress impure and earthly qualities connected...with the seven planets, is familiar to the reader of Gnostic literature....The planets Saturn, Jupiter, Mars, Mercury, Venus, Moon, and Sun have their matarata."¹⁸

Similarly, we find the process of the soul's shedding these archetypal traits after death described by the great Hermes, in the famous gnostic text attributed to him called the Poimandres, meaning "Shepherd of Men":

To the first zone [Moon] he surrendered the power to grow and increase, and to the second [Mercury] the machinations of evil cunning, now rendered powerless, and to the third [Venus] the deceit of concupiscence [lust], now rendered powerless and to the fourth [the Sun] the arrogance of domination, drained of its ambition, and to the fifth [Mars] the impious audacity and the rashness of impulsive deed, and to the sixth [Jupiter] the evil appetites of wealth, now rendered powerless, and to the seventh zone [Saturn] the lying that ensnares.¹⁹

Having become purified of the selfish, earthbound side of these afterlife archetypes and having perfected their higher virtues, the soul is thereby free of the planet's hold. The disembodied consciousness can then go on to oneness with God in the eighth sphere, that of such fixed stars as Antares, Arcturus and Polaris, the Pole star, and other stars of our galaxy, or even beyond to other galaxies. In a state of ecstasy while still alive, Hermes, rejoicing with others among the stars, "hears also certain powers above the eighth sphere exalting God with a sweet voice. And in procession they rise up towards the Father and give themselves up to the powers, and having become Powers

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

relationship of spirit and matter, and especially the question of whether they are one reality or two. (4) In "Debunking the 'Debunkers': Where is the Pike for CSICOPS?" Charles Franklin Adams deals with basic epistemological questions of the nature of truth and the appropriate methodologies for attaining it. (5) This area of concern is continued in Marcia Rose Emery's "Intuitive Awareness," in which she upholds the importance of intuition as well as intellect. In connection with these two papers we should confront the problem of how many ways, if any, there may be to attain reliable knowledge. (6) Elizabeth W. Fenske turns to the work of Jung in exploring the natures of spirit, matter, spirits, and synchronicity. Perhaps the central problem here will be with regard to the nature of causation. (7) Maxim Kramer concentrates on awareness and varied accomplishments found in shamanism in "Altered States of Consciousness and Psychic Phenomena: Exploring the Shamanic Experience." At this point we shall find ourselves in the midst of the problem of the practical application of whatever we find to be the nature of spirit. (8) In "Psychic Perception and Personal Integrity" Claire Walker distinguishes the psychic from the spiritual, and surveys their places in achieving the future. Here, as with the Tribbe paper, part of our concern will be with the question of whether the spiritual and another level of activity, in this case the psychic, are in essence one, although clearly they should be distinguished in terms of dealing practically with them; no doubt, the dual usage of "spirit" for the underlying nature of all reality and for a high level of reality will arise. (9) Finally, in "Is there a Relationship between God and Psi?" Robert Winterhalter finds psi to be an integral part of creation, requiring discernment for its wise use. At this concluding point we shall have the opportunity to bring together much that we have considered in relation to the visions of theology, philosophy, and science.

Since the papers may turn out to be significantly different from what I anticipate, and other questions may arise with urgency sufficient to overshadow those which I have raised, it seems only appropriate that I should provide for a few of my own questions by essaying to answer them here and now in the pristine air of speculation unsullied by the situations arising during the next two days, which may be significantly different from what I anticipate. There is nothing like being able to respond to what I think that people ought to say, or will say, without the inconvenience of having to be so unimaginative as to respond to what they did say. Obviously, I shall not be able to do full justice to the wide range of topics dealt with in this meeting. However, I shall deal with some major matters and trust that they and others will be dealt with more adequately in the next two days. If in raising questions and possible answers I perform only the function of a Socratic gadfly, I shall be satisfied.

Before turning to certain topics suggested by the presentations to be given at this meeting, it may be helpful

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

themselves, enter the Godhead. This is the good end of those who have attained gnosis: to know God."

A number of traditions in the great world religions similarly relate ecstatic transpersonal experiences of the beyond while still alive (rather than following the transition known as death). These include experiences of such spiritual giants as Buddha, Muhammad and Paul. In his letter to Christians in the Greek city of Corinth, apparently pointing to his own personal experience of ascension into the seven heavens, Saint Paul wrote, "I know a man in Christ who...was caught up to the third heaven--whether in the body or out of the body, I do not know." In addition, one scholar, in his Journeys to the Other World, notes that the Buddha pronounced, after taking "seven steps" to the north "in a single direction...I am at the top of the world." Likewise, the same study records of Islam's founder that "In the course of his ascension, Muhammad passed through seven heavens."²⁰

Yet one more thought system offers us a close overall parallel with these teachings. This is Jewish mysticism's oral tradition, called kaballah in Hebrew, with its reports of rabbis who personally experienced these spirit worlds. These consciousness dimensions are called hekaloth in Hebrew, which literally means "palaces" or "mansions." Specifically, this is called Merkabah Mysticism, merkabah meaning the divine Throne experienced as a chariot and depicted in the throne visions of the prophet Ezekiel and the revelations of Saint John. Hebrew prayer-mantras have long been used by these mystical rabbis to reach ecstatic states wherein the soul can ascend to the different dimensions, heavens, halls, mansions and palaces of the spiritual world.

Likewise, Brahmin priests of the Hindu faith for many centuries have carried on oral traditions from generation to generation based on an elaborate system of afterlife habitations called lokas in Sanskrit. The Brahmins say that earnestly repeating the appropriate Sanskrit mantra vibrantly involves the angelic ruler of its corresponding planetary dimension, or loka. One can tune into these planetary deities for help and guidance by using these mantras, which are prefaced with the name of God in Hinduism ("OM", the ultimate Hindu attunement syllable).

Now, reminiscent of Hermes' self-purging ascent, one rabbinic mystic described the stages of his ecstatic ascent through five of these mansions or palaces as specific degrees or stages of moral perfection. This rabbi reports that when he ascended to the first palace he was devout, in the second, pure, in the third he was sincere, in the fourth he "was wholly with God" and in the fifth he "displayed holiness before God."²¹

Moreover, the seven heavens are intimately linked with what the Jewish mystical tradition calls sephiroth, meaning "spheres" or "regions". Sephirah--the singular form--was

The Spirit of Wholeness

to look at some definitions of "psychical research" and "spirit."

PSYCHICAL RESEARCH. The glossary by Laura A. Dale and Rhea A. White in Benjamin B. Wolman (ed.), Handbook of Parapsychology¹ defines "psychical research" as "the systematic study and investigation of phenomena which cannot be described or explained in terms of established physical principles; the older term for parapsychology," and defines "parapsychology" as "the branch of psychology which deals with behavior which cannot now be explained or described in terms of known physical principles; modern term for psychical research." This glossary does not define "spirit."

In the 1902 Dictionary of Philosophy and Psychology Mrs. E. M. Sidgwick, characterizing psychical research in terms of the purposes of the Society for Psychical Research, said:

the object of the society was, and is, to make an organized and systematic attempt to investigate various sorts of debatable phenomena which are prima facie inexplicable on any generally recognized hypothesis, and which may be regarded as having some bearing on the question of the independent existence and activity of mind apart from body. (II, 378)

Whether we speak in terms of "any generally recognized hypothesis" or, more specifically, of "established physical principles," the standards are relative to the state of civilization at any time in question. Although both physics and philosophy have changed considerably in the past century, it seems safe to say that most people in and out of science in the 1880's and the 1980's would take these recognized hypotheses and physical principles to be based on the operation of essentially nonliving units of matter, or, now, energy-matter. In other words, throughout the past century there have been excluded from acceptable explanations all positions incorporating ultimate life, intelligence, or purpose. As we shall see from most definitions of spirit, this means the exclusion of spirit as a basic category of explanation. To the extent that psychical research is considered a science in the usual sense, it is free only to explain away spirit. Insofar as psychical research may turn to spirit as an explanation or describe it as a basic reality, psychical research becomes philosophy or religion, at least until generally accepted science adopts markedly different outlooks, perhaps along the lines of those put forth by such minority-view scientists as David Bohm and Rupert Sheldrake. Seemingly, the lesson here is that it is better to consider psychical research to be an undertaking which includes both science, to establish facts as far as scientific method can do so, and philosophy and religion, to understand and explain the facts in the broadest, deepest perspectives. This, of course, would make inappropriate the understanding of psychical research or

first used in The Book of Creation, the oldest surviving text in the Hebrew language. There, "sephiroth" meant numbers, and in this numerological mysticism the sephiroth, of which there are ten, represented archetypal stages or dimensions through which God created all that exists. They are stages or spheres of divine manifestation through which the One God emerges as qualities for us to perfect, in order to become again companions with Him. Note here early Greek lore concerning ten planetary rivers of heaven, an interesting parallel to the ten sephiroth.

The sephiroth are manifested in the different heavens and are available there for us to experience, either between lives or in very special soul ascensions in this life. For instance, the fifth heaven corresponds to the planet Venus and is called Ahabah in Hebrew, meaning "love." This heaven is a manifestation of the sefirah "beauty", which is known also as the love and compassion of God. Souls, spirits, and angels in this dimension experience a kaleidoscope of light and sound vibrations. Centered around Abraham, the presiding patriarch, millions of souls exist as subtle, differently toned and colored waves, all vibrating in one great harmonious, unified adoration of God.²²

The fourth heaven is a manifestation of the sefirah known as divine victory. According to the rabbinic mystics, it is the archetype of positive cosmic power and divine endurance. Corresponding to Mars, it is simply called Zebul, meaning "dwelling" or "habitation." Souls in this dimension of the afterlife are centered around the second patriarch, Isaac, and include those who, in the life just ended, fought for the Messiah's cause or who experienced martyrdom. There is also the first heaven, a manifestation of the sefirah or archetype called "kingdom." One of its two primary aspects is said to be "purely receptive" and hence is called "Lebanah," the Hebrew word for the Moon. Incidentally, the Moon's proximity to the earth makes logical the rabbis' linkage of it with the first heaven.

STEINER AND CAYCE

While Emanuel Swedenborg spoke of his soul travels into higher worlds under the guidance of spiritual guides and masters on the astral and spiritual planes, the cosmology of spiritual evolution through direct, repeated afterlife experiences of the planetary system and the stars in modern times was first openly taught in the early years of this century by Rudolf Steiner. This clairvoyant philosopher and Renaissance man clearly echoed these ancient teachings, which were kept alive by the rabbinic mystics and the Brahmins of India:

[After death] We go through the Moon, Mercury, Venus and Sun spheres. In each sphere we meet... what corresponds to the inner forces that we bring with us. Our emotions, urges, passions, sensual love, unite us to the Moon sphere. In the Mercury

parapsychology as exclusively a "branch of psychology." As usual, truth is squeezed into our containers at our peril.

SPIRIT. As The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible (IV, 432-33) notes, the Hebrew and Greek roots of "spirit" mean

"a movement of air," "breeze," or "wind," and so "breath." By extension it became the life principle. The original idea apparently survives in Gen. 1:2b: "The Spirit of God was moving over the face of the waters."...Something of the nature of wind survived in the concept of spirit as it was developed by biblical writers. Jesus says to Nicodemus in John 3:8: "The wind blows where it wills, and you hear the sound of it, but you do not know whence it comes or whither it goes; so it is with every one who is born of the Spirit." The saying involves a wordplay, for pneuma means both "wind" and "spirit."...When we say that God is spirit, a spirit, or spiritual, we usually mean, to say the least, that God has no physical body, that he is immaterial; and we say that he is pure spirit. In this sense, "spirit" indicates [nonmaterial] substance, the nature of God's being.

The Oxford English Dictionary has four pages of definitions of "spirit." It scarcely would be helpful to list all of them here. The relevant essential emphasis is on animating, vital, creative, rational, inspiring, incorporeal reality, in contrast to matter conceived as insentient. A secondary meaning, which I have combined with the primary one in the title of this paper, is the OED's eighth definition: "A particular character, disposition, or temper existing in, pervading, or animating, a person or set of persons; a special attitude or bend of mind characterizing men individually or collectively." So my title, "The Spirit of Wholeness," relates both to an impetus toward wholeness which animates people and perhaps the whole of reality, as well as the spirit which is ultimate and the nature of which is the essence of what we should mean by wholeness.

Another approach to defining spirit emphasizes its link to the personal, which one could well say is what lies behind the other definitions. Daniel Day Williams maintains:

Spirit is the best word we have to indicate the concrete personal expression of living creative beings. God is spirit. Man, created in God's image, has spiritual existence, not as something added to his bodily substance, but as the expression of that concrete body-mind unity which he is as a person. The freedom of spirit is the freedom of God as the ultimate form-giving reality. The freedom of man is also the freedom of spirit, but within the conditions of finite existence.²

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

sphere we meet everything that is due to our moral imperfections; in the Venus sphere, all our religious shortcomings; in the Sun sphere, everything severs us from the purely human.²³

According to Steiner, after going through the gate of death, we expand outwardly, so that initially we occupy the space bounded by the Moon's orbit around the earth, then we go out to the orbits of Mercury, Venus, and so on. Finally, after Jupiter, we expand first into, and later beyond, a sphere circumscribed by Saturn's orbit around the Sun. We then return, after building up what we need for our next embodiment, become smaller and smaller until we again are re-united with the earth. (One is reminded here of Macrobius, who similarly saw the soul's descent as a transformative shrinkage from a sphere to the tip of a cone.)

Also interesting is Steiner's notion that in the Mercury sphere between lifetimes a soul lives among higher Intelligences, with sympathy for a particular soul family on earth which it is later to incarnate into according to its present needs for development. Says Steiner, "A human soul may be descending when Mercury is on the other side of the earth and the soul may disregard those [higher] Beings' influence and then have no great connection with his family. Or it may choose to come to earth when that "ray" that goes from Mercury to that family is best and he can have very close ties with the members of his family."²⁴

Here we are seeing an image of a soul's flight path from Mercury--described as a "ray", directly linked with communication challenges and blessings involving one's soul family. If the soul flight before rebirth is opposite the earth, thereby forming a 180-degree angle, then there will be communication problems with the family. On the other hand, close ties with member's of one's extended family are likely when the soul chooses to be reborn when the Mercury "ray" or soul flight angle is best.

Traditions in contemporary Hinduism go into considerable detail about the connection between planetary angles at birth and the planetary dimensions--called lokas--experienced by a given soul in the afterlife. Careful application of this Hindu tradition to over one hundred reincarnation-afterlife cases in Edgar Cayce's files produced striking results and is reported in my book, Toward a New Astrology: The Approach of Edgar Cayce. We shall shortly see that this Hindu-Steiner-Cayce concept of reincarnation and the planetary heavens is at the very heart of our afterlife-reincarnation hypothesis.²⁵

In Steiner's scheme, then, our experience of the afterlife begins, of course, by going through the gateway of death on the earth. Later, after journeying past the Saturn realm, at Cosmic Midnight the soul makes its return following the same planetary steps (the steps of what the great theologian Origen called Jacob's Ladder) but in reverse.

The Spirit of Wholeness

With regard to the appropriateness of identifying spirit and person, some emphasize the origin of "person" in "persona," a mask used by an actor, thus suggesting that a person is merely an entity that transmits something from a more basic reality. This generally assumes "person" to be limited to "human being." The recently popular term "transpersonal" seems to be consistent with this outlook, suggesting something more basic beyond the personal realm of existence. On the other hand, the personalistic outlook rejects the view of person as mere mask and builds on the definition of person offered by Boethius (475-525): "individual substance of a rational nature." A person is not only rational, but, as put by Borden Parker Bowne (1847-1910), the founder of American personalism, "the essential meaning of personality is selfhood, self-consciousness, self-control, and the power to know."³ Personality is by no means limited to human beings (and possibly some other animals), for

complete and perfect personality can be found only in the Infinite and Absolute Being, as only in Him can we find that complete and perfect selfhood and self-possession which are necessary to the fullness of personality. In thinking, then, of the Supreme Person we must beware of transferring to him the limitations and accidents of our human personality, which are no necessary part of the notion of personality, and think only of the fullness of power, knowledge, and selfhood which alone are the essential factors of the conception.⁴

Later personalists have added emphasis on valuing and pursuing chosen aims as characteristic of personality, both human and divine.

There is every reason to identify the ultimate person with the ultimate loving spirit. Probably the biblical assertions that God is spirit, (John 4:24) and that God is love (I John 4:8) are equivalent. Williams defines love as "spirit taking form in history. Love is an expression of spirit."⁵ Love seems indissolubly linked with spirit. Spirit, no less than anything else--if there is anything else--is known by what it does, and what it does is love, in many ways. Evelyn Underhill says of spirit:

Variously manifested in partial achievements of order and goodness, in diversities of beauty, and in our graded apprehensions of truth, this Spirit is yet most fully known to us in the transcendent values of holiness and love. The more deeply it is loved by man, the nearer he draws to its heart; and the greater his love, the more fully does he experience its transforming and energizing power. The words of Plotinus [c. 205-270] are still true for every one of us, and are unaffected by the presence or absence of creed:

While Steiner was the most prominent European, next to Swedenborg, to integrate these afterlife traditions through a Judeo-Christian world-view, the increasingly popular American seer Edgar Cayce also taught in his out-of-body state that between lifetimes we experience the planetary heavens and stars. In fact, Cayce said that he had, after a lifetime in Egypt during the time of Hermes, experienced what he considered to be the ultimate Gateway and Spirit-Star of our Milky Way galaxy, namely Arcturus.

Cayce and Steiner both clairvoyantly saw the solar system as comprising different dimensions of consciousness developments linked with orbits of the planet. These planetary dimensions can be understood as unique lenses for focusing and ultimately perfecting distinct yet relatively pure states of awareness. For instance, Cayce says the purpose of the soul's sojourn in Mercury is essentially to develop the reason-communication faculty, in Venus to develop the love-beauty awareness and in Mars to experience the anger-courage energy. In the afterlife dimension ascribed to Jupiter, the soul's purpose is to develop an ennobling, universal consciousness and in Saturn to undergo a profound remolding or cleansing of our karmic state.

Steiner and Cayce agree, then, that the planetary dimensions of the afterlife are non-material and transpersonal. Steiner especially sees these dimensions as essentially consisting of forms of thought or archetypes which embrace all human creativity, originality and genius. Of course, this was precisely Plato's idea of what Reality is and how It works. Steiner's usage of archetypes is virtually identical to the great Greek thinker's philosophy of eternal Forms, or Ideas, of which all other things are only copies.

Of course, Steiner goes into considerably more detail on the role of these archetypal forms in the regions of the afterlife, for instance, saying at one point that a soul goes on to a dimension it has earned, that is, after having lived an earth life giving that soul a direct relationship to the archetypes of that dimension. Cayce's view of the interconnection between our earth lives and experiences in a given planetary dimension--toward which we build our thoughts when alive--is very close at this point to Steiner. The idea is commonplace in Hinduism and afterlife manuals like the Tibetan Book of the Dead.

We have seen that Steiner's idea of a "ray" or angle between a planet and the earth at the time of rebirth redirects that soul's afterlife experience in that planetary dimension to make that experience present in the new life. Cayce clairvoyantly taught this as well, at one point saying that a particular woman's life challenges were due to her having experienced the wrathful Mars dimension as a sort of "stopover" after a wonderful afterlife experience in the spiritual realm of Jupiter (Case #267). This choice to undo in Mars much of what she had learned in Jupiter amounted to what he called an "affliction", and, surely enough, at the

"Yonder is the true object of our love, which it is possible to grasp and to live with and truly to possess, since no envelope of flesh separates us from it. He who has seen it knows what I say, that the soul then has another life, when it comes to God, and having come possesses Him, and knows when in that state that it is in the presence of the dispenser of true life and that it needs nothing further." [Ennead I, 6.7]

So, if we would achieve anything like a real integration of life--and until we have done so, we are bound to be restless and uncertain in our touch upon experience--we are compelled to press back towards contact with this living Reality, however conceived by us. And this not by way of a retreat from our actual physical and mental life, but by way of a fulfillment of it....

Spirit is felt as an inflowing power, a veritable accession of vitality; energizing the self, or the religious group, impelling it to the fullest and most zealous living-out of its existence, giving it fresh joy and vigor, and lifting it to fresh levels of life. This sense of enhanced life is a mark of all religions of the Spirit.⁶

Similarly, a recent little book on spirituality abandons the attempt to define spirit and says:

Rather than trying to define what Spirit is, perhaps it will help to describe what Spirit feels like. For Spirit can definitely be felt.

For me Spirit is felt in two distinct ways. First, it's felt as a sense of joy, love and harmony which permeates and replaces those feelings of the mind and senses....The joyous sense of peace, the gently loving freedom and harmony with everything about is close to, if not the actual, sensing of Spirit.

Second, there's a sensing of the power of Spirit--a power so great that, at times, it stuns the body and makes it almost immobile. This feeling of Spirit's power is simply the growth and deepening of Spirit's love. It is one of the most dynamic, beautiful and absolute experiences that we've ever found, especially when the power is so great that it fills us. When this happens we don't exist as body and mind. Rather, we feel ourselves a new entity. A pure being. One connected totally to God. And in this connection with God we feel a sense of timelessness which is our participation with God's eternity.⁷

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

time of her birth, these planets were in a sharp, 90-degree angle or "ray" with respect to each other and the earth.

OUT-OF-BODY AND NEAR-DEATH EXPERIENCES

Research in the areas of remote sensing and out-of-body states, together with near-death experiences and Ian Stevenson's cases of the reincarnation type, all lend considerable support to afterlife traditions of the soul's travels through the planetary heavens. For example, experiments by Dr. Osis tended to confirm the spatial perspective element in O.O.B.E.'s which distinguishes the latter from remote sensing and travelling clairvoyance (wherein the consciousness or personality is not outside the physical body).

In addition, Dr. Osis has very successfully pioneered the cross-cultural study of deathbed apparitions in research considered as not only scientific but also as legal proof of survival. In light of the afterlife traditions we have reviewed, philosophies and cultures around the world would agree with Dr. Osis that, in his words, "Our destiny at death is probably the most important area of human experience into which we can inquire."²⁶

Now, concerning overall psychical research links with archaic afterlife traditions, it has been observed of Plato that he knew that the language of myth was in principle a generalized form of "up-to-date 'tech talk'."²⁷ In the case of the myth of Er, for instance, Plato clearly understood the near-death experience, the astronomical--literally cosmic--structure of the afterlife and the virtually universal tendency for our experiences between lives to be forgotten when taking on a new body. In support of this, E.R. Dodds feels strongly that these were "the kinds of experiences which formed the basis of Plato's own philosophy."²⁸

More specifically, in a discussion with Ian Stevenson and Charles Tart on possible post-mortem states, philosopher-parapsychologist Michael Grosso speculated that "the process of reincarnation would tend to obscure the continuity of personal identity--as a result of being immersed in a new bodily organism." In other words, as he puts it, "reincarnation necessitates this oblivion to previous personal identity. this indeed may be what is behind the Platonic myth of the reborn soul having first to be washed in the river of Lethe or Forgetfulness." Following the example of Zen masters and yogis, Grosso goes on to suggest a solution to the Lethe/amnesia predicament (whether caused by the shock of death, or, as Stevenson suggests, more true to the Lethe myth, the shock of rebirth): well-rehearsed, ritualized and relatively smooth guided transitions at death to "minimize the shock and thus allow continuing memories and conations to function efficiently in the after-death state."²⁹

The Spirit of Wholeness

These quotations show something of the quality of spirit or God which makes it difficult to deal with in philosophical terms and perhaps impossible to deal with in the quantitative approaches of science. Here the role of psychical research in relation to spirit is particularly problematic. However, it can be helpful to show, as Winterhalter does, that psychic phenomena are part of the broad area of activity which must be attributable to spirit. However, we always must be careful not to confuse the central area of activity with the peripheral phenomena which may be associated with it. Of course, if all is spirit, even science deals with its "external" aspects, while failing to realize that it is working with spirit and missing the essential value-orientation of spirit.

I have been ignoring the subject of the Holy Spirit, as one person of the Trinity, inasmuch as this--if it should be believed in--is simply one aspect of spirit considered as the underlying nature of everything. It seems to me that this use of "spirit" is much like its use in referring to a disembodied being, human or other. Certainly the question of the existence of such beings is of great interest to psychical research, as is the question of whether we now do or later will have spiritual bodies. However, from the standpoint of philosophy these questions are decidedly less important than the question of whether spirit is the nature of everything. However, I do not mean to suggest that the answering of this great problem of metaphysics will answer questions of what forms spirit may take. I am aware that viewing spirit or God as the essential nature of everything is offensive to traditional Western religionists, who are essentially dualistic in outlook; this is part of the problem of fragmentariness.

Despite the significance of spirit or God, there seems to be an increasing amount of questioning whether we are speaking of the ultimate in dealing with this reality, assuming it to be reality and assuming personality to be essential to it. Certain Oriental views, esoteric traditions, and so-called negative theology, which denies that we are justified in making any assertions as to what God is, as distinguished from what God is not, long have been with us, but they have assumed greater importance as New Age outlooks have mushroomed in the West. Perhaps the problem is partly a matter of definition, since "spirit" and "God" are used both for the all-inclusive reality and for an "upper" portion of the whole.

The Dictionary of all Scriptures and Myths entry on "Spirit" indicates our problem:

A symbol of the positive, energetic, forceful, qualitative and formative aspect of the Divine outpouring, in distinction from the passive, receptive, quantitative, form-taking aspect--matter. Spirit is the life-side which imparts qualities and motion. Matter is the form-side which receives qualities and motion. Spirit

Also, the universal experience of dreaming, as well as the much more rare Near-Death-Experience, or N.D.E., itself a form of the O.O.B.E., offer numerous parallels with after-life traditions. For instance, the Bardo Thodol, or Tibetan Book of the Dead was compiled over many centuries as records of yogis who had died and returned, in their next life, to tell of the state of existence between death and rebirth (i.e., the Bardo state).

One psychic researcher into death and consciousness after death has noted the parallels between the Bardo Thodol and N.E.D. and O.O.B.E. accounts. He points out that a unified picture emerges of the language of the next world as consisting of a system of visual images that are conveyed telepathically and in a dreamlike manner from mind to mind. Dreams, then, especially those involving lucid or controlled dreaming and telepathic group problem-solving through dreams, may provide a potentially resourceful arena for major breakthroughs in afterlife research.³⁰

One of the most interesting close parallels between afterlife traditions in sacred literature and near death experiences concerns the great psychoanalyst-philosopher Carl Jung, who relates a particular experience common to out-of-body experiences and N.E.D.'s, mainly going through a hole, tunnel, or opening of some kind. After lapsing into unconsciousness and very near death, Jung found himself a thousand miles or so in space looking down on the blue earth. He said the sight of the earth from that height was the most glorious thing he had ever seen. He then turned his attention away from the planet and perceived in space "a short distance away...a tremendous dark block of stone, like a meteorite."³¹

This dark stone had a tunnel-like entrance or portal that led into its hollow interior. Jung found a black Hindu sitting silently in the lotus posture to the right of the entrance, and, as he approached the entrance, he had the feeling that everything was being sloughed away. In his works, "the whole phantasmagoria of earthly existence...fell away or was stripped from me...I had certainty that I was about to meet the people who know the answer...about what had been and what would come after." Of course, Jung's doctor calls him back to earth life, and like many N.D.E. cases since, he was "profoundly disappointed" to have to return to what he called the "box system" again. This same psi researcher noted of Jung's near-death experience certain parallels, not only with the deathbed apparitions recorded by Dr. Osiris, but also with O.O.B.E.'s reported by Ingo Swann and others: "He [Jung] perceived as though his out-of-body consciousness were a disembodied ego; he encountered intelligent presences in his out-of-the-body world; and he floated, if not to the constellation Sagittarius, at least into earth orbit."³²

Jung's experience strikingly parallels the Book of Enoch, whose author, the prophet Enoch, travels through the seven heavens and celestial portals or cosmic tunnels of the

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

manifests in matter as the life molding the successive forms, more or less evanescent. Spirit uses matter as a sheath which lies outside and below it. Hence the intense vibrations of Spirit gradually dissipate it and bring the forms to nought. In their origin spirit and matter are eternal [timeless?, everlasting?, divine?; which meaning of "eternal is not specified]; duality proceeds from Unity which is neither spirit nor matter, and is the Ultimate Reality.

This definition seems to be pervaded by a spirit of dualism, which is characteristic of the fragmentation to which I shall be referring almost immediately. Presumably "Unity," which the work does not define, is essentially what I have been referring to as spirit. One may well wonder whether the outlook reflected in the definition envisions a unity worthy of the name; it seems, rather, to be something which stands apart from the world, instead of encompassing or expressing as the world in any significantly unitive way. It does not help much in gaining understanding of the ultimate reality simply to say that it is neither spirit nor matter. A basic division is between those who believe the ultimate to be timeless, standoffish, and changeless⁸ and those who maintain that a coherent understanding of reality requires that it be temporal, both immanent and transcendent, and developing. More on this will be said near the end of this paper.

Especially in relation to the theme of this meeting, it is important to know whether the spirit which psychical research may be dealing with is (1) ultimate reality, (2) the quasi-material, vibrating, matter-sheathed something suggested by the last definition, (3) some more clearly individualized entity or entities or (4) something else. In connection with this we should keep in mind, as the last-quoted dictionary and numerous other sources make clear, that many maintain that human beings have at least four levels of existence or bodies: physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual, called by various names in various traditions. Numerous Western philosophers have been content to settle for no more than two: body and mind, with the tendency in the recent past being to claim that there is only body, with mind a mere epiphenomenon. However many levels there may be to human beings and the rest of existence, our major problem is to discover whether they are all to be understood as expressions of one type of reality, especially that which I am calling spirit.

Some of the forthcoming presentations, especially those of Osis and Tribbe, emphasize the at least seeming separation of different aspects of reality. Perhaps the term "fragmentation" would not be too strong to characterize this separation. It may be that spirit will provide the answer to the problem of fragmentation, but it is appropriate at this point to look at the problem of fragmentariness.

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

other world. In one episode, Enoch went through a black cave-like portal and received revelations about the planetary or solar system structure of the afterlife, this time from an angel named Uriel. The angel tells him, "Behold, I have showed thee all things, O Enoch; and all things have I revealed to thee. Thou seest the Sun and Moon, and those which conduct the stars in heaven, which cause all their operations, seasons and arrivals to return."³³ Incidentally, many traditions agree that Enoch was the same as Hermes, whose self-purging experiences in the planetary heavens were recorded in the gnostic text found in Egypt (Poimandres) which we have already described.

It is even more interesting that Jung himself notes traditions that Enoch-Hermes was the same as the Egyptian Thoth and had even been Adam in his previous life. Not only did Enoch avoid the death experience by being translated to heaven, but, in his next reincarnation, according to a number of ancient sources, he manifested mysteriously as Melchizedek, who was not physically born nor did he die. The same messiah soul, according to many sources, later reincarnated as Jesus, who, in preparation for this three-day interval between crucifixion and resurrection, underwent a three-day extended O.O.B.E. initiation in a physical preservation chamber in Egypt's precisely stellar aligned Great Pyramid, said to have been built by none other than Hermes-Enoch.³⁴

In Far-Journeys, the sequel to Journeys Out of the Body, Robert Monroe concluded that, after more than a year of closely monitored out-of-body travels by a group of individuals at his laboratory in Virginia, there was apparently no evidence of intelligent life in the vicinity of other suns and planets visited by his "Explorer team." Then, immediately after his team of astral travellers began using an affirmation or prayer earnestly requesting constructive guidance and protection from any higher or equally intelligent individuals, virtually every time one of his explorers went out of their bodies, "they encountered intelligent beings who were more or less willing to communicate--and could do so."³⁵ Many of Monroe's accounts of these communications and revelations resemble what we would expect to hear from archangels or the like who preside, like the angel Uriel did for Enoch, as messengers of a given dimension in the afterlife.

As part of the spiritual hierarchies dominating the afterlife, then, this planetary angel acts as the coordinating center of consciousness in a given sphere. That is, it represents the common harmonic or mass chord of spiritual activity in that dimension's soul population. The Hebrew, Sanskrit, or Tibetan mantras invoke--as Monroe's affirmation may have successfully invoked--the planet's presiding angel, which resonates as the dominant tone or chord of that particular spiritual dimension.

Lastly, some personal testimony concerning O.O.B.E.'s and contacts with higher souls in the afterlife. I once had

The Spirit of Wholeness

FRAGMENTATION. The world of common, everyday experience is the world of separation, fragmentation, manyness, discreteness. Yet humankind's prime efforts probably always have been directed toward attempting to overcome this apparent fragmentation. These efforts range from primitive tribal practices to this paper.

With perhaps such an exception as ancient, atomistic Epicureanism, it has been only for approximately the last century that there has been widespread acceptance of fragmentation as allegedly the ultimate fact in relation to which one must live, with any theoretical attempt to overcome that fragmentation considered the height of folly. In practice, of course, no one can live for long a life founded on fragmentation. Presumably, all will concede that by means of family life, work, and otherwise, people must find some measure of meaningful unity if they are to achieve anything approximating satisfactory living. In affirming fragmentation the diverse Twentieth-Century philosophical positions of analytic philosophy and existentialism come together. Analytic philosophy under various forms and names--perhaps its early incarnation as logical positivism still is best known--would limit philosophy to the exploration of language and would establish the boundaries of knowledge as coextensive with those of sensory perception, as far as scientific instrumentation may extend it. Existentialism denies that there is any human essence prior to whatever one makes of herself or himself, and it rejects any rational attempt to grasp the whole of things, as does analytic philosophy. It has been observed that the "position which declares that the world as a whole must forever be completely unintelligible to us" is atheism.⁹ Only in God does one find the meaning of the whole.

Primitive outlooks are pluralistic, assuming multiple spiritual entities as the rulers of the world, present and active in arbitrary ways in everyday life. While we may call this primitive, it may be the outcome of considerable speculation. The entry on "spirits" in An Encyclopedia of Religion suggests that the idea of a non-human spirit grew out of the notion of a human soul separable from the body. The development of the concept of a spirit

was probably the most fruitful of all the blundering adventures in the interpretation of the world achieved by primitive man. It split the universe in two, making possible the dualisms of spiritual-material, soul-body, this world-other world. It transformed the real gods of nature of early religions into spiritual beings and released them for limitless growth in the unseen realm.

Gods may be spirits and spirits may grow into gods but usually their powers rank them below the gods and above mankind.

The greatest revolution of Western thought, which took place around 600 B.C., was the rejection of mythological

the opportunity of being associated with Robert Monroe, at the time when the noted maverick Out-of-Body pioneer was beginning his laboratory research and was first training others to go into the O.O.B.E. state. I had more than one group-corroborated experience out of my body with Monroe and many veridical experiences of moving outside my physical body and of seeing objects or entities from distinct spatial perspectives.

In addition, I have also had powerful, life-changing and absolutely real experiences of the afterlife in which I was blessed with immense love radiation through the appearance in a vision of the departed Sikh spiritual master, Kirpal Singh, founder and president of the Fellowship of World Religions. An Anglican priest with a thorough background in the parapsychology of religion, writing on ancient religion and future science, noted that Kirpal Singh "taught a form of initiation which, he said, leads to soul travel into higher worlds or realms as a primary means of spiritual enlightenment. He said that an awareness of the immortality and true home of the soul is a by-product of such experiences."³⁶

Indeed, Kirpal explained to me in a subsequent vision that the reasons for his love-manifestation to me some twelve years after he quit his body, was for me to have personal proof of survival and thereby know the true nature of death and of the illusory nature of the body. However, most important in my "initiation" by Kirpal was his emphasis on the simple, utter necessity for love to be the basis for all experience.

AN AFTERLIFE-REBIRTH HYPOTHESIS

One of the most interesting areas of Dr. Ian Stevenson's cross cultural reincarnation research involves cases of birthmarks in children which were strikingly similar to bodily conditions in their recollected prior lifetime. Dr. Stevenson suggests that "the imprint of wounds on the previous personality must be carried between lives on some kind of an extended body which in turn acts as a template for the production on the physical body...of birthmarks or deformities that correspond to the wounds on the body of the previous personality."³⁷

While psychic research dealing with our destiny in the afterlife may appear to some to be at dead ends, this suggestion by the leading scientific authority on reincarnation proves that there indeed are unconventional yet promising approaches toward a better understanding of the environment of the afterlife. In fact, a hypothesis can be outlined which focuses specifically on the afterlife substrate or medium upon which Stevenson's proposed template imprintation occurs, whereby birthmarks and deformities, as well as more fortunate conditions, are carried over from one lifetime to another.

explanations in favor of literal, philosophical-scientific (then far from separated disciplines) views of where everything comes from and how it works. We paid a great price in moving from emotionally-satisfying portrayals of reality with a sense of wholeness to often less rich rational sketches of whatever is. One could well say that our present task is to regain the sense of wholeness, as far as it is possible, by means of pressing farther the rational means which it has been impossible to dispense with for the past nearly 2,600 years--not that people did not display rationality before the time when the particularly rational undertaking which is philosophy had its start.

THE PHILOSOPHICAL QUEST FOR WHOLENESS. At the beginning of the philosophical quest, Thales and/or his immediate successors (for we know very little of Thales) sought the origin of everything in material realities. Thales (624-546) reputedly believed the ultimate reality to be water. Anaximenes (585-528) maintained that it was air, and found in the process of compression or felting (condensation and rarefaction) the first explanation of qualitative differences based on quantitative differences. Anaximander (610-546) proposed the boundless or the infinite as the source of everything. Despite the materialistic nature of these early speculations, there were notions of divinity and morality mixed into these views. These thinkers were hylozoists, holding that matter is living. Although this early philosophizing may have been about as fragmentary as the records of it that we possess, it appears to have some insights worthy of our reconsideration.

Thus Western philosophy began with the problem of substance, of what independently stands under everything that we behold. The initial assumption was that there was only one substance, or one original reality, and, at least in the views of most, that it was material in nature, even if matter was not understood as it would be later. However, there soon arose the problem of change, of how one thing could turn into something else. Heraclitus (544-484) took change as basic, asserting "Everything flows and nothing abides; everything gives way and nothing stays fixed. You cannot step twice into the same river, for other waters and yet others go ever flowing on."¹⁰ Yet there is a reason-ordered regularity in the fluid world of Heraclitus. There is a divine balance of the upward and downward ways, symbolized by fire, which leaps up and dies down. In opposition to this view, the Eleatic school of thought of Parmenides (540-470), Zeno (c. 490-430), and others dismissed "all change as necessarily unreal and illusory, holding it to be rationally inconceivable that what was not should begin to be or that what was should cease to be. What truly is...must be what it is independently of time; hence only Being can exist and all becoming is illusory."¹¹ Only that which can be thought can be. What is fills all space, so there is no void in which change might occur. Thus the lines of opposition were drawn, and the battle continues to simmer, if not to rage, between those who say that becoming

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

One of the most lucid theories bearing on Stevenson's hypothesis is William Roll's psi-structure theory of survival. Based on an interaction of interpersonal fields, "The psi structure theory accepts the postulate that minds need not be separate...it does not assume a sharp distinction between person and environment."³⁸ Esp and memory, then, including long-term memories carried over between lifetimes, would be part of a process occurring within a structure of which the individual soul is a part.

Roll alludes to Karl Pribram's holographic model of memory and David Bohm's similar theory that a whole, inner or implicate, higher dimensional order is the basis for the explicate or outer world. Of course, an excellent analogy of implicate order and wholeness is the hologram, the result of a photographic process which I once had the opportunity to research in depth in advanced laser laboratories shortly after it was invented. The hologram is utterly unique in that each part contains information about and indeed provides a full picture of an object, from the perspective or vantage point of that particular part.³⁹

Roll further notes that psychometry, the ability to obtain information about someone from an object belonging to that person, may be an example of previous events leaving an implicate trace or imprint in material objects. Sensitives are then able to unfold an image from the past from such objects. In Roll's words, "As a survival hypothesis, the psi structure theory argues that memories, dispositions, and other aspects of human personality remain in implicate form in the environment of the organism after it has died."⁴⁰ Yet the question remains, How could aspects of one's personality or physical body, such as birthmarks, continue on in an afterlife linked with the planets and stars?

One innovative researcher may have part of the answer. He has recently found significant statistical connections between large-scale group meditations on one hand, and on the other, reduced geomagnetic activity and reduced numbers of sunspots.⁴¹ Now, the solar wind, an ocean like field of radiated plasma made up of highly charged particles or ions, is the medium through which the earth and other planets move in their orbits around the sun. Decreases in solar activity--measured through sunspots, for instance--reduce the flow of the solar wind. A reduced solar wind in turn reduces the density of the upper atmosphere, called the "ionosphere".

This geocosmic researcher, a psychologist with a background in physics, concluded that "The ordinary constructs of physics do not seem capable of accounting for the possibility that humans can effect the Sun." Rupert Sheldrake's morphogenetic fields, postulated as existing around all living and nonliving things, are assumed to store and carry information. "Perhaps," he suggests, "it could serve to link humans with the Sun, since presumably the Sun, too, has a morphogenetic field."⁴²

The Spirit of Wholeness

is ultimate and those who maintain that changeless being occupies that position.

Xenophanes (c. 570-475), who sometimes is considered one of the Eleatics, was a religious reformer; he has been called "the first known critical theologian in ancient Greece."¹² He criticized anthropomorphism, observing that "if oxen or lions had hands which enabled them to draw and paint pictures as men do, they would portray their gods as having bodies like their own: horses would portray them as horses, and oxen as oxen. Aethiopians have gods with snub noses and black hair, Thracians have gods with gray eyes and red hair."¹³ Xenophanes believed that "God is one, supreme among gods and men, not at all like mortals in body or in mind. It is the whole that sees, the whole that thinks, the whole that hears. Without effort he sets everything in motion by the thought of his mind. He always abides in the selfsame place, not moving at all; it is not appropriate to his nature to be in different places at different times."¹⁴ Heraclitus made some similar observations, criticizing popular views of deity.

Mediating between the advocates of being and becoming were some pluralistic outlooks. Empedocles (495-435) said that there are four "roots" or elements, which are combined by love and strife. Anaxagoras (499-428) held that all things are composed of "seeds," which are mixtures of various qualities, and are moved by mind. Finally, the purely materialistic atomism of Leucippus (5th century) and Democritus (460-370) provided a mechanical, essentially accidental, explanation of everything as the coming together of atoms falling in the void. The references to love and strife and to mind, which Anaxagoras called "unlimited, autonomous, and unmixed with anything"¹⁵ might well lead one to think that here were spiritual philosophers, but generally it is agreed that these philosophers still conceived of those entities as essentially material. Anaxagoras

came close to the notion of an incorporeal being, of an intelligence without body or parts, but he did not go all the way. Mind, for him, still has extension in space and can be spoken about in quantitative terms...And although Mind "knows" and "arranges" everything, it does not act with any purpose in view. It is not as if Mind wished to arrange everything "for the best," say, nor did Anaxagoras refer to it as caring about values or as having holy attributes."¹⁶

We see that even before Socrates and Plato, Greek philosophy gives us alternative views of the one and the many, of static and dynamic worldviews, of materialistic, mechanical explanations, and of groping toward a fully spiritual outlook. It may be, especially in our attempts to relate psychical research to the world or worlds of spirit and matter, we are not far beyond the Presocratics. Charles Hartshorne has written of them as follows:

A considerable amount of research has also been done over several decades in the field of astro-meteorology which provides a possible mechanism for Stevenson's hypothetical afterlife template production process. This same data can also be considered as indirectly supportive of the identification in many traditions of the planetary dimensions within levels of the afterlife.

Beginning in the 1940's, a research program was conducted at RCA to correlate planetary angles at a given time with the weather, the quality of radio signals and magnetic storms in the earth's upper atmosphere. One severe storm in 1940 resulted in the most complete communications blackout ever recorded. Seven out of nine plants participated in what came to be known as a multiple configuration, in which the planets were either opposite each other (the 180-degree angle) or in a hard, ninety-degree angle with other planets. The configuration's predictable effects ranged from creating mild magnetic storms which tuned out certain frequencies--thereby limiting the range as well as quality of communications--to a total blackout of all radio communications.

Recall here that in Hindu philosophy the "akasha" is the earth's etheric envelope identifiable with what we would call its upper atmosphere, or ionosphere. A few days after death--three or so days by most accounts, such as the Tibetan Book of the Dead--the disembodied individual, upon departing for the afterlife dimensions of awareness, leaves an imprint of thoughts and deeds done while in the body. Hypothetically, then, the challenging type of multiple planetary configuration may disturb the akashic afterlife level of communication just as it disturbs radio communications.

In connection with this hypothesis, note the observation of one British psychical researcher about theosophical traditions to the effect that, "In the First heaven man lives through his true credit side, and in purgation his debit side...they are opposite sides of the same coin." He adds that in most cases the two poles, positive and negative, intermingle, with "the pilgrim choosing to move from one to another in turn."⁴³

With this in mind, let us say a soul is returning to the earth from afterlife visitations in dimensions linked with planets participating in such a configuration. Depending upon the intensity of the magnetic storm, the akasha, or ionosphere, would be disturbed such that it would influence the soul's communication with its own past life imprints recorded on its unique template. By selecting certain frequencies from its template over others, say by choosing the noisy negative, scratched or marred portions of its template, the soul may choose to read from the debit sides of its akashic record and set itself up for a reincarnation experience where challenges such as physical deformities would be faced.

The early philosophers, we are told, failed to achieve a clear idea of the distinction between mind and matter. Have twentieth-century philosophers in general achieved such an idea? I am persuaded that most of them have not. Similarly, although the early philosophers did not distinguish clearly between empirical science and metaphysics, it is still a moot question how far, or just how, this can be done.

Heraclitus, with such alleged statements as "all things flow," etc., seems to have divined, as Buddha and his followers also saw, that the idea of nature as analyzable into one or more strictly identical, though also often greatly changing, individual things is at best a first approximation to the truth. Parmenides's notion of wholly immutable being is even more obviously paradoxical; but it expresses a common prejudice (insufficiently corrected by Heraclitus), that becoming is at most a qualification of being. Why not see being as merely an aspect of becoming, which, as Bergson long afterward said, is "reality itself"? It remained for Whitehead to define being in terms of becoming. But this development took more than twenty centuries. Heraclitus in Greece was a voice in the wilderness, and so ultimately was the Buddha in India.¹⁷

Leaping ahead momentarily two and a half millennia, it seems worth injecting that partly as a result of the work of the twentieth century thinkers referred to by Hartshorne, we finally seem to be overcoming the fatal, culture-deep assumptions of fragmentation. The slowly growing rejection of materialism, relativism, mechanism, determinism, dualism, reductionism, and excessive empiricism will lead us into what already is being referred to as the post-modern world. May it come quickly! Its arrival depends not only on much love and much fearless psychical exploration, but on much systematic thinking.

For our purposes it does not matter when full recognition of incorporeal spirit was reached. Perhaps it came with Plotinus. At any rate, Plotinus, despite great spiritual insight, provides an illustration of what I consider a major inadequacy of approach in relation to spirit, maintaining that it can and does produce that which is unlike itself: matter, understood as something other than spirit in visible form. It may be unfair to point to Plotinus in this connection, since he may come closer to presenting an understandable view than does the conventional Western blatant assertion that a spiritual God miraculously created a material world. At any rate, the visions of Plotinus have been summarized as follows:

[Plotinus] maintained that the Absolute is a power or force or energy and that the whole universe, visible and invisible, is a product of "Its"

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

These challenges would vary according to the planetary afterlife archetypes experienced between lives creating morphogenetic fields linked with these mars or ruts in its template, or soul record.

The point here is to suggest a geocosmic or astro-meteorological, formative causation model along the lines of Roll's psi structure theory of survival. This would help account for Stevenson's proposed between life template activity, in that planetary patterns at birth could be correlated with life challenges like deformities as well as with opportunities. The more favorable or resourceful life experiences, carried over through the planetary afterlife from previous lifetimes and linked with the credit side of its record, would be linked with planetary patterns of the more flowing type which form 60-degree and 120-degree patterns, rather than the harder 90- and 180-degree angles. In fact, the astro-meteorology research just reported also included distinct correlations of these more flowing 60- and 120- degree angles between planets and predictably clear or improved weather and radio communications.

One way this hypothesis could be tested is to calculate the planetary angles in effect at the birth of Stevenson's cases of children with deformities, alongside a control group of cases free from severe birthmarks or physical deformities. Our geocosmic model would predict that a significantly greater number of hard planetary configurations would be present at the birth of children with deformities--carried over from their previous life--than at the birth of children free from such challenges. The latter would be linked with a greater number of flowing configurations.

THE MESSIAH AND THE LAST JUDGMENT

Finally, there is a convergence of traditions that the Messiah had been Adam, as well as Jesus, and perfected himself in both terrestrial and celestial dimensions. He will return at the time of the Last Judgement (considered by many sources as immediately pending) and will gather all souls unto him. This is seen as part of a final destiny of souls in a cataclysmic pole shift of the earth, whereby the north star, Polaris, will be differently aligned from its present position. For example, the Skidi Pawnee Indians of the Great Plains say: "The command for the ending of all things will be given by the North Star, and the South Star will carry out the commands. Our people were made by the stars. When the time comes for all things to end our people will turn into small stars and will fly to the South Star where they belong."⁴⁴

In this same eschatological context, there is a rabbinical tradition which says that Adam contained all souls within him and that "The Son of David (the Messiah) will not come before all souls that have been on the body of the first man [Adam] will come to an end."⁴⁵ In other words, there is a literally cosmic connection between the

The Spirit of Wholeness

overflowing activity. This activity overflows in a succession of types of existence which decrease in reality as their distance from their source increases, until at the extremity of the creative process they disappear into bare nothingness, just as the light given off by some source of illumination gradually fades away into darkness. The first emanation, as Plotinus termed it, is nous (variously translated as Spirit, Divine Mind, intelligence, Intellectual Principle). From nous emanates Soul, which contains in itself all particular souls, including human souls. Soul, in its turn, creates, in accordance with the Platonic forms as archetypes, nature, i.e., the phenomenal world.¹⁸

The opposite inadequacy is the view that spirit is simply the production of increasingly complex matter-energy; in other words, spirit is an emergent quality of existence resulting from the growing complexity of the material world.

Neither of these positions produces a very meaningful whole. The first offers a material world which is negation of divine fullness, while the second settles for a Johnny-come-lately divinity tacked onto the latest stage of evolutionary development. To be sure, Plotinus offers us the possibility of swimming upstream in the ever-flowing fountain of emanation, and eventually returning to the ineffable One; and better evolution with a divine tail than evolution without one. But neither prospect invites us to partake of full wholeness here and now, as far as an earthly setting will allow. Nothing else will do, and the traditional mystics assure us that this is possible, at least with regard to consciousness. For more than a century some less traditional, practically-oriented mystics have been assuring us that we can have it all, however we may define it, in immediate experience, not only consciousness, but all facets of health, wealth, and happiness, as a result of the state of consciousness that we select. I have in mind the various forms of what has been called the "Metaphysical Movement," especially New Thought. These days one would have to include the whole New Age movement, which is considerably indebted to New Thought, although the ripples of influence have grown so large in circumference that many are unaware of where they originated.

APPLYING THE WHOLENESS OF SPIRIT. The "metaphysical" mode of producing microscopic wholeness in daily living is based on theocentric conceptions of the macroscopic whole of reality, with the aim of allowing God to be as fully as possible constructively expressed in daily living. "God is all" is the beginning point, from which markedly different theoretical conclusions are drawn, in service of the same practical, healing ends. "Heal" and "whole" (and "holy") of course have the same linguistic roots. New Thought's nearest neighbor, Christian Science, says that because God is all, matter is nothing, is sheer illusion, so there is nothing to be healed. New Thought, which includes such

Adamic Messiah considered as the soul of all souls, and the destiny of the human soul population at the end of time. Like the relationship between a part of the hologram and the master hologram, each of us is destined to be re-incorporated, at the Last Judgement, within the comprehensive body of the Master Soul, the Messiah. Souls, therefore, will eventually return to the star over which they are potential Messiahs.

Similarly, there is an early Hindu tradition about ascensions to heaven of certain Messiah-figures or "planetary heros". They are called "'portions' of the gods, and when the third world [the present age] comes to its end... these 'portions' are reunited with the gods of whom they are a part."⁴⁶ That is, synthesizing these traditions, the coming New or Golden Age will thus see the realization of our own status as messiahs, saviors, for entire star systems assigned to us before the very beginning of time.

Finally, addressing the end of the age from the standpoint of parapsychological philosophy in a recent work, Michael Grosso notes that "some near-death experiencers are having visions of global catastrophe" and that many experts as well as non-experts see nuclear war as the form it will take. Whether through nuclear war or through massive earth changes in the pole shift prophesied in the above traditions, the likelihood of "global near-death", as Grosso puts it, certainly makes a "modern 'art of dying'" useful, if not necessary. In tune with our Messianic approach to the afterlife, Grosso also sees "the Resurrection as a model for deathcraft."⁴⁷

One could see such a science or art of deathcraft as an updated version of Egyptian and Mithraic rituals. The Mysteries of Mithras, in fact, were the last to practice a ceremonial "afterlife training" in which initiates passed through seven sacramental gates arranged on ascending steps which represented the seven heavens, or planets. The purpose of this initiation rite was to symbolically effect the spiritual transformation in the afterlife and to guarantee its consummation in the next world.⁴⁸

CONCLUSION

By way of summary, a model of the afterlife which emerges from a synthesis of traditions East and West together with clairvoyant sources, psychic and geocosmic research is as follows:

1. The afterlife experienced between reincarnations is best understood in terms of interpenetrating and overlapping dimensions, levels, spheres, or planes experienced successively by the soul or disembodied personality. While specific galaxies, constellations and stars are featured in many astral myths, these afterlife dimensions are mostly limited to our solar system and correspond to the orbits of the planets, including the Sun and Moon. Our destiny is to return to the stars.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

groups as Divine Science, Religious Science, and Unity, maintains that because God is all, matter is part of God. In some of the words of the International New Thought Alliance's Declaration of Principles:

We affirm the inseparable oneness of God and man, the realization of which comes through spiritual intuition, the implications of which are that man can reproduce the Divine perfection in his body, emotions, and all his external affairs....

We affirm our belief in God as the Universal Wisdom, Love, Truth, Power, Peace, Beauty and Joy, "in whom we live, and have our being...."

We affirm that the universe is the body of God, spiritual in essence, governed by God through the laws which are spiritual in reality even when material in appearance.

New Thought holds that through changing one's thought, one can change his or her feelings, and that through habitually-held thought and feeling one necessarily gives direction to the divine creative flow that is one's life.

If God is All, spirit is some or, more likely, all of God. A New Thought dictionary¹⁹ which devotes six pages to "spirit" and "spiritual" in various expressions, defines "Spirit" as "Life essence which permeates all persons and all things. The Thing within everything which makes it what it is. God, the Living Spirit Almighty." This definition leaves unclear whether there is anything other than spirit; it seems to imply that there is, unless "permeate" were to be taken in a sense other than the usual one of "to pass through," emphasizing "diffusion throughout a substance, solid, or gas in such a way that no part is left untouched or unaffected." (Macmillan Contemporary Dictionary). Obviously, such an understanding would be congenial to a traditional, essentially dualistic Western religion. The same New Thought author in his textbook's glossary entry on "Spirit" includes, "We treat of Spirit as the Active and only Self-Conscious Principle. We define Spirit as the First Cause or God; the Universal I AM. The Spirit is Self-Propelling, It is All....It is Free Spirit because it knows nothing outside Itself, and nothing different from itself. Spirit is the Father-Mother-God because it is the Principle of Unity back of all things. Spirit is all Life, Truth, Love, Being, Cause and Effect, and is the only Power in the Universe that knows Itself."²⁰ Although the last few words suggest the question of whether there is some non-spiritual power, it seems clear that the intent is to maintain that Spirit or God is all. Presumably, we are entitled to ignore the references to "Principle," which is a term employed rather widely in New Thought Circles to emphasize the non-arbitrary nature of God, apparently without realizing that ordinarily a principle is considered to be an abstraction, powerless except as believed in and acted on by an actuality; it seems fair to assume that what is intended is that

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

2. Transpersonally or clairvoyantly acquired information from Emanuel Swedenborg, Rudolph Steiner and Edgar Cayce concerning the spiritual planes of the afterlife agree and independently corroborate each other, adding support to the other traditions reviewed here.

3. The O.O.B.E. or N.D.E. state most closely resembles the postmortem or disembodied state, with telepathic imaging the means of communication and the dream world as its closest overall parallel to the world beyond the physical body.

4. Characteristics such as birthmarks, physical deformities and other characteristics are carried over between lifetimes through an extended body which makes imprints upon templates interacting with the planetary dimensions of the afterlife. These templates, considered in terms of archetypes or morphogenetic fields, could interact with the solar wind in the earth's upper atmosphere. This geomagnetic-plasma medium, called the Akasha in Hinduism--through which the reincarnation individual travels back to his/her new body--is effected by the angular patterns between planets at the time of "reentry" or rebirth. These planetary patterns, known to affect global radio communications and weather conditions, are selected by the incoming consciousness as timing patterns for the activation of afterlife and reincarnational archetypes most in need of development for that particular individual's overall consciousness evolution. this geocosmic hypothesis is potentially verifiable.

5. Finally, our afterlife model incorporates traditions concerning the Last Judgement which prominently poses a Messianic figure incorporating all souls within him who transcends death--thereby ending human reincarnation cycles--and restores us to our proper place in the stars.

In conclusion, in addition to my own Messianic faith-understanding, my many years investigating the Cayce material firsthand, my experiences with Kirpal Singh and Robert Monroe, alongside all the research that has been done around the world by tireless scientists like Drs. Osis and Stevenson, all reinforce for me the validity of the abundant yet similar cross-cultural afterlife traditions I have described here.

This provides me with all the proof I need personally, spiritually and intellectually to continue investigating the celestial and literally cosmic nature of the afterlife, and particularly how we can study it best in terms of getting some specific, verifiable results. Even more important is the concomitant application of what we learn about our likely condition between lifetimes so that we can improve our present lives, while at the same time preparing ourselves and others for the life beyond.

To close, I would like to share a few lines from William Wordsworth's Ode on Intimations of Immortality:

The Spirit of Wholeness

Spirit or God is the actual, concrete unity behind everything and expressing in and as everything, with nothing else in existence. Certainly it would not make sense to claim that the existence of God is dependent on a principle, which would be nothing apart from what is formulated about the reality which exists logically prior to the formulation which is the principle. However, it should be noted that the same dictionary refers to Principle as Mind, so this matter may be simply a peculiarity of terminology. The essential point is that spirit is all and is available to transform one's life in the degree that one identifies with spirit. The wholeness-producing character of spirit can produce wholeness in one's life, and will do so to the extent that one exercises his or her freedom to allow it to do this, for such is the pattern and purpose of all reality. But freedom to accept or to reject is equally dear to God, so that which is offered by ultimate love must be accepted if it is to become actualized.

A NEW HEALING IDEALISM. Although I have left much unsaid at this point, in saying what I have said I think that I have suggested fairly well the essence of my belief that there is a spirit, tendency, drive (not used in any technical psychological sense), or lure toward wholeness, and have taken note of some attempts to portray spirit or God as the ground of wholeness, not only of overall reality, but of individual wholeness in the sense of practical accomplishment of a healing nature, operating in accordance with one's habitual, or at least currently consistent, orientation of thought and feeling. However, there remain the questions suggested in the Osis paper about the dark side of survival--by extension the dark side of reality in general--and the place of psychical research in dealing with spirit in either its lighter or seemingly darker aspects. In order to deal with these I shall introduce, and barely sketch, a systematic metaphysical idealism. I believe that we shall never understand either paranormal occurrences or ordinary ones adequately unless we adopt a thoroughgoing idealism. I call it a healing idealism because it heals the gaps or intellectual wounds left by earlier attempts to understand the nature of reality and because it provides the background for the practical work of healing individual human beings, and other beings, as well as society.

There are various types of metaphysical idealism, so I must specify the type which I consider adequate for understanding reality. This is my adaptation of the process thought, or process philosophy, or process theology, pioneered by Alfred North Whitehead (1861-1947)²¹ and modified by Charles Hartshorne (born in 1897 and still teaching, writing, and lecturing) and others. Perhaps no one agrees with all my modifications of it, but at least for the most part I shall be sketching some of what is generally agreed on by process thinkers.

Before turning to details of my outlook, I want to emphasize the centrality of value, not only in one's own experience, but in all reality, and therefore in any

Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

Our birth is but a sleep and a forgetting:
The Soul that rises with us, our life's Star,
Hath had elsewhere its setting,
And cometh from afar:
Not in entire forgetfulness,
And not in utter nakedness,
But trailing clouds of glory do we come
From God, who is our home.⁴⁹

NOTES

¹Solon Wang, The Multiple Planes of the Cosmos and Life: The Survival Theory of Ancient Sages as proved by Modern Psychicists [sic] (Taipei, Taiwan: The Society for Psychic Studies, R.O.C., 1979).

²Giorgio de Santillana and Hertha von Dechend, Hamlet's Mill: An Essay on Myth and the Frame of Time (Boston: Gambit, Inc., 1969). Other astronomical images of the afterlife, such as that of the river Styx and Okeanos, the great Ocean, which were used by Plato, were borrowed from the legendary Greek poet Hesiod. In his theogony, Hesiod describes Okeanos as follows: "With nine swirling streams he winds about the earth and the sea's wide back, and then falls in the main; but the tenth flows out from a rock, a sore trouble to the Gods." The great Latin poet Virgil later envisions Purgatory in pure astronomical terms, saying, "One pole is ever high above us, while the other, beneath our feet, is seen of black Styx and the shades infernal." Commenting on this, these scholars ask, "What can it mean except that Styx flows in sight of the other pole?" (that is, the South Pole, pp. 193-194).

³Plato, Republic, Book 10, paragraph 620; Virgil, Aeneid, Book 6, paragraphs 748-51.

⁴Timeaus, paragraphs 41E-42D.

⁵William H. Stahl, trans., Macrobius--commentary on the Dream of Scipio (New York and London: Columbia University Press, 1952), pp. 72-3.

⁶Ibid., p. 73.

⁷W. W. Gill, Myths and Songs from the South Pacific (1896), pp. 156ff, 185ff. This and the following several references are from Hamlet's Mill, pp. 242-243. Citations are given in full to assist those wishing to further research original sources for these traditions.

⁸E. Best, The Astronomical Knowledge of the Maori (1955), p. 45.

⁹R. W. Williamson, Religious and Cosmic Beliefs of Central Polynesia (1924), Vol. 5, p. 208.

¹⁰Ibid.

¹¹H. B. Alexander, Latin American Mythology, (1916), p. 185.

metaphysics adequately describing reality. The mystic feels this; the metaphysician must attempt to formulate it. Charles Hartshorne has called value the key to idealism.²² While a materialist believes in bare facts, an idealist finds that "bareness with respect to value turns out to be bareness with respect to intelligibility also."²³ A fact cannot be apprehended at all except in an experience of value. "[E]njoyment is not the 'accompaniment' of life, but life itself."²⁴

The position of idealism amounts to the doctrine that, just as shapes, sizes, motions, and the life are nothing without some sort of secondary qualities to form the content of these more abstract forms, so, and in a still more absolute sense, secondary qualities are nothing without the aesthetic feelings to which they are merely a formalized reference. But this radical reversal of history, making the last first, has been too profound a breaking with tradition for even its own prophets to see it altogether clearly and consistently. The absolute centrality of value, which is the gist of idealism, has not been given [adequate expression]....The feeling tone of color [for example] is not, according to an idealism that understands itself, something over and above the color; it is just the color itself seen in its intelligible essence.²⁵

Similarly, Whitehead observed that "the energetic activity considered in physics is the emotional intensity entertained in life."²⁶

Process philosophy, his own version of which Whitehead called the philosophy of organism, finds reality to be process, change, development, experience, rather than enduring substance. It could be called an updated version of the philosophy of Heraclitus, with as much emphasis on order of interrelationships as on change. Experience comes in momentarily-existing bursts. Most of them are below the level of complexity which is consciousness, but they partake of divine intelligence, and make decisions which determine the way in which they will blend the influence of the past with the possibilities for the immediate future given to the units of experience by God. These "occasions of experience" or "actual entities" are living, since they have the characteristics of creative activity, aim or selectivity, and enjoyment or satisfaction. Although all occasions of experience are living, many aggregates of them, such as stones and steel beams, are not. By what is essentially extrasensory perception--which is the rule, rather than the exception, throughout reality as a whole--the occasions of experience are at least dimly aware of all that has happened before. "Each task of creation is a social effort, employing the whole universe."²⁷ Each occasion is a whole, and is a contributor to the total whole. The basic purpose of existence, or spirit, or God, is the constant creation of new wholes, which are experiences integrating the influences

Afterlife Traditions and Psychical Research

- ¹²S. Hangar, "Cherokee Star Lore," Festschrift Boas (1906), p. 363; H. B. Alexander, North American Mythology, p. 117.
- ¹³Macrobius, op. cit., pp. 135-136.
- ¹⁴Dante, Paradise, Book 8, paragraphs 34-37.
- ¹⁵Hamlet's Mill, p. 196. See G. H. Bode, ed. Scriptures Rerum Mythicarum Latini (1968), 1st. ed. 1934), Vol. 1, p. 176.
- ¹⁶William R. Fix, Star Maps (London: Octopus Books, 1979), pp. 174-5. Fix logically concludes, "since these rivers of heaven are the destinations of the dead, and since they correspond to the circles of the planets, what can it mean but that men travel to the planets after death?" (p. 175)
- ¹⁷Macrobius, op. cit., p. 134.
- ¹⁸E. S. Drower, Diwan Abatur or Progress through the Purgatories (Rome: Citta del vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1950), p. iv.
- ¹⁹Hans Jonas, The Gnostic Religion: The Message of the Alien God and the Beginnings of Christianity (Boston: Beacon Press, 1958, 1963), p. 153.
- ²⁰J. R. Porter, Journeys to the Other World, quoted in Fix, p. 132.
- ²¹Gerschom G. Scholem, Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism. New York, N.Y.: Schocken Books, 1941, 1946. p. 78
- ²²Leo Schaya, The Universal Meaning of the Kabbalah. Nancy Pearson, trans. Baltimore, Md.: Penguin Books, 1973. p. 76.
- ²³Rudolph Steiner, Life Between Death and Rebirth. Hudson, N.Y.: Anthroposophic Press, 1968. p. 140.
- ²⁴Rudolph Steiner, Man's Life On Earth. Hudson, N.Y.: Anthroposophic Press. p. 77.
- ²⁵Sadguru Sant Keshadevas, Liberation from Karma and Rebirth. Wash., D.C.: Temple of Cosmis Religion, 1970. p. 34
- ²⁶Karlsis Osis and E. Haraldsson, At the Hour of Death. New York, N.Y.: Avon Books, 1977. p. 1
- ²⁷Hamlet's Mill, p. 311.
- ²⁸E.R. Dodds, The Greeks and the Irrational. Berkeley, CA.: Univ. of California Press, 1968.
- ²⁹Ian Stevenson, Charles T. Tart, and Michael Grosso, "The Possible Nature of Post-Mortem States", "Journal of the Society for Psychical Research, Vol. 74, p. 421
- ³⁰David H. Lund, Death and Consciousness. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland, 1985. pp. 86-87.

Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

³¹Quoted in David Black, "Psychoanalytic and Psychophysiological Theories about the Out-of-Body Experience" in Mind Beyond the Body: The Mystery of ESP, D. Scott Rogo, ed. New York, N.Y.: Penguin Books, 1978. pp. 327-8.

³²Black, p. 328.

³³The Book of Enoch, R.H. Charles, ed. The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha, Vol I. Oxford, Eng.: Oxford University Press, 1913.

³⁴Ry Redd, Toward a New Astrology. pp. 72-84.

³⁵Robert Monroe, Far Journeys. New York, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1972.

³⁶Rev. Canon John Rossner, Toward a Parapsychology of Religion: From Ancient Religion to Future Science. Book 2. Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1979. pp. 422-444.

³⁷Ian Stevenson, "Some Questions Related to Cases of the Reincarnation Type". Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research, Vol. 68. p. 407.

³⁸William G. Roll, "The Psi Structure Theory of Survival" in Research in Parapsychology. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, 1983. pp. 118-9

³⁹K. Wilder, ed. The Holographic Paradigm and other Paradoxes. Boulder, Col.: Shambala, 1982.

⁴⁰Roll, p. 119.

⁴¹Buryl Payne, "Global Peace Meditation Project" (Interim Report, May, 1986). Journal of the National Council for Geocosmic Research, Vol. 68, p. 407.

⁴²Ibid.

⁴³Paul Beard, Living On: How Consciousness Continues and Evolves After Death. New York, N.Y.: Continuum, 1981. pp. 108-9. p. 115

⁴⁴Alexander, North American Mythology, p. 117

⁴⁵Hamlet's Mill, p. 309

⁴⁶Ibid.

⁴⁷Michael Grosso, Playing The Survival Game. Walpole, N.H.: Stillpoint Publishing Co., 1986. p. 7

⁴⁸Redd, p. 79

⁴⁹William Wordsworth, "Ode on Intimations of Immortality". II: 58-65.

Ry Redd is a researcher with the Assn. for Research and Enlightenment, Virginia Beach, VA. His address is 2204 Mediterranean Ave. Virginia Beach, VA. 23451

The Spirit of Wholeness

of (1) the multitude of past experiences and (2) God-given potentialities for fullest present actualization of value. In becoming the opening phase of development of each unit of experience God's aim is at "the evocation of intensities" or "depth of satisfaction as an intermediate step towards the fulfillment of his [God's] own being."²⁸ After the occasion's split-second life of subjectivity it contributes to the overall whole by becoming an object for the awareness of God, who keeps her/his awareness of it fresh forever and recycles it by giving it as part of the background out of which all future occasions will arise. Since the universe of which God is aware, as God's body, changes--is created anew--from moment to moment, God also constantly is growing. Probably God is, as each of us is, a succession of experiences. These come so quickly, somewhat like the rapidly projected frames of a motion picture, that we interpret the succession of experiences as one long-lived, perhaps everlasting, soul or self. One's body is a vast collection of sub-personal occasions, of which the personal occasion of the moment is the leader, but not an utterly effective dictator, for the occasions of the body have some measure of freedom to go their own way.

Each occasion is a spiritual reality, but each has both a backward-looking ("physical") pole and a forward-looking ("mental") pole. Spirit is experiential. There is nothing but experience, which comes as the momentarily-existing subjective worlds of occasions of experience. Whitehead said, "Apart from experiences of subjects there is nothing, nothing, nothing, bare nothingness."²⁹ Here one cuts away with Ockham's Razor all the needless speculation about spirit's moving into matter or producing matter. Spirit gives rise to nothing but new unity of spirit. There is nothing but spirit, which is the creative action found in fleeting units of experience. To be sure, neither this metaphysics nor any other can supply us with the details of what spirit produces, but it informs us of what the basic nature of any part of reality must be. With that knowledge we are all the more likely to discover the details and to be able to deal with them most effectively, which is to say most appreciatively, most lovingly.

The view of God most commonly associated with process thought is panentheism, which maintains that while all is in God, God and the world are not identical (which pantheism claims), since God's awareness or personality transcends the world. This view explains the dark side of life on the basis of a division of power and responsibility between what I refer to as God the One and God the many, meaning everything "else." God the One is responsible for only the general pattern of existence. All actualization of potentiality is good, but not so good as full activity in accordance with divine wisdom would be, and this is done only by God the One. Moreover, each occasion of experience lasts for only a moment, and simply has to make the best of the possibilities open to it in the context of where it finds itself, much as one must do in relation to the family, country, and period of history into which one is born

(regardless of whether there is reincarnation, with choice as to any or all of these by earlier occasions in one's personal line of inheritance, since these earlier occasions are only abstractly identified with ourselves).

With spirit as the creative process, which is the endless succession of occasions of experience, the wholeness of each occasion is inescapable in the sense of drawing on the whole of past experience and creating a new whole of experience, which is complete in form, although the awareness-enjoyment of wholeness is dependent on the degree to which the occasion accepts the divinely-given prescription, or "initial aim," which is the first phase of development of the occasion. By means of this initial aim, God is the lure to fullness of life, which is experienced by human beings most impressively by awareness of the divine quality of the process.

Perhaps our fullest awareness will come in postmortem life, in which we may progress eventually to a state of transparency of soul or self which will make coexistence of the one and (as) the many more readily understandable.³⁰ Meanwhile, psychical research can contribute to our awareness through study of such fascinating successions of occasions of experience as are found in this-worldly instances of psi and in near-death experiences. Especially important is study of the mystical significance of encounters with the Being of Light, as well as study of mediumistic and other possible evidence of a future existence, which in essence will be neither more nor less spiritual than that which we enjoy today. Let us not be concerned with whether our pursuit of truth be called science, religion, philosophy, or simply the fullest exercise of all the abilities that we have in order to come into greatest awareness and appreciation of ourselves and our surroundings.

At this point, if not before, enormous problems of interpretation arise. For one, the mystic may report experiences of timelessness, which seem to be inconsistent with the transition from one occasion to the next, which is the process definition of time. However, Whitehead speaks of a timeless form of fluency within an occasion of experience, so it may be that the mystic somehow is aware of what is going on within occasions and not of the transition from one occasion to another. Presumably divine wisdom, operating through initial aim, tailor-makes each such aim in the light of past experiences in the particular line of descent which constitutes a person or lower form of entity. So by becoming aware of and affirming by appropriate thought, feeling, and action the divine, spiritual, nature of the creative process, one can insure a richer inheritance and greater likelihood of constructive activity for one's descendant-occasions, whether operating in mystical awareness, psychical experience, psychical research, social engineering, artistic creation, healing, or any other activity.

SCIENCE AND RELIGION LOOK AT THE IMAGE OF GUADALUPE

Frank C. Tribbe

The "Image of Guadalupe", a portrait of the Virgin Mary left on the tilma, or cloak of Juan Diego in Mexico City in 1531 on the occasion of the appearance of the Virgin to him, has been extensively studied by scientific techniques which have given us only enigmas rather than answers to our questions concerning the apparitions of Mary and the image on the tilma.

Why am I, an ecumenical Protestant, interested in these Marian phenomena, and in the "Catholic relics" such as the Shroud of Turin image and the Guadalupe Image?

First, because they have been scientifically validated to such an extent that they merit inquiry. And second, because the term, "Catholic relic" is not an appropriate one. The Shroud of Turin surfaced in western Europe in 1357, and the Image of Guadalupe was created in Mexico in 1531. Luther's reformation began in 1517, so that the first European owners of the Shroud 160 years earlier had no choice as Christians but to be Catholic. Similarly, the Franciscans brought Christianity to Mexico in 1525, four years after Cortez completed his conquest, and upon creation of the Guadalupe Image six years later, the Christian owner of the Tilma bearing that image was, of course, a Catholic Christian.

These both are Christian images, and the scientific enigmas discovered on both should interest all thinking persons. Their owners and custodians have been Catholic at a time when Catholicism was the only form of Christianity available to them.

Repeated apparitions, ostensibly of Mary the mother of Jesus, have been verified and recorded by the Catholic church some 200 times. Most of these have been private or semi-private appearances to one or very few persons, and most have been a one-time appearance of rather short duration.

Lest one think the phenomena are tapering off--perhaps because this is a more enlightened age--I need only point out that the public appearances in Zeitun, Egypt (a suburb of Cairo), claimed to be of Mary, were of figures (and sometimes human forms) of light over St. Mary's Coptic Christian Church where legend says Mary, Joseph and Jesus lived during their Egyptian exile--these occurred at night two or three times a week from 1968 to 1971 before crowds of tens of thousands of watchers Mary presumably was bringing a message of peace. Many photographs of the apparitions were published; the messages were presumably telepathically transmitted.

The Spirit of Wholeness

CONCLUSION. There have been seen here glimpses of the other papers to be given at this meeting, some definitions of "psychical research" and brief consideration of whether it is or should be a science, some definitions of "spirit," identification of spirit and God, brief looks at fragmentation and at some philosophical attempts to find wholeness, and a New Thought understanding of the practical use of wholeness-producing spirit to produce human wholeness.

Although I have attempted to be objective in this brief historical survey, including the introduction of some views which do not agree with my own, I necessarily have been arbitrary in selecting what to include in this relatively brief presentation. The conclusions are mine; I shall attempt now to put some major ones succinctly, before adding some closing remarks.

There is only one whole, new every moment and composed of many wholes. It is divine. It is spirit. It is God. It is the field of psychical research and all other research. It manifests as the experience which is matter without losing its spiritual quality, for matter is just one way in which spirit can be apprehended. Matter is not created, in the sense of spirit's producing anything other than spirit. Occasions which we call material have their subjectivity, and they enter into experiences called mental, in the universal pattern of overlapping experiences or minds. Neither material nor psychical realms can be understood adequately apart from inclusion of the personal, value-oriented factors which are most characteristic of spirit. Even sub-personal entities are provided with meaningful feelings of wholeness as a result of the personal guidance of the God who loves them. Hartshorne has called God "the unimaginable actual love of the unimaginable vastness of actual things."³¹ God's "tenderness is directed towards each actual occasion, as it arises."³² There is one spirit, with innumerable manifestations here and hereafter. While many appearances of spirit can be measured scientifically, the essence of spirit always slips through the scientific net. Personal, spiritual reality can be met and appreciated fully only in personal experience. Even comparatively slight awareness of the divine, infinite intelligence-love-beauty-bliss is awesome.

There is almost no end of things that might be said of the richness of spirit, but it is far less important to talk about it than to experience it. The next two days will be wealthy in wisdom, but even more richly endowed with the sharing of spiritual selfhood. For that I am extremely grateful, and I especially thank you for participation in this sharing of my all too fragmentary remarks on the spirit of wholeness.

Then, beginning on June 24, 1981, and continuing nearly every day to the present time, Mary has been appearing and conversing privately with six youths in the village of Medugorje in central Yugoslavia, while tens of thousands of pilgrims flock there from all over the world and have various spiritual, physical and psychological experiences. Though not visible to other than the six seers, the apparition has been photographed, presenting an attractive, human face. She imparts secret predictions to the seers, and her public statements through them emphasize need for conversion and piety.

Next, simultaneously, the light figures, claimed to be of Mary, resumed their Egyptian appearances on March 25, 1986, in the city of Cairo at St. Damienna Coptic Church; this phenomena continued until October of 1986.

And then, in late February 1987, on the slopes of Sicily's Mount Etna, an apparition identifying itself as Mary the Madonna, began floating through the air and whispering the brief message: "Repent quickly--the end is at hand!" In April 1987 this was still continuing, with an estimated twenty thousand pilgrims scrambling up the rough slopes of this still-active volcano. She appears, visibly, but only briefly, and speaks of the world's imminent end.

But of all the alleged Marian appearances (and only ten are considered to be "major"), the first major one was in Mexico City in 1531, where Mary asked to be known as the Madonna of Guadalupe. From December 9 to 12, 1531, Mary appeared five times to the peasant, Juan Diego, and once to his uncle, Juan Bernardino. And on the day of the last appearance, December 12, she left behind a physical "sign," the full-size, life-like picture, in color, of herself, which we call the image of Guadalupe. This is the only physical sign she has ever left anywhere, and its beauty is only surpassed by the scientific enigmas it has presented us.

Quite apart from the religious viewpoint, the image of Guadalupe always has been of major significance in the fields of art, history and archaeology. In spite of it's certain and continuous public existence in Mexico City for 456 years, historians are compelled to ponder what the Spanish-Aztec relations might have been in the middle-third of the 16th century but for this Image. Archaeologists must stand amazed at a delicately colored picture on a coarse, cactus-fiber peasant's cloak (a tilma) which never received preservative treatment of any sort or any protection until recent decades, and should have rotted away within twenty years in that hostile climate. And all analysts have been wholly frustrated by their inability to identify the medium used to create this delicate, yet vibrantly colorful Image of photographic quality, even by their most intimate physical examination.

- ¹Benjamin B. Wolman, ed., Handbook of Parapsychology (New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Company, 1977), pp. 929 and 931.
- ²Daniel Day Williams, The Spirit and the Forms of Love (New York and Evanston: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1968), p. 3.
- ³Borden Parker Browne, Personalism (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1908), p. 266.
- ⁴Ibid., pp. 266-67.
- ⁵Williams, op. cit., p. 3.
- ⁶Evelyn Underhill, The Life of the Spirit and the Life of To-Day (New York: E. P. Dutton & Company, 1922), pp. 2-3 and 12.
- ⁷John Allan [author of the quotation], Letitia Caron, and Caroline Terrell, Conversations in Spirit (Marina del Ray, California: DeVorss & Company, 1981), pp. 1-2.
- ⁸See, for example, Ken Wilber, Eye to Eye (Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1983), Ch. 10, "The Ultimate State of Consciousness."
- ⁹Charles Hartshorne, "The New Pantheism," The Christian Register, CXV (February 27, 1936), 143.
- ¹⁰Philip Wheelwright (ed.), The Presocratics (New York: The Odyssey Press, 1966), pp. 70-71.
- ¹¹Ibid., p. 14.
- ¹²Ibid., p. 31.
- ¹³Ibid., p. 33.
- ¹⁴Ibid., p. 32.
- ¹⁵Ibid., p. 162.
- ¹⁶James N. Jordan, Western Philosophy from Antiquity to the Middle Ages (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1987), p. 40.
- ¹⁷Charles Hartshorne, Insights and Oversights of Great Thinkers (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1983), pp. 14-15.
- ¹⁸W. T. Jones, A History of Western Philosophy (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1952), p. 301.
- ¹⁹Ernest Holmes, New Thought Terms and their Meanings (New York: Dodd, Mead, & Company, 1942).
- ²⁰Ernest Holmes in collaboration with Maud Allison Lathem, The Science of Mind, rev. ed, (New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1938), p. 634. The most complete survey of the New Thought movement, of which Holmes (1887-1960) was an important part, is Charles S. Braden, Spirits in Rebellion (Dallas: Southern Methodist University Press, 1963); see

The Image of Guadalupe

And now, science adds its imponderable enigmas to the puzzle: (1) neither infra-red nor chemical analysis by a German Nobel-Laureate can explain the medium used; (2) Ophthalmologists find reflected images in the Lady's eye that should only be possible in a curved human eyeball; (3) Aztec symbols on the lace which overlays her rose-covered robe match geographic landmarks of Aztec Mexico. (4) The stars on her blue cloak match a star-map generated by an astronomer's twentieth century computer.

So, art, history, archaeology, ophthalmology, astronomy, geography, photography and religion, all bemused, have looked to science for answers, and instead have received--enigmas! These enigmas we will explore after setting the background stage.

The hero of this vignette of history is known to us as Juan Diego. At birth he was given the Aztec name of Cuahtlatohuac, meaning "He who speaks Like an Eagle." He became a maker of reed mats, since he lived by the shores of Lake Texcoco. At age 51 in 1525--the year a dozen Franciscan monks began their evangelization efforts among the Indians of Aztec Mexico--he became a Christian and took the Spanish name, Juan Diego, at his baptism. His wife took the name, Maria Lucia, and his uncle who lived with them took the name, Juan Bernardino.

Another Franciscan, Juan de Zumarraga, arrived in Mexico City in 1528 as the country's first bishop. But the slow evangelization effort of the Franciscans was almost extinguished by the arrival that year of Nuno de Guzman as Governor, who immediately began a huge slaving operation as a personal business venture, and which further turned the Indians against the white man's religion, Christianity. In 1531 Guzman was removed from office and the making slaves of the Indians was declared a crime by the King of Spain.

At dawn on Saturday, December 9, 1531, Juan Diego started for Mass at the church some eight miles to the south along the shores of Lake Texcoco. A mile from his destination, he had to pass over the shoulder of a small hill, Tepeyac by name. As he did so he heard the sound of heavenly singing from the hilltop, accompanied, it seemed, by many birds in the chorus. Looking for the source of such beautiful sounds, he then saw a young woman beckoning to him and calling him by name.

She was dressed in white, and glowing brilliantly. Speaking in his native language, she identified herself as Mary the mother of Jesus, and asked that he go to the Bishop on her behalf, requesting that a shrine be built to her on this site. Juan Diego goes as bid, and after only a short delay is given an audience with the Bishop to whom he tells his story. Obviously, he is not believed, but the Bishop treats him kindly and says the time is not convenient for such action. Juan Diego returns to Tepeyac, sees the Madonna again, and tells her of his audience--suggesting

The Spirit of Wholeness

also J. Stillson Judah, The History and Philosophy of the Metaphysical Movements in America (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1967).

²¹Alfred North Whitehead's chief work is Process and Reality (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1929); probably his Modes of Thought (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1938) is the best book to begin one's reading of Whitehead. A valuable introduction to process thought is John B. Cobb, Jr. and David Ray Griffin, Process Theology: An Introductory Exposition (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1976). A helpful book for comparing competing understandings of the nature of God is Charles Hartshorne and William Reese, Philosophers Speak of God (The University of Chicago Press, 1953). A simple introduction to these and other matters of philosophy and religion is C. Alan Anderson, The Problem Is God (Walpole, New Hampshire: Stillpoint Publishing, 1985).

²²Charles Hartshorne, The Philosophy and Psychology of Sensation (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1934), p. 89.

²³Ibid., p. 94.

²⁴Ibid.

²⁵Ibid., pp. 97-98.

²⁶Whitehead, Modes of Thought, p. 168.

²⁷Whitehead, Process and Reality, p. 340.

²⁸Ibid., p. 161.

²⁹Ibid., p. 254.

³⁰See John Hick, Death and Eternal Life (New York, Hagerstown, San Francisco, and London: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1976), Ch. 22, "A Possible Eschatology," and Anderson, op. cit., Ch. 16, "Immortality as Karma, Reincarnation, and the Ultimate State."

³¹Charles Hartshorne, The Logic of Perfection and Other Essays in Neoclassical Metaphysics (La Salle, Ill.: The Open Court Publishing Company, 1962), p. 126.

³²Whitehead, Process and Reality, p. 161.

C. Alan Anderson is Professor of Philosophy and Religion at Curry College, Milton, MA. 02186.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

that he does not think the Bishop believed him. She was not distressed, and said they would try again.

The next day, Sunday, December 10th, Juan Diego again is up early and on his way to Mass. The Lady is on Tepeyac and stops him with the same instruction. He demurs at her repeated request, saying that a more important person should be her messenger. But she insists. He goes first to Mass, and then on to the Bishop's residence, perhaps another two miles. He waits much longer and the Bishop is less cordial, finally telling Juan Diego that he cannot accept this message unless the Lady sends him a "sign." Juan Diego returns to Tepeyac and reports. She tells him that tomorrow the Bishop shall have a sign.

On Monday, December 11th, his uncle, Juan Bernardino, has a raging fever, so he stays all day and nurses his uncle--his wife having died two years previously.

On Tuesday, December 12th, the uncle is near death, suffering an infection of typhus, and so Juan Diego sets out for the church to get a priest to come and administer last rites. Again the Lady calls to him from Tepeyac. He wants to keep going, as he calls to her the explanation of his errand and its urgency.

She remonstrates: "Don't you trust me to heal your uncle?" And she tells him to come to the hilltop and pick wildflowers to take as a sign for the Bishop. On the hilltop he finds many varieties of spring flowers in profusion--yet even in Mexico, spring flowers are not to be expected in mid-December. Catching up the skirt of his tilma, he fills it with flowers, and goes again to Mexico to see the Bishop. The Madonna goes immediately to their home and heals Juan Bernardino--who lives several more years.

Juan Diego finds extreme hostility at the Bishop's residence, and the minor officials try to chase him off. Juan persists and finally is permitted to see the Bishop again. Approaching him, Diego drops the skirt of his tilma, dumping the flowers at the Bishop's feet, saying, "Here is the sign from Our Lady." When he did so, there was disclosed (or instantly created) on the front of his tilma her perfect and full-size image, in color.

The Bishop was instantly convinced, and kept Juan Diego with him overnight. The following day, December 13, he ordered construction of a Shrine of Tepeyac Hill, and named Juan Diego as Custodian there for life. The Adobe shrine was completed and dedicated on December 26, 1531, and the Image on the Tilma was then installed there.

The Image on the Tilma stayed at the Shrine (chapel) on Tepeyac Hill until 1629; on September 25 of that year floods slightly damaged the bottom of it as the Tilma was taken by canoe to a nearby church until the waters receded. In 1709 the Basilica of Guadalupe was completed nearby and the image installed there. Because the Basilica, like most of Mexico

The Image of Guadalupe

City, was built on the bed of Lake Texcoco which had been drained, it began to settle unevenly. A modern Basilica was recently built adjoining the old one, and the Image was installed there on December 12, 1976.

This image of the Madonna is as precise as a photograph with features as delicate and natural as have ever been executed by the world's greatest painters. It is four feet eight inches tall--quite appropriate for a teen-ager or young matron of first century Israel or sixteenth century Mexico. The olive color of her face and hands would match either race. The robe is a soft shade of rose, covered by a lace sheath on which we find dozens of Aztec symbols which the sixteenth century Indians of Mexico could doubtless read as easily as we read a letter. Juan Diego is reported to have described the Madonna as a young maiden of surpassing beauty.

Art experts examined the figure on the Tilma in 1666, 1751, 1778, 1956, 1963 and 1979. All have marvelled at the quality of the picture, the enigma of the technique and the remarkable state of its preservation.

Art expert Miguel Cabera, from observation only, claims that the Image is made of four types of painting: The head and hands were executed in oils, he says; the robe was done in tempura; the cloak was made with water-color; and the background was in fresco. All of which is enigmatic, he explains, because oil painting used oleaginous pigments which dry, blend and attain harmony only when the surface is properly prepared by sizing; while tempura used pigments with gum, glue or like bases; water-color is executed on fine, white material and necessitates soaking the obverse side; and finally, fresco painting is done by plastering the surface and requires a solid surface such as a board, plaster or stone. The combining of all four, he asserts, is beyond comprehension.

In May 1979, Basilica authorities permitted the Tilma to be taken from its frame and bullet proof glass protection, so that it could be photographed all night long by Dr. Philip S. Callahan, a research biophysicist, painter, and photographer from the University of Florida; he is also an art historian, specializing in renaissance paintings. He was assisted that night by Professor Jody Brant Smith. They took dozens of photographs of many kinds, including infra-red photographs permitting depth examination of the image. This was the first time photography was permitted directly upon the image, rather than through its protective glass.

Callahan found that the figure of 1531 consisted only of the face and hands, the rose colored robe, the plain blue cloak, and a gray outcropping of rock on which the figure stood. He said that it has the freshness, the color luminosity and the brightness of pigments, as if painted last week. There is no fading, cracking or chipping of this original image, except along the seam of the tilma-cloth where it might have been folded when taken through the flood

of 1629 in a canoe. Some additions have been made by conventional painting, he said, probably to cover water-damage at the bottom of the tilma, and to make the picture "less plain and more attractive" in the minds of early custodians. The hands were overpainted to shorten the fingers, making them more Indian-like. The cuffs at her wrists were silvered, over the original white, and, of course, have now turned black. The additions were clearly man-made with conventional paints that show their age and will continue to deteriorate.

The infra-red photography permitted Callahan to conclude that there was no under drawing, as is usual to guide an artist; there was no sizing to fill-in the interstices of the coarse tilma weave (about comparable to our burlap), and no over-varnish to protect the image. The medium used is still unknown. Callahan concluded that it was not oil or tempura, water-color, fresco, nor any other medium known from early sixteenth century to now. There is no sign of brush-strokes or other tell-tale clues to a conventional artist.

A cactus-fiber tilma would not be expected to survive more than twenty years before completely disintegrating in the high humidity of Mexico City. The relic is now protected by bullet-proof glass, but during its first 116 years it had no protection at all. The atmosphere there is charged with nitrous particles and is so hostile that it disintegrates buildings and even consumes iron. Before its glass protection, the Image would have been subject to the effect of countless candles at the altar and seventy oil-lamps burning nearby, in addition to the rubbing and kissing of the Image by millions of pilgrims. In recent years, Basilica priest, Don Carlos Maria de Bustamente reports that while technicians were cleaning the tilma's gold frame, they accidentally spilled a vial of etching fluid directly onto the Image--yet it suffered no harm!

In 1963, experts from Kodak concluded, upon extensive examination, that this Image is "essentially photographic in character." In 1936, two fibers from the Image area of the Tilma, one red and one yellow, were taken to Richard Kuhn, Nobel winner in chemistry, at the Kaiser Wilhelm Institute in Heidelberg for evaluation. He found no coloring of any kind and reported that the material producing what resembled color was unknown to science; it was not animal, vegetable or mineral. Synthetic coloring was not developed until three centuries after 153 .

In the years 1929, 1951, 1955 and 1979, scientists reported that examination of the cornea of the right eye of the Image disclosed the busts of three people, as if "seen" by the Image itself. When the cornea was examined with an ophthalmoscope, a natural and life-like curve was found, with a reflection which should not be possible from a flat surface--only a living eye should react appropriately to this instrument. By enlarging the right eye of the Image twenty-five times, three figures may be seen. This clearly

The Image of Guadalupe

is a reflection of a human figure at which the madonna is looking at the instant her likeness is transferred somehow onto the Tilma--just as would be true of a natural eye. Yet, this is an eye "imprinted" on a flat, though rough, surface.

In May 1956, five ophthalmologists examined the eyes of the Image and all signed a report stating that their observations were exactly as if looking into a human eye, and that the reflection of a man was clearly to be seen on the retina. They stated that the man's arms were extended in front of him, with his hands, palms up, at waist-level. The size of the reflection on the retina is said to be appropriate if looking at a person one meter (about forty inches) away.

And what of the claim that three human figures were seen in the eye of the Image? Well, the rules of optic science include a phenomenon known as the Purkinje-Sansone Effect, which states that for any observation made by the human eye there are three reflections in the eye of the observer: the object being seen is first reflected on the outside of the cornea (usually between the pupil and the nose); it is then re-reflected on the retina at the back of the eye, and is reflected a third time, upside down, onto the inside of the cornea on the other side of the pupil (the outer side nearest the ear).

At the audience with the Bishop, as Juan Diego drops the skirt of his tilma, letting the flowers cascade onto the floor in front of the Bishop, is the ideal instant and circumstance for "imprinting" the picture. The tilma will then be full length with no flowers obstructing its surface, and his hands, as he lets go of the skirt of the tilma, will be extended in front of him, with his hands, palms up, at waist level"--exactly as the ophthalmologists described the reflection on the Image's retina. Paintings and other data respecting Juan Diego indicate that he was quite tall--probably six feet two to four inches; with the long tilma touching his insteps and laced close to his neck like a collar, as was usual, the exposed front of the tilma--as he stood straight upon dropping the flowers--would measure exactly four feet eight inches, the precise height of the Madonna figure.

The P-S Effect cited above, when applied here would mean that only one figure is shown in the eye, but is reflected three times. Most of the experts agree that existing paintings of Juan Diego compare very favorably with the figure in the Image's eye. Obviously, the Madonna was invisible in the Bishop's audience chamber and stood one meter in front of her selected emissary, Juan Diego, so that his form was reflected in her eye in the instant that her image was "transferred" to the tilma.

Superficially, the figures on the lace sheath that cover the rose robe look to be something like a modern paisley pattern. However, upon examination it has been

found that they were Aztec symbols, which would have been "read" easily by the Indians of that day. One large symbol in particular, which looks much like a stylized spade from a deck of playing cards, is in fact the Aztec symbol for "high mountain"; seven of these appear on the Image. When a relief map transparency of Aztec Mexico, of matching size, is superimposed over the Guadalupe Image, it has recently been found that the seven symbols for "high mountain" indeed fit precisely on the seven high mountains of the map. Moreover, the two such symbols positioned by her white cuffs, match the two peaks which are snow-capped the year 'round--Popocateptl (Smoking Mountain) and Ixxachihuatl (Sleeping Woman).

Dr. Juan Hernandez Illascaz, medical doctor and astronomer, was intrigued by the arrangement of the stars on the Lady's blue cloak and decided to put a star-map of Aztec Mexico into his computer, using only the major constellations of both north and south hemispheres visibly there. This he ran backward in time to 10:40 a.m. on December 12, 1531. When this exercise accomplished nothing, he inverted his star-map to look from outerspace to Aztec Mexico, instead of looking up from the ground into the sky. This time the map fit perfectly onto the stars of the Lady's cloak! The hour of 10:40 he estimated to be the time when Juan Diego finally reached the Bishop's presence and dumped the flowers, disclosing the Image.

Oddly, there may be some esoteric significance to the fact that the Winter Solstice of 1531 was December 12 on the Julian calendar, and it began at 10:40 a.m. of that day in the Central Time Zone in which Mexico is located.

All ancient peoples have known of astrology and astronomy, and all of them observed and named constellations, but each culture named the star-groups for animals of their own land. We still follow the Greek names for constellations, but the Aztecs had their own names; by coincidence, the only sign they had in common was Leo. Because they used different animal names, in some cases the Aztecs would use two or three more or less stars of a group than did the Greeks. Allowing for that variance, the star-map Dr. Hernandez developed fits perfectly onto the stars present on the Image.

Again, dipping into the esoteric, we might suggest that the Aztec astronomers who saw the Madonna's star-map may have read a pictographic message recorded there.

What was the reason for such an elaborate and precise and multipurpose Image? Just look at Christianity's numbers in Mexico. For seven years of effort (1525-1532) the Franciscans had baptized but 200,000 Indians, or one percent of the population. But then only four years later the records showed five million baptisms. The Image made Christianity acceptable to the Indians; they came in droves of their own initiative. When Juan Diego and Bishop Zumarraga both died in 1548, Indian baptisms had reached the

The Image of Guadalupe

total of nine million. Many Indians who were educated at Franciscan institutions themselves became evangelists.

Why was the Madonna given the name of "Guadalupe"? Because she told both Juan Diego and Juan Bernardino that she wished to be known as Santa Maria de Guadalupe. But it might be that there was a "tin ear" Spanish rendering of the Aztec word, Tequantlazopueh, pronounced "Teque-to-lope," which means, "Who saves us from the Devourer." Plus, the "eye of the beholder" perspective might apply, if Bishop Zumarraga heard that tortured rendering, he could have assumed that Guadalupe was the right Spanish word, because that was a name from home. Zumarraga was a Basque from the Pyrenees of northern Spain, near the town of Guadalupe, where was found a small statuette of the Madonna, buried hundreds of years earlier when the Spanish fled the Moors. Maybe.

But how much of this early story can we believe? There are five contemporary accounts of validation: (1) An account written by Zumarraga himself, who was a widely educated man and an able administrator of utmost integrity. He served as Bishop of Mexico for 25 years; he founded schools, colleges, hospitals, paper-mills and printing plants. He wrote extensively; he taught improved agriculture and supported mining innovations. (2) An account by interpreter Antonio Valeriano, a fine Indian scholar trained in the college established by the Franciscans in 1536; he personally knew Juan Diego, who did not die until 1548 at age 74. The original or a very early copy of Valeriano's report was recently found in the New York City Public Library; Valeriano later served for thirty-five years as Mayor of Mexico City. (3) In the Archives of the Indies, in Spain, has now been found a letter from Zumarraga to Cortez, inviting him to attend the dedication of the Tepeyac Hill shrine upon installation of the Image December 26, 1531. (4) Also, there are extant eleven Annals and two Charts that record these events. (5) And, there is the recorded witness of Diego's uncle, Juan Bernardino, attesting to the Lady's appearance that healed him.

And now, finally, was it really Mary, or just some earthbound excarnate entity having fun with a poor gullible peasant and a bishop starting his first post? I'm willing to vote that it was Mary, because the making of that Image was a quality professional job, so she must have authority over some very top-drawer experts and technicians using the latest heavenly equipment.

Selected Bibliography

Anon. Guadalupe from the Aztec Language. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1983.

Ascensio, L.M. Appartitions of Guadalupe as Historical Events. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1979.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

- Burrus, E.J. The Oldest Copy of the Nican Mopohua. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1979.
- Burrus, E.J. A Major Guadalupan Question Resolved. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1981.
- Burrus, E.J. Basic Bibliography of Guadalupan Apparitions. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1981.
- Burrus, E.J. Juan Diego and Other Native Benefactors. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1984.
- Callahan, P.S. The Tilma Under Infra-Red Radiation. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1981.
- Carroll, W.H. Our Lady of Guadalupe. Front Royal, VA: Christendom Publishers, 1983.
- Cawley, M. Anthology of Early Guadalupan Literature. Washington, D.C.: C.A.R.A., 1984.
- Delaney, J.J., ed. A Woman Clothed with the Sun. New York: Doubleday/Image, 1960.
- Demarest, D. and Taylor, C.B. Dark Virgin. New York: Devin-Adair, 1956/9.
- Emyard, B. (Sr. Mary Amatora). Queen's Portrait. Pampano, Florida: Exposition Press, 1972.
- Johnston, F. The Wonder of Guadalupe. Rockford, IL: Tan Books & Publishers, 1981.
- McClure, K. The Evidence for Visions of the Virgin Mary. Wellingborough, England: Aquarian Press, 1983.
- Smith, J.B. The Image of Guadalupe. New York: Doubleday, 1983.

Frank C. Tribbe is a member of the Board of Trustees of the Academy of Religion and Psychic Research and Chairman of the Publications Committee of the Academy. He is also Editor of "Spiritual Frontiers". His address is Donna-Gail Dr., #134, Penna Laird, VA.

DEBUNKING THE "DEBUNKERS":
WHERE IS THE PIKE FOR CSICOPS?^{1,2}

Charles F. Adams

In spite of the theoretical morass and methodological errors of psychical research, its claims are becoming more difficult to ignore. One result is that the nature of criticism is increasingly dependent on "pulling rank" by asserting the orthodox premisses of mainstream science. Pre-eminent among the critics is the Committee for the Scientific Investigation of the Claims of the Paranormal (CSICOP). While there is some truth in the boast of this group that it has gone from one triumph to another in exposing errors in psychic affairs, the claims are no longer quite so convincing. In revealing weaknesses in psychic claims, the criticisms reveal similar flaws in the claims of Western science.

There was once a prophet named Telemus, a brave man of great stature and an excellent seer, as Homer tells the story.³ Until he grew old, Telemus did all the prophesying for the Cyclopes, a fierce and barbarous island people distinguished by the one huge eye that glared from the center of their foreheads. In particular, we know about his prophecy to Polyphemus, a gigantic cannibal son of Poseidon; for, according to the seer, this Cyclops would someday lose his sight at the hand of an unknown person named "Odysseus." Thereafter, the penetrating but arrogant monocule of this Cyclops constantly scanned the island for an enemy "of imposing presence and superhuman strength." Unfortunately, his vision, powerful but fatally constrained, was unable to perceive the subtle possibilities in the seer's prophetic utterance--that his downfall would come at the hands of an "insignificant weakling." And so we have the saga of Odysseus and the Cyclops.

It is a gory story about how Odysseus and his fellows sharpen a huge pike of green olive wood, heat it in the Cyclops' cavern fire, and cunningly devise a way to drive it into the Cyclops' giant eye--condemning him forever to sightlessness. One might wonder what redeeming cultural value such a grisly story has had for 2,500 years, or why it should evoke enthusiasm or approval when recounted, until one realizes how graphically and poignantly the story lays out the classic archetype of good's triumph over evil, truth's over falsehood, of knowledge over ignorance, and of purposefulness over naturalistic indolence.

To some, perhaps even in the Academy of Religion and Psychical Research [ARPR], the metaphor of Odysseus vs. the Cyclops would not be unduly distorted if applied to certain conflicts we see--for example, our chosen attitudes about spiritual, metaphysical, and paranormal thought vs. certain attitudes about science we find offensive. To exaggerate this view, the monocular villain of the piece is the

totalitarian, narcissistic practices of some scientific fundamentalists by which they cannibalize or decimate those bodies of thought not seen as hospitable to the scientific world view. The hero is the tolerance of metaphysical thought for those pluralistic vocabularies and perspectives needed to express the conviction that human experience is properly grounded in many more places than those found only on the island to which the Cyclops is confined. Just because the Cyclopes of science "have lost the art of smithcraft known to their ancestors who worked for Zeus, and are now shepherds without laws, assemblies, ships, markets, or knowledge of agriculture; living sullenly apart from one another" does not mean that such universal capacities, abilities, laws, mobility, morality, and unity do not exist or are impossible, say the heroes.

But, given this version of the metaphor, it is not at all clear how the story should turn out. Just what is it that makes certain attitudes about science so Cyclopean? And, if they really are the villain, just where will our heroes get the great olive-wood pike to dull this imperious, penetrating, but severely constrained vision of the world?

CSICOP AS CYCLOPS, THE "DEBUNKER"

The confrontation in Homer's story springs from the Cyclops' arrogance in rejecting our hero's metaphysical view of things. Having been forced to the Cyclops's isle by storms at sea, Odysseus, like any civil Greek of the day, argued that "we are...on our way home..., but by the will of Zeus, and stress of weather, we have been driven far out of our course....We therefore humbly pray you to show us some hospitality....May your excellency fear the wrath of heaven, for he is the avenger of all suppliants and foreigners in distress."

This was a bit much for the Cyclops. "Stranger," he said, as he proceeded to debunk Odysseus's theory, "you are a fool, or else you know nothing of this country. Talk to me indeed, about fearing the gods or shunning their anger? We Cyclopes do not care about Zeus or any of your blessed gods, for we are ever so much stronger than they. I shall not spare either yourself or your companions out of any regard for Zeus, unless I am in the humor for doing so."

In 1976, there evolved an organization called The Committee for the Scientific Investigation of Claims of the Paranormal, "CSICOP" for short.⁴ Its avowed goal was, and is, to "debunk" the error and fraud that are inherent in religious, mystical, and psychological claims to paranormal phenomena (i) which are said to be outside the explanatory domain of orthodox science or (ii) which could be supported only by eccentric uses of scientific methods or (iii) which contradict established findings in science.⁵ While mainstream science has given grudging and temporary shelter to our hero,⁶ the hardliners at CSICOP, like Cyclops, hold no truck with the "will of Zeus" and vow that the superior knowledge and strength of fundamentalist science will give

Debunking the "Debunkers"

no quarter to interlopers and quacks.⁷ Paranormal claims must be debunked and exposed so that the world can see their absurdity and reject them.

One medium that CSICOP uses effectively for its debunking activities is its journal, The Skeptical Enquirer. In an anthology by its editor, Kendrick Frazier, philosopher Paul Kurtz explains their approach: "To 'debunk' means 'to correct a misapprehension, to disabuse, set right, put straight, open the eyes or clear the mind, disenchant, or dispose of illusion, unfoil, unmask, or tell the truth'... Some of the claims that are made--even by scientists and scholars--are preposterous and debunking is not an illegitimate activity in dealing with them. Sometimes the best way to refute such a claim is to show how foolish it is."⁸

Of course, the most efficient debunking would be if CSICOP could simply show that all claims of the paranormal were bunkum, a priori. But, showing admirable judgment (at least on paper) by staying within the boundaries of their experimental disciplines, CSICOPs concede that there is no method in science which would result in proving this universal negative.⁹ So their effort must proceed, piece by piece.

Very well. Just what does CSICOP claim to have debunked? I shall find it convenient to arrange their claims into four categories: claims about (i) fraud, (ii) error, (iii) eccentricity, and (iv) theory misconstruction. (Clearly, there will be many arbitrary features in this taxonomy.) First, I shall sketch out the basic claims CSICOP would have us accept.

DEBUNKING FRAUD. The most celebrated of CSICOP's activities have been those exposing fraud, either by the experimenter or by the subjects or practitioners in a paranormal event. Guessing cards, bending keys, poltergeists, paranormal healing, psychokinesis, animal experiments--apparently no field investigated by CSICOP has been immune from some findings of fraud. This (along with "debunking error") is an area in which CSICOP has performed its greatest services.¹⁰

The best-known case, of course, has been CSICOP's demolition of Uri Geller's apparently fraudulent claims.¹¹ More recently has been James Randi's revelation on the Johnny Carson show of how a prominent Houston TV evangelist and healer received information "from God," except that it was by means of radio transmissions from his wife backstage to a miniaturized receiver in his ear.¹² Some debunkers see fraud as so pervasive in psychical research that they are willing to use the fraud hypothesis as the first line of assault.¹³

What motivates this pervasive fraud? CSICOPs speculate about several possibilities--including money, prestige, influence, proving one is right, getting higher degrees, or being rewarded for skewing the results.¹⁴ Other suggestions

are (i) that psychism sells and the media will promote anything that sells¹⁵ and (ii) that the strong religious legacy in Western culture predisposes people to belief in the psi hypothesis.

DEBUNKING ERROR. CSICOP's litany of methodological sins in psychical research is lengthy, pungent, and usually (but not always) persuasive. A conviction of CSICOP's polemicists is that paranormal claims result either from error, fraud, or chance;¹⁶ consequently, enormous analytical energy has been expended to criticize the equipment, controls, analytical procedures, computations, and conclusions in reports of psi experiments and spontaneous phenomena.

The principle findings are that psi phenomena (i) are nonrepeatable, at least by skeptics; (ii) they are correlated with certain experimenters, implying a pervasive "experimenter effect;" (iii) they are artifacts due to poor experimental design; (iv) they can be claimed only after biased selection of data; (v) they are based upon inappropriate or eccentric uses of analytical methods and experimental preparations; (vi) they are obtained only when there are insufficient controls to rule out alternative explanations; and even then (vii) they can only be inferred as being due to psi in the absence of other explanations, the "what-else-could-it-be" explanation.¹⁷ In general, psi researchers are regarded as defective in critical thinking abilities and as adventurers who persist in looking for something that is not there and will never come--despite past impressions to the contrary.¹⁸ The outcome of this malady is a common refrain by CSICOP: that after 100 years there is not a single useful paranormal result, not one experiment that can be replicated by skeptics, and not a single person who can produce a paranormal phenomenon on demand.¹⁹

DEBUNKING ECCENTRICITY. Quite apart from fraud or error, CSICOPs wish to attack the link between purported psi phenomena and the theoretical explanation psi researchers attempt to construct for them. Specifically, CSICOPs charge that psi theoreticians pick and choose--arbitrarily, selectively, and unjustifiably--theoretical bits and pieces from mainstream science and employ them eccentrically for purposes for which they are unintended and unsuited.

Particularly attractive to psi theoreticians (and particularly defended against them by CSICOPs²⁰) is quantum mechanics. Various features of quantum theory have been filched by psi theorists--for example, the ideas (i) that humans participate in the creation of matter through the acts of observation and measurement, or (ii) that there is an interconnectedness of all matter. It would be eccentric and unjustifiable, say the skeptics, to distort this into some kind of authorization for psi events.²¹ According to Caltech physicist Murray Gell-Mann, "QM theory would have to be considerably modified before it could accommodate supposed psychic effects."²²

Debunking the "Debunkers"

The message to psi theorists seems to be: make your phenomena fit our theories or leave our theories alone.

While most physicists now believe that, in some sense, there is no deep reality and that observation creates reality,²³ there are still a number of ideas that psi theorists advance which simply repulse most mainstream scientists. Some of these ideas are used as foundational premises; some are conclusions. But all are regarded as eccentricities or contradictions of important conventional notions.

For example, requiring information to travel faster than light (superluminal speed) is most unpopular. So is postulating forces (such as ESP) that do not weaken with distance. (This was the principle basis for Einstein's skepticism about psi.²⁴) The idea that all (or the majority) of things in the universe are simultaneously interconnected by some means other than fields is thought to be fanciful. And the common attempt to build "action-at-a-distance" into paranormal explanation is particularly irksome to most physicists. Finally, the reliance by psi theories upon the supposed ability of the human mind to be a factor in the causal chain of physical events is, as yet, too "non-scientific" to accept.

The premises and conclusions of psi theorists which CSICOPs disallow are rejected because they are thought to contradict or distort the principal beliefs of contemporary science. They argue, therefore, that such premises and conclusions are automatically debunked, *prima facie*, on the grounds that sufficient evidence is neither available nor powerful enough to overturn established beliefs.

DEBUNKING THEORY MISCONSTRUCTIONS. According to CSICOPs, psi researchers and ARPR-type metaphysicians are guilty of "magical thinking." By this they mean that they "take correlations or similarities and treat them as cause-and-effect relationships" when they are not. This results in "subjective explanations," and subjective explanations have no predictive power.²⁵ But what science requires are explanations in the form of "conditional lawlike statements: namely, that if a, then b; whenever a is present, b will most likely occur." The charge is that in explanations and theories about psi phenomena, "we don't know what a is, or if it is present that b would occur; b may occur sometimes, but only infrequently."²⁶ Unlicensed skepticism, methodological anarchism, theoretical finagling, or "lousy argument" as found in psi's "pseudoscience" make "astrology as true as astronomy and psychic phenomena as real as subatomic physics."²⁷

Some years ago, a major criticism of psi research was that it was merely the study of anomalies and there was no theory to make sense of them. Predictably, theoretical projects flourished.²⁸ But it is still all wrong, say CSICOPs. For example, some theories rely on new versions of

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

the old proofs for the existence of God, the "argument from design" or the "argument from beauty." Some employ teleological explanations (i.e., attributing "purposes" to nature). Some theories use fictitious entities that have no reference in reality. Some have causation all messed up, making it have to work backwards. Most are inordinately anthropocentric. And, in any event, the terms and structure of psi theories are eccentric, inconsistent, and distort (or violate) what we already know to be true.

In general, since all of these features are objectionable in scientific explanation, psi theories can quite easily be dismissed as of no serious consequence, according to CSICOPs.

This completes our very brief tour through the four debunking chambers in the CSICOP lab. We shall now see if the CSICOP-type of modern science is as immune to debunking as we are led to infer.

DEBUNKING THE DEBUNKERS

The rhetoric and polemics of CSICOP have the overwhelming effect of asking us to believe that mainstream science does not suffer from defects like those in religion, metaphysics, and psi research. After all, it is a widespread cultural aspiration to hope that he who throws the stones is, indeed, without sin. But is that really the case? Are we to assume that it is only psi-thinking that is in error? If so, then there is much to reassess in the evangelical branch of fundamentalist science; and the strategy called "debunking" may get none of us to the promised land. It is the object of this essay to show that what is offered in the name of "debunking" contains the same types of errors as are being debunked and that, as a consequence, when debunking is generalized to discredit an entire field of inquiry, it should not be taken seriously.

COMPARING FRAUD. CSICOP invites us to think that, if fraud is a frequent occurrence in psi research, then the validity of the entire enterprise should be suspect.²⁹ But we note that it is only among "fringe" thinkers that CSICOP looks for fraud. If we find pervasive fraud in mainstream science, should the validity of that entire enterprise be suspect, as well?

Fraud has, indeed, become a highly visible issue in science.³⁰ Recent frauds have cranked out prodigious amounts of falsified reports; but there is almost no way to tell, at present, how pervasive the phenomenon may be. One assumption had been that, through the editorial review procedure, fraud would be detected before publication. But, according to Arnold S. Relman, editor of The New England Journal of Medicine, "...that is not the case. The perpetrator would have to be very inept, very maladroit before his misdeeds would be detected from an editorial review of his manuscript."³¹

Debunking the "Debunkers"

Nor does mainstream science seem to have any fewer or less repugnant motives for fraud than those they attribute to psi researchers: publish-or-perish, promotion, funding, prestige, influence among one's colleagues, recognition--and "psychological problems."

Martin Gardner charges author John Fuller³² with deception for failing to reveal that the brother of the "psychic surgeon" Arigo owned the village pharmacy and local hotel where Arigo's patients filled their prescriptions and lodged--Gardner's intent, presumably, being to establish a motive for Arigo to commit fraud. But nowhere do we see Gardner or his colleagues revealing the possible identical motive for a fraudulent search for fraud by CSICOP because of its chairman's stake in Prometheus Press, which published and sells the main core of CSICOP's skeptical literature. Nor do we see revealed how CSICOP's famous founding member, James Randi,³³ and its numerous member magicians make their livings partly through bookings stimulated by CSICOP and its local chapters.³⁴ If motivations and deception in both cases is genetic, then debunking does not give us a criterion by which to choose between them.

But some CSICOPs soften, slightly, on the fraud question. "Is such cheating more prevalent in parapsychology than in 'orthodox' science?" asks Martin Gardner. "I don't know....My overall impression is that cheating and self-deception are greater in parapsychology than in most sciences, especially the physical sciences, but not by much."³⁵ C.E.M. Hansel comments that "It is unlikely that more than a small number of experiments are affected by cheating."³⁶

To review: (i) CSICOP convinces us of frequent fraud in psi reports; (ii) fraud thrives similarly and for the same reasons in mainstream science; and (iii) CSICOP concedes that fraud may or may not be slightly more prevalent in psi research than in orthodox research.³⁷ So where does this leave us? What has been achieved by debunking--except to stimulate corrections on a case-by-case basis?

To the extent that CSICOPs limit their charges to fraud on a case-by-case basis, they would seem to be on the same safe ground as critics of fraud in mainstream science. But, to the extent that CSICOPs yield to temptation and generalize fraud in an attempt to discredit all of psi research, directly or indirectly, intentionally or inadvertently, they engage not in scientific analysis but in insinuation and innuendo, in polemics and propaganda. On these grounds, debunking must be rejected by any fair mind.

COMPARING ERROR. CSICOP's greatest quarrel with psi researchers concerns methodology on the grounds that no legitimate methodology could produce the results claimed. On this count, their most powerful criticism is that psi results are not repeatable at will by skeptics using correct experimental preparations (and, often, not even by psi

experimenters). The repeatability dilemma, as defined by CSICOPs, is conceded by psi theorists although alternative arguments have been used.³⁸ But is mainstream science clean on this count?

It is not, if H. M. Collins's account is correct. "Positive replications by critics are exceptionally rare events in science," according to Collins. "As we shall see...experiments hardly ever work the first time; indeed, they hardly ever work at all. Thus, any sensible experimenter ought to expect that most of what he or she does in the way of practical activity will be trial and (mostly) error. It will comprise not proper experiments, but one preliminary run after another....Scientists just do not know enough to be able to guarantee that an experiment which looks just like the same as any other is the same in essence."³⁹ This insight is consistent with Gardner Murphy's view that "Replication...when it comes", will be a "fulfillment of a long series of immature fragmentary incomplete replications...until the phenomenon" is so well understood that it creates "for itself a context" in which it can live.⁴⁰

One should not infer that experimental replication is insecure or largely inaccessible in orthodox science as a generally reliable procedure. It is not. Nor does a challenge to replication in science relieve the problems in psi. But if debunking is to be done, then debunk science as well as psi.⁴¹

The problem of replicability is related to problems in choosing methods. Whether the methods for which CSICOPs agitate are suitable to study psi phenomena is a sore point of argument.⁴² CSICOPs would like to impose on psi their understanding of what methods are appropriate--and, to the extent that psi researchers wish the blessing of the mainstream community, this may be a reasonable demand. But the world may not be built to buckle under to methodological monism. CSICOPs shudder at philosopher Paul Feyerabend's proposal for methodological anarchy in science, a form of pluralism in which one statement of a theory may be as correct as another.⁴³ But methodological pluralism finds a staunch analysis and broadly based defense from philosopher and logician Patrick Suppes. "It is not important to emphasize the plurality of methods and the vast difference in methodology of different parts of science," argues Suppes in his chapter "The Plurality of Science." "It is especially the experimental methods of different branches of science that have radically different form."⁴⁴

Suppes is a hard taskmaster and is by no means being permissive toward methodology; nor is he sympathetic to psi research. But he does offer a provocative defense for methodological pluralism that could very well be used to debunk those debunkers who are a bit strident and overbearing about mainstream methodology.

CSICOPs debunk anything that lacks "critical thinking" and is based upon anomalous premises by referring to it as a

Debunking the "Debunkers"

"pseudoscience."⁴⁵ As I sat through the 1986 CSICOP Conference, it was very clear what fundamental assumptions and conclusions CSICOPs found objectionable; but, for the life of me, I could not get any idea at all of exactly what it was that CSICOPs would like us to reject as "uncritical thinking" and "pseudoscience." From the presentations, one gets the idea that there is a manual somewhere which tells one what the criteria are for critical thought and that it would be a simple matter to decide how we are to succeed or fail in this enterprise.

But I have never found that manual. The canons of rationality are far more elusive than that.⁴⁶ In fact, the problem is more confusing than I thought; for I now discover that it is not just religion, mysticism, and parapsychology that are pseudosciences--but most social sciences are suspect. Labeling his work "pseudoscience" and "nonsense," the National Academy of Sciences recently rejected for membership one of the most highly regarded and frequently quoted scientists in the land--a Harvard professor who is currently president of the American Political Science Association. Apparently, this candidate's ideas and lack of "critical thinking ability" resulted in his passing off "political opinion as if it were science" in the eyes of the science fundamentalists.⁴⁷ On similar grounds we suppose that CSICOPs would argue that "uncritical thinking" and "pseudoscience" mark the work of Nobel laureate and Columbia physicist Israel Rabi for his fundamental instinct and motivation that physics "transcended religion. It was the higher truth. It filled me with awe, put me in touch with a sense of original causes. Physics brought me closer to God."⁴⁸ If so, "critical thinking" and "pseudoscience" should be debunked for simply what they are: pejorative slogans used by evangelical CSICOPs to proselytize gullible skeptics.⁴⁹

COMPARING ECCENTRICITY AND THEORY MISCONSTRUCTION. Psi theorists are constantly reprimanded by CSICOPs for taking theory fragments from mainstream science and using them selectively and eccentrically in psi theories. Can orthodox science be debunked on this count, as well, and on its own terms?

First, to have a base to work from here and later, it is useful to sketch the alternative theories about reality now current in quantum mechanics.⁵⁰ One is the Copenhagen interpretation and the "received doctrine" that there is no deep reality. The second is similarly widespread, that reality is created by observation. The third is that reality is undivided wholeness, which many of you will recognize to be the position of physicist David Bohm. The sixth is a form of realism that perseveres, that the world is still made of ordinary objects. The seventh is that consciousness creates reality. And the eighth is that the nature of the world is twofold, consisting of potentials and actualities.

CSICOPs routinely fault psi theorists for grounding their theories selectively on favored principles. This results in the eccentric use of theory components, they say, but this is precisely what has happened as physicists have derived these eight theories of quantum reality.⁵² For example, the first theory takes Heisenberg's Uncertainty Principle as the guiding principle. The second relies upon what is called the "quantum meter option," by which the observer decided which kinds of attributes quantum entities are to possess. The third results from a preoccupation with "phase entanglement," such that there is a physical connectedness between all particles. The fourth and seventh result from addressing "the quantum measurement problem" in particular ways. The fifth responds to the incompatible attributes of quantum events. The sixth holds on to the intuition that, since the reality we know is ordinary, then all quantum facts must also be ordinary. The eighth is grounded in an interpretation of the "proxy wave representation of quantum entities."

Which of these radically different theories is correct no one knows. No one theory can be distinguished from any other, experimentally. Each theory predicts exactly the same events to occur in every quantum experiment. None can be confirmed, and none can be falsified, at present.⁵³ Each theory comes out with terms and structures somewhat different from all others due to the selectivity of their grounding principles, and the theories make contradictory claims about ultimate reality. Is this practice legitimate in mainstream science but "pseudoscience" in psychical research?

But there are other clear cut cases of how selectivity and eccentricity occur in orthodox science. One is when physics filches a theory component from religion and metaphysics, such as the "argument from design" for the existence of God.

One of the most powerful concepts used by physicists in theory construction is "symmetry."⁵⁴ This principle says that there should be a balance and unity in the universe. If there is a negative charge, there must be a positive charge. If there is matter, there must be anti-matter (an intuitive argument from symmetry that, when later confirmed, resulted in a Nobel prize for Paul Dirac). The argument from symmetry is a restatement and secularization of the argument from design; and it was never intended nor has it ever been well suited in theology for explicating relativity theory or quantum mechanics. Surely this is a selective and eccentric use by physicists of a religious and metaphysical theory which has no basis whatsoever in science.

Reinforcing this view, David Schramm, a chaired professor of physics at the University of Chicago, comments that "Less than a decade ago, the kinds of questions that are addressed in physics today would have been considered in the realm of philosophy or theology."⁵⁵ Physicist Ronald Kahn adds that "Beauty and simplicity are the religious

Debunking the "Debunkers"

beliefs of modern physics. The belief that fundamental laws of nature exist rests upon the belief that the universe exhibits a grand design. Religion enters science in the assumption of this grand design--what governs nature is not just a haphazard collection of rules, but one beautiful and simple law."⁵⁶

Science can be debunked similarly for its appeal to the religious, metaphysical, and mystical notions of the "argument from beauty" and of teleological explanations--neither of which have any basis in modern science.⁵⁷

Briefly, on other points: as CSICOPs have debunked psi, so may we point out where debunking is appropriate in mainstream science.

If psi's claims of forces that do not weaken with increases in distance and simultaneous interconnections throughout the universe are bunkum, then so is the quantum theory that reality is an undivided wholeness; for quantum wholeness is "undiminished by spatial and temporal separation....a true mingling of distant beings that reaches across the galaxy as forcefully as it reaches across the garden."⁵⁸

If it is bunkum that certain psi theories require information transfer at superluminal speeds, then all models of quantum reality which fit the quantum facts are bunkum; for, according to Bell's Theorem of non-locality, "any model of reality which fits the quantum facts must possess some means of exchanging information faster than light."⁵⁹

Psi theorists hold the notion that there exists a place for the mind in the causal chain for certain physical events. If this is bunkum, then so is John von Neumann's "wave collapse function" in the quantum theory where consciousness created reality. "Between the measured system itself and the observer's mind stretches a series of intermediate devices...called the von Neumann chain. Solving the measurement problem on von Neumann's terms means finding the location at which nature breaks this chain with a quantum jump....The only unusual link in the von Neumann chain is the link between the observer's brain and the [and????-??] the observer's mind. Here, where the mystery of matter gives way to the mystery of mind, is a privileged position for the elusive quantum jump."⁶⁰

And, finally, psi theories are constantly debunked on the grounds that the world just could not work that way, that their conclusions create too many contradictions, and that they just engage in "magical thinking." All of that may or may not be true. But orthodoxy has the same faults and has no grounds for intimidating psi research. For example, let CSICOPs explain the non-distributive logic in the three-polarizer paradox. Converting the vocabulary from electrons to farm animals, Herbert gives this example: "Suppose we pass [livestock] through a gate which only lets through horses and rejects all cows. Next we pass these

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

horses through a second gate which lets through only black animals and rejects all white ones. Only animals which are both horses and black can pass both gates. To our surprise, approximately half of such animals turn out to be cows."⁶¹

That is about as unintuitive, contradictory, and "magical" as can be imagined. Surely the world does not work that way. But it does, apparently. Psi theorists will have to work hard to match that quantum logic.

In general, we discover mainstream science riddled with contradiction, unverifiable phenomena, data not supported by coherent theories, and theories which can neither be confirmed nor falsified. CSICOPs are, thus, in the indefensible position of asserting that in the mainstream this results in "science" but outside of orthodoxy that it must be "pseudoscience."

It would be comforting to believe that the way psi-thinking is conducted is all in error and that mainstream science is the unequivocally correct standard for truth and knowledge, but this is clearly not the case. Science loses this argument on its own terms. But this leaves us with an empty feeling--one that will not be dispelled by this essay. By debunking the debunkers we surely have not established a single claim of religion, metaphysics, mysticism, or parapsychology. On the other hand, we have discovered on what grounds they should not be rejected.

WHERE IS THE PIKE FOR CSICOP?

I do not see any Odysseus on the horizon. But there is a pike for CSICOP. It is not the mote in the eye of psychical research but the beams in CSICOPs's eyes. CSICOPs are losing their sight. In their frenzied efforts to preserve the fragmentation of their world, they lose their ability to explore and see the relatedness and common possibilities of science and religion, of science and metaphysics, of science and the spirit. As were the logical positivists some time back,⁶² CSICOPs are an endangered species; they represent a large but dying breed of fundamentalist, evangelical, proselytizing, scientistic dogmatists (in the dictionary senses of those terms) being impaled on the horns of their own dilemmas.⁶³

Have we proved anything about debunking? Not really, except that debunking is a negative enterprise that proves no useful, generalized result. It is like throwing stones at sinners: for debunking to work, those who do the debunking in favor of their own position must hold a position that is itself immune to debunking. For, unless the system they offer as a replacement is free of the weaknesses they criticize, what motive is there to adopt it? On those grounds, CSICOPs can no more discredit psychical research as a legitimate field of inquiry than psi theorists can discredit CSICOP and mainstream science. There has to be a better way to get into the promised land.

Debunking the "Debunkers"

Fortunately, there is; but to see it requires for the moment a methodological pluralism that is difficult to fit into the world view of science. It requires the recognition that science, mankind's greatest creation, describes only a part of human experience--and a small part, at that. In man's frailty, he still must use different yardsticks to measure the important things: truth; wisdom; and the values, qualities, and aspirations of his life. It also requires the recognition that not everything need aspire to approval by science to be true or useful. The important relationships between truth, knowledge, psychical research, and spirit--as have been the themes of this Conference--are not given by any scientific principle we would recognize today.

¹This essay is not intended to defend the claims of parapsychology, religion, or mysticism. Such claims may be, or may not be, correct. But there are both well grounded and poorly grounded criticisms of those claims. The goal, here, is to reject the type of enterprise called "debunking" on the grounds that what is offered as a standard of comparison or a replacement to explanatory systems in psi research contains the same types (but not necessarily the same tokens) of error as is being debunked.

²I am indebted to my colleagues in the Philosophy Department at Columbia University for their inadvertent stimulation to prepare this essay.

³Book IX of The Odyssey or Robert Graves, The Greek Myths, Vol. 2 (New York: Penguin Books, 1960), pp. 355-7.

⁴CSICOP is chaired by Paul Kurtz. Its Fellows include Isaac Asimov, Anthony Flew, Martin Gardner, Murray Gell-Mann, James Randi, W. V. Quine, Carl Sagan, and B. F. Skinner.

⁵First, I should disclose that I am a member of CSICOP and that I applaud those substantive results it has achieved which I regard as reasonable and useful. I regard the activities of CSICOP which result from what I think are its highest purposes to be of great assistance to metaphysical inquiries of all kinds. Clearly, this essay is about those activities and attitudes which I do not believe can be so classified. Secondly, I must also disclose that I am an academic member of ARPR and a (relatively inactive) life member of Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship [SFF]. I believe that the general intentions of SFF are worthy. I suggest, however, that organizations such as SFF score poorly for not paying sufficient attention to their critics and, thereby, for not enriching their own world views.

⁶E.g., as when the American Association for the Advancement of Science made parapsychological research a division.

⁷A particularly pungent attack is that of John Wheeler. See Martin Gardner's version of this issue: "Quantum Theory and Quack Theory," in Science: Good, Bad, and Bogus (Buffalo, NY: Prometheus Books, 1981), pp. 185-206.

⁸Paul Kurtz, "Debunking, Neutrality, and Skepticism in Science," in Kendrick Frazier, Science Confronts the Paranormal Buffalo, NY: Prometheus Books, 1986, p. 7. To be fair, there are alternative views about methods to be pursued, but debunking is what CSICOP is now best known for.

⁹John Wheeler recalls this point in his "Drive the Pseudos Out of the Workshop of Science," in Martin Gardner's Science: Good, Bad, and Bogus, op. cit., p. 191.

¹⁰I confine my compliment to those cases in which fraud has actually been a factor and not to those where fraud has simply been inferred as the most parsimonious explanation of the paranormal claim, the latter seeming always to be a temptation to CSICOPS.

¹¹CSICOP delighted in the fact that Geller was a magician to begin with and, presumably, could be counted on to employ deception, routinely. Aside from James Randi's exposes (noted later), a new critique is Ben Harris, Gellerism Revealed, published by Micky Hades International, P.O. Box 242, Seattle, WA 98111.

¹²A sampling of real and alleged fraudulent practices may be found in Martin Gardner, op. cit.; Paul Kurtz, A Skeptic's Handbook of Parapsychology. Buffalo, N.Y.: Prometheus Books, 1985. pp. 177-359; James Randi, Flim Flam Psychics, ESP, Unicorns and other Delusions and The Truth about Uri Geller. Buffalo, N.Y.: Prometheus Books, 1982. and R.A. McConnell, "Fraud in Parapsychology" in Readings in the Philosophical Problems of Parapsychology, ed. by Anthony Flew. Buffalo, N.Y.: Prometheus Books, 1987.

¹³C.E.M. Hansel, ESP and Parapsychology: A Critical Re-evaluation. Buffalo, N.Y.: Prometheus Books, 1980. p. 308.

¹⁴Ibid., p. 309

¹⁵Paul Kurtz, "Debunking, Neutrality, and Skepticism in Science," in Kendrick Frazier, Science confronts the Paranormal, op. cit., p. 5.

¹⁶See James E. Alcock, "Parapsychology's Past Eight Years," in Kendrick Frazier, Science Confronts the Paranormal, op. cit., p. 25; also David Marks and Richard Kammann, The Psychology of the Psychic, Buffalo, NY: Prometheus Books, 1980, p. 4.

¹⁷Two elaborations on these criticisms are in Christopher Scott, "Why Parapsychology Demands a Skeptical Response," and Paul Kurtz, "Is Parapsychology a Science," both in Paul Kurtz, A Skeptic's Handbook of Parapsychology, op. cit., pp. 497-518.

¹⁸The phrase and critique about "critical thinking" was emphasized repeatedly during the 1986 CSICOP Conference in Boulder, CO. The futile pursuit of the improbable is what physicist Richard Feynman calls "cargo-cult science," a phrase derived from South Sea Islanders who, having benefited from them during World War II, still wait for cargo planes to arrive with good things for them. In Richard Feynman, "Surely You're Joking, Mr. Feynman!" New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1985, p. 340.

Debunking the "Debunkers"

¹⁹Hansel, op. cit., p. 314; Gardner, op. cit., p. 190; Marks and Kammann, op. cit., p. 2.

²⁰Representative of this is Martin Gardner's "Quantum Theory and Quack Theory," op. cit., pp. 185-206.

²¹Presumably, CSICOPS would be indignant at such conclusions as Rhea A. White is willing to draw from these quantum facts. White, the editor of the Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research, cites Freeman J. Dyson to say that "mind and consciousness may have an equal status with matter and energy in the design of the universe" and Roger S. Jones to say that he rejects "the myth of reality as external to the human mind." White's own position "when you take the findings of all three areas--physics, transpersonal psychology, and parapsychology--is that, in a sense, we are the experiment, and what our data reveal is up to us--it is literally an integral act of creation." This would constitute eccentric uses of quantum theory at its "worst." See the 1985 Annual Conference Proceedings, The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research, Exploration in Psycho-Spiritual Transformation, pp. 56-71.

²²But, ever the "statesman" skeptic, Gell-Mann said that if quantum events can be affected by psi, then "it is a major revolution in physics....I for one shed no tears if it turns out that there is a major modification of this kind in physics. I think it would be very amusing." The Skeptical Inquirer, Vol. XI, No 1., Fall, 1986, p. 9.

²³Nick Herbert, Quantum reality: Beyond the New Physics New York: Anchor Press, 1987, p. 26.

²⁴According to Martin Gardner in "Quantum Theory and Quack Theory," op. cit., p. 187.

²⁵David Marks and Richard Kammann, op. cit., p. 175.

²⁶Paul Kurtz, "Is Parapsychology a Science." op. cit., p. 510. There will be no opportunity in the scope of this modest essay to review the breakdown in the "received view" of Carl Hempel's "covering law" models of explanation (i.e., the deductive-nomological and inductive-statistical models) nor to examine the candidate replacement models, such as Wesley Salmon's probabilistic-causal model. Hempel's D-N and I-S models cannot explain the irreducible statistical events of quantum physics. And, since quantum mechanics is conceived as indeterministic, Salmon's causal model has major problems. Then, there is great doubt that conditional statements, as Paul Kurtz here offers, have truth conditions. If they possess conditional probabilities instead of truth conditions, then some properties of logical operations used in scientific explanations (such as transitivity) fail, or are at least in jeopardy. See Carl G. Hempel, Aspects of Scientific Explanation New York: The Free Press, 1965; Ernest Nagel, The Structure of Science: Problems in the Logic of Scientific Explanation Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing Company, 1979; Wesley C. Salmon, Scientific Explanation and the Causal Structure of the World Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984; and Ernest Adams, The Logic of Conditionals: An Application of Probability to Deductive Logic Dordrecht: D. Reidel Publishing Company, 1975.

27Paul Kurtz, "Debunking, Neutrality, and Skepticism," op. cit., p. 10 and Stephen Jay Gould, in The Skeptical Inquirer, Vol. XI, no. 1, Fall 1986, pp. 14-15.

28Noting the distasteful features of psi theories, Martin Gardner demurs: "I find myself in full agreement with J. B. Rhine and other parapsychologists who regard the lack of a physical theory as no obstacle whatever to the acceptance of psi....The history of science swarms with observed phenomena that were genuine but had to wait for centuries until a good theory explained them." See "The Extraordinary Metal Bending of Professor Taylor," in Science: Good, Bad, and Bogus, op. cit., p. 183. But this view is not universal. Regarding data showing the possibility that neutrinos could be magnetic, John Bahcall of the Institute for Advanced Study at Princeton said "he would believe the new data when a theory made them seem plausible." In "New Theory on Neutrinos Challenges the Old," New York Times, December 18, 1986, p. B25.

29This is not a conclusion forced by their formal arguments but is one that results from the way in which they go about their mission. The entire effort of "debunking psi" to the media on grounds of trickery and fraud is to criticize and discredit psi phenomena not only on a case-by-case basis but as a general field of inquiry. This points up the conflict between the scientific-analytic mission CSICOP asserts it has and the propagandistic role it plays to perpetuate its own survival.

30A current example is that "One of the nation's most influential researchers in the field of mental retardation treatment has reported on experiments that were never carried out and published deliberately deceptive scientific papers...[These] have had a significant impact of drug treatments used to control the behavior of severely retarded patients in institutions throughout the country....[His work] has had great influence on the treatment of patients and on public policy." In "U.S. Study Finds Frauds in Top Researcher's Work on Mentally Retarded," New York Times, 24 May 1987, p. 16. Martin Gardner recounts some of the history of fraud in science in "Great Fakes of Science," Science: Good, Bad, and Bogus, op. cit., pp. 123-31.

31From a general review of the issue by John Holmes, "Cure Sought for Doctored Research," Insight: The Washington Times, March 23, 1987, pp. 56-7. The ultimate safeguard in orthodox science, of course, is supposed to be that fraudulent experiments will fall by the wayside when they fail to be duplicated. This assumption is anything but reassuring if one takes seriously certain ideas in the sociology of science; e.g., H. M. Collins, Changing Order: Replication and Induction in Scientific Practice. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications, 1985.

32John G. Fuller, Arigo: Surgeon of the Rusty Knife New York, N.Y.: Crowell, 1974).

33If one subscribes to the conspiracy theory of new inquiry (as CSICOP often seems to do), then an additional motive for Randi to find Fraud by "investigating those who claim paranormal powers"--whether or not it exists--is to justify his recent honor of being awarded the prestigious MacArthur Fellowship. The plot thickens when there is "motive" to commit fraud by exposing fraud.

Debunking the "Debunkers"

³⁴This comes to my attention through an interesting article by George P. Hanson, "CSICOP and Skepticism: An Emerging Social Movement," available from Psychophysical Research Laboratories, 301 College Road East, Princeton, NJ 18540.

³⁵"Great Fakes of Science," Science: Good, Bad and Bogus, op. cit., pp. 129-30.

³⁶GSP and Parapsychology, op. cit., p. 308.

³⁷This concession should provide little comfort to psi theorists; for it is the combination of fraud, error, and chance which, for CSICOPs, accounts for all reported psi results and that there is no legitimate remainder. Of course, error is where one finds it; but where one finds it depends upon one's starting point. This more troublesome issue requires a different line of argument than that in this essay, one more appropriate to the defense of psi.

³⁸Gardner Murphy presented the psi point of view in "The Problem of Repeatability in Psychical Research," Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research, 60 (1971) reprinted in Anthony Flew, Readings in the Philosophical Problems of Parapsychology, op. cit., pp. 254-70.

³⁹H. M. Collins, Changing Order: Replication and Induction in Scientific Practice, op. cit., pp. 35-41, *passim*.

⁴⁰Gardner Murphy, op. cit., p. 266.

⁴¹For a discussion of more sophisticated philosophical problems, see Nancy Cartwright, How the Laws of Physics Lie Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1983.

⁴²An example may be that of psychiatrist Ian Stevenson, who does not claim that his evidence "proves" reincarnation in any mainstream scientific sense. But it is equally clear that his evidence cannot be explained by fraud, imagination, or distorted memory. I, for one, am not inclined to argue that psi is a "scientific" finding. That is because psi, to the extent that it may exist, must still be regarded as a fickle matter of consciousness and human performance, not of some hard-wired psychophysical process to be revealed in everyone like the functions of rods and cones in color perception. Clearly, I cannot hold that scientific method is presently capable of capturing in its net the essential features of conscious experience. But that should be of little concern. The human race can do very nicely by reading other maps; and there is hardly anything to commend the superiority of science alone as a way to truth and knowledge, except relatively crass and impoverished judgments about human existence.

⁴³See Against Method: Outline of an Anarchistic Theory of Knowledge (London: NLB, 1975). Philosopher and logician Harry Kyburg, Jr., complicates the matter even more for CSICOPs by showing how to convert one theory into an equivalent but different theory with different structure and different primitive terms but with the same observational consequences. He gives "a recipe for constructing a theory for a given observational domain, observationally equivalent to a given theory which exhibits your favorite theoretical structure and employs as theoretical terms your favorite theoretical terms"--a technique many

psi theorists may delight in. See "How to Make Up a Theory" in The Philosophical Review, LXXXVII, no. 1 (January 1978), pp. 84-7.

⁴⁴Probabilistic Metaphysics Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1984, p. 124. Suppes also argues that "there will be no unity of science at the level of brain and mind....It is this line of argument that makes psychology as fundamental a science as physics....We will not reduce mental events to characterization in purely behavioristic terms. We depend on behavioristic evidence about mental events, but this evidence does not provide adequate defining conditions.... [because of the stability of biological systems that is often missing in physical systems], perhaps in the next century we will come to think of psychology as being a better predictive science than physics." pp. 133-4.

⁴⁵It is not quite clear how CSICOPs would respond to physicist John Wheeler's idea that "There may be no such thing as the 'glittering central mechanism of the universe' to be seen behind a glass wall at the end of the trail. Not machinery but magic may be the better description of the treasure that is waiting." In Nick Herbert, Quantum Reality, infra., p. 29.

⁴⁶According to Robert J. Sternberg, the IBM Professor of Psychology and Education at Yale University, "Effective critical thinking...must scuttle the tendency to think of every issue in terms of choosing the 'correct' one of two options....What students learn from a good course on critical thinking is how to approach deep and complex problems in deep and complex ways." So much for CSICOPs's formulaic jingoism. See "Thinking Critically," New York Times, February 24, 1987, p. C9.

⁴⁷"Prominent Harvard Scholar Barred by Science Academy," New York Times, April 29, 1987, p. 1.

⁴⁸John S. Rigden, Rabi New York: Basic Books, 1987. There are numerous examples like Rabi; but the flip side of the critical-thinking argument might be Gottlieb Frege. As the founder of formal logic and as one whose ideas still dominate theories of meaning and language, we should expect his critical thinking abilities to be unobjectionable. Unfortunately, his life was flawed by his analysis of human anthropology and social matters, resulting in anti-Semitism and other positions most CSICOPs would find uncritically thought out, pseudoscientific, and seriously objectionable.

⁴⁹One should not infer that I intend to deprecate "critical thinking." Quite the opposite; I have written a series of texts explicitly to teach such skills. But debunking debunkers is different than defending a position of rationality and science.

⁵⁰There are a variety of sources that might be cited; for convenience, however, I shall draw principally from a recent account by Nick Herbert, Quantum Reality: Beyond the New Physics. Garden City, NY: Anchor Books, 1987, pp. chaps. 2, 9, 10, and 13. We shall assume this will be acceptable to CSICOPs since one of their Fellows is quoted in promoting the book.

⁵¹For the logical development of a plural-universe theory by a philosopher and modal realist, see Daavid Lewis, On the Plurality of Worlds Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986).

Debunking the "Debunkers"

⁵²Ibid., paraphrasing pp. 196-7.

⁵³While there are crucial differences between how physicists and psi researchers discriminate for and against grounding principles and while these differences may weaken the force of this example somewhat, the intent is to point up the context in which selectivity and eccentricity do exist in both camps--though perhaps in different ways. The essential point here is that these eight theories can be neither confirmed nor falsified so we must conclude, given the way the debunkers treat psi theories, that they are hatched up by crackpots having lapses in "critical thinking" and constitute "pseudoscience" of the most flagrant kind.

⁵⁴For recent explications see Heinz R. Pagels, Perfect Symmetry New York: Simon and Schuster, 1986); A. Zee, Fearful Symmetry New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1987; and Michio Kaku and Jennifer Trainer, Beyond Einstein: The Cosmic Quest for the Theory of the Universe New York: Bantam Books, 1987.

⁵⁵"Before the Big Bang," a review of Heinz Pagels's Perfect Symmetry in the New York Times Book Review, p. 15.

⁵⁶"The Threshold of God's Thoughts," a review of A. Zee's Fearful Symmetry in The New York Times Book Review, p. 18. See also James Gleick, "Science on the Track of God," New York Times Magazine, p. 22. To sociologist Emile Durkheim is attributed the observation that "The great service that religions have rendered to thought is that they have constructed a first representation of what these intelligible relationships between things might be....It is less important to succeed than to try."

⁵⁷For the argument from beauty, see Gerald Holton, The Advancement of Science, and its Burdens: The Jefferson Lecture and Other Essays Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986 and K. C. Cole, Sympathetic Vibrations: Reflections on Physics as a Way of Life New York: Bantam Books, 1987. Several physicists are beginning to develop what I interpret as teleological explanations. For a popular account of John Wheeler, see Reader's Digest, September 1986, p. 110: "the concept of a universe is meaningless unless there's a community of thinkers to observe it, and that community is impossible unless the universe is adapted from the start to give rise to life and mind."

⁵⁸Nick Herbert, op. cit., p. 19.

⁵⁹Nick Herbert, op. cit., p. 244. At a recent conference in New York, the confusions, contradictions, and head-in-the-sand avoidance of quantum reality were debated. "Do physicists therefore believe that in the last analysis, nothing is real? 'Most physicists,' said Dr. Fritz Rohrlich of Syracuse University, develop a somewhat schizophrenic view. On one hand they accept the standard interpretation of quantum theory, including the epistemological irreducibility of system and observer. On the other they insist on the reality of quantum systems even when these are not observed.' In Dr. Mermin's view [of Cornell University], however, physicists fall into three categories. The first, a minority, is troubled by the philosophical implications of the E.P.R. paper and Dr. Bell's theorem. The second group is not troubled by such issues, Dr. Mermin says, because its members have devised explanations that tend either to miss the point entirely or to contain

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

physical assertions that can be shown to be false.' The last Group is not troubled by the philosophical problems of quantum theory, but members refuse to say why they are not troubled. Their position is unassailable,' Dr. Mermin adds." In "Quantum Theory: Disturbing Questions Remain Unresolved," New York Times, February 11, 1986, p. C3.

⁶⁰Nick Herbert, op. cit., pp. 190-1.

⁶¹Nick Herbert, Quantum Reality, op. cit., p. 185.

⁶²See Fredrick Suppe, "Swan Song for Positivism," in his book The Structure of Scientific Theories, 2nd ed. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1977.

⁶³Thankfully, there are more level heads among CSICOPs. See "Explaining Rather Than Debunking," The Skeptical Inquirer, Fall 1986, p. 6.

Charles F. Adams is President of the Taeria Foundation. His address is 5814 Mosholu Ave., Riverdale, N.Y. 10471.

INTUITIVE AWARENESS

Marcia Rose Emery

Effective functioning requires both intellect and intuition for decision making and problem solving. This paper highlights intuitive abilities which are creative right-brain hemisphere functions. After presenting selected ramifications of intuition, this paper focuses on proper mind and body set necessary to elicit right brain imagery and relates the intuitive process to research studies conducted in ESP.

We will begin with several questions. Have you ever labored hard and long for an exciting beginning for a paper or presentation? Have you ever waited for a client, friend or associate to show up for an appointment when they were already twenty or more minutes late? Did you nervously wonder where they were? Have you ever lost something like your keys, glasses, or wallet that you searched for endlessly? Pause a moment to reflect on the anxiety or annoyance you have experienced while you looked for your glasses or wondered whether your dinner guest would show. Or recall your waste paper basket filled with your ill fated beginnings.

The good news is that you no longer have to expend energy, emotion and, most importantly, precious time in unproductive pursuits. You could easily use your intuitive ability to create an exciting beginning, "see" why the delay was caused, find your wallet and even signal to the waiting party that you will be arriving shortly. Of course, I use the work "easily" tongue in cheek since developing your intuitive ability is often akin to arousing the sleepy giant part of yourself.

Helping others with their intuitive development and presenting material on intuitive awareness is challenging. For it is difficult to embrace the intuitive concept simply by using words or figures. In addition to telling about the intuitive experience, I would like to use experience to present what intuition is symbolically and graphically through experience.

INTUITION IS A CLEAR KNOWING. How or why we know is unclear. The simple truth is that suddenly we know and have renewed confidence in making a right decision. For example, have you ever walked to the telephone to call your friend when the phone rang and you simply knew she was already on the line calling you? Did you suddenly feel anxious about a relative and simply know she was being rushed to the hospital? Can you think about your best friend and realize there are many occasions where both of you know what the other will say or do? Using your intuitive abilities helped you immediately think of a friend in need, realize someone was hurt, or even solve a nagging problem. The clear

knowing so characteristic of intuition, allows you to feel confident that the right choice was made.

Carl Jung, characterized intuition as the function that "explores the unknown, and senses possibilities and implications which may not be readily apparent." (Von Franz & Hillman, 1971) A good example of an intuitive choice is given by Jung in his memoirs (1965). Uncertain as to his medical field of specialization, he writes: "My excitement was intense, for it had become clear to me, in a flash of illumination, that for me the only possible goal was psychiatry."

Webster's definition echoes the "clear knowing" theme by referring to the direct knowing or learning of something without the conscious use of reasoning but rather by immediate apprehension or understanding. Intuition comes from the Latin verb "intueri" translated as looking or knowing from within. I translate the word into inner(in) teaching(tuition). This implies that all the "inside information" or answers necessary for decision-making come from within.

I can recall several professional people vigorously protesting my labeling them as intuitive, but readily admitting to having hunches or gut feelings. Confusion reigns when various terms are used interchangeably with intuition. All involve the same process of receiving inner knowledge for guidance. Have you ever said, "I should have listened to my gut feeling and not hired him for the job?" How about: "I have a hunch that the house will finally sell?" You may have even used the word premonition to describe your nagging feeling that an accident was imminent. It is not uncommon to hear the members of a business firm bragging about their business acumen because they know when to make the right bid. In many diverse settings, emphasis is placed on right brain development to foster greater creativity and entrepreneurial zeal. (Armstrong, 1985, Hurley, 1986, and McKean, 1985).

LEFT BRAIN OR RIGHT BRAIN

Some twenty years ago Dr. Roger Sperry and his associates (1968, 1969) conducted their research at the California Institute of Technology as they delved into the different functions between the left and right hemispheres of the brain. They coined the term left brain to describe the hemisphere responsible for the analytical, logical, verbal and reasoning processes. In contrast, the right brain hemisphere was discovered to be the seat of the intuitive, creative, inspirational, and innovative faculties. Unlike the verbal left brain, the right brain is non-verbal.

In the following years, many research scientists questioned the "two-brain myth" and continued to debate the exact location of these contrasting functions (Deutsch & Springer, 1985). Most articulate has been Jerre Levy, one

Intuitive Awareness

of the original Sperry collaborators, currently a biopsychologist at the University of Chicago. (Psychology Today, May 1985). Unimpressed, she complains of being "Sick of people making piles of money on data that never came out of a lab." (Discover, April 1985).

L-MODE OR R-MODE? Betty Edwards, author of the popular Drawing on the Right Side of the Brain (1979) and the recent sequel Drawing on the Artist Within (1986) directs the Center for the Educational Applications of Brain Hemisphere Research, popularly known as the "Brain-Ed Center" in Long Beach, California. In all the research emanating from the Center, Dr. Edwards stresses the general agreement showing two major modes which are fundamentally different from one another. Throughout this presentation, I will follow the precedent set by Dr. Edwards and use the terms L-mode and R-mode to designate the difference between these two ways of processing information, regardless of location in the individual brain.

Throughout the years, statistic makers used figures to describe a "left mode majority" with underdeveloped right modes. This fact is not astonishing since most people are rewarded for using their verbal skills at work and school. Look back at your schooling and academic training and recall how classes emphasized verbal reasoning, logic and, analytic skills. Courses in imagination, intuition, inventiveness, visualization, and creativity were rare, except for an occasional elective course in art, shop, or creative writing. In fact, the recent emphasis on right mode skills has been healthy in promoting awareness of the need for input from both modes of functioning. Effective functioning utilizes input from the logical left and intuitive right. Consequently, the predominantly left mode person can apply more originality, creativity, and innovation to problem solving. The right mode person, in turn, will feel more confident balancing a checkbook or submitting written job applications.

Many people do, in fact, function with "under-developed" R-modes. Unfortunately, their imaginative, intuitive, and creative abilities are dormant. Can you imagine having to write a proposal or a letter to a relative containing the same stale ideas? For example, if you were searching for a compelling and innovative speech introduction, you might tap the R-mode to see or picture the captivating beginning. Then, the L-mode would easily supply the words needed to communicate this image. As the R-mode is used more frequently, you will have leaps of insight and simply "know" the correct answer to any dilemma, for example, or even know how to start your speech with ease and interest.

I would like to make several clarifications about the interaction between the L and R modes. These two cognitive modes communicate principally through a connecting cable of nerve fibers called the corpus callosum. In this way, the two distinct views of reality can be reconciled within the

The Academy of Religion and Psychological Research

person. Effective functioning as already mentioned, utilizes both the L-mode intellect and R-mode intuition for improved decision making and problem solving.

INTUITION AND LOGIC. I have often heard people equate intuition to a logical skill that is predicated on past experience. A recent book by Weston Agor, titled, The Logic of Intuitive Decision Making (1986) illustrates this tendency. I have talked to many professionals working with the concept of intuition such as Frances Vaughan, author of Awakening Intuition (1979) and parapsychologist, Alan Vaughan author of Edge of Tomorrow (1982) who dispute this view. We may find it difficult to conceive of intuition as a logical skill since intuition bypasses logic to provide innovative leaps where new and untried solutions are presented. This confusion was also perpetuated in a recent issue of Psychology Today (July 1986). The article titled "The Hit Parade" had a lead-in subtitle stating that the risky business of picking winners in the entertainment and publishing fields often relies on a combination of experience, intuition, and luck. Agor is quoted "I see intuition as a very logical skill which is the product of real-life experience, of working with one's own self, of good training and education--all divided by insecurity and the fear of being replaced." This notion of viewing intuition as a way of drawing on past experience and hard data negates using intuition to explore the unknown and sense new possibilities as Carl Jung suggested in his definition. To put this issue of the logic of intuition in perspective, I return to our challenge for effective functioning which does draw on past experience albeit from the L-mode combined with the visionary insightful propensities of the R-mode. I might add that the two letters I sent to the Psychology Today Editors setting forth this distinction were refused due to "space needs" in the magazine.

TERMS RELATED TO INTUITION

Perhaps you are wondering why I am expending so much time and energy on defining intuition. The revival of intuition in recent years is like going into an old suitcase to find an old suit of clothes that fits the contemporary scene. As I continue to look into this travel case, I see similar attire that can enhance our understanding of the intuitive concept. And addressing the garb of creativity, psi (parapsychological) and even spirituality, will help us probe deeply into the meaning of the intuitive concept.

CREATIVITY AND INTUITION. As you listen to the following description, select what you consider to be key concepts representing the intuitive process.

This individual whose mind is stored with impressions, is caught up with an idea or problem that defies solution, despite prolonged study. A period of uneasiness or distress often ensues. Suddenly, without conscious volition, the mind is focused and a moment of insight occurs, often reported to be a profoundly moving experience.

Intuitive Awareness

Did any of you suspect that I wasn't necessarily describing the exclusive properties of an intuitive person? In fact, I was citing a description of the creative individual given by Betty Edwards in her latest book Drawing on the Artist Within (1986). I certainly could have been describing the intuitive individual. Creativity and intuition both emanate from the R perceptual mode and share the common property of instigating novel and original ideas, insights, inventions, or discoveries. When the end product can't be imagined from the existing facts or materials, the creative and intuitive mind provide the unique outcome.

Two distinguishing features have helped my separate these closely related processes: Let's focus on creative thought which provides unique avenues for exploration. The creative thought is presented to you after receiving intuition from the highly evolved "cosmic mind." Intuition flows into you as energy: your creativity is an expression of that energy. The intuition comes to you as energy while the creativity is used to change your environment in some unique form. Your intuitive mind inspires creativity. You can see the result of your creation in an ingenious introduction to a report, a different way to express gratitude or even in an attractive table setting. For example, the flash about transforming your living room is easily accomplished by placing just a few bright colored pillows in the right spot.

Another difference between these close R-mode cousins pertains to the locus of perceptual focus. Betty Edwards, for example, teaches creative drawing by having people see things "differently" in their outer world. Intuitively, we are seeing things differently in our inner world through the symbolic representations presented by the R-Mode. Insight, for example, used synonymously with intuition, refers to seeing something that is not necessarily visible, such as grasping or apprehending a concept. The "AHA" that we capture by "getting the picture" in our inner mind contrasts to putting those ideas into motion when we manipulate the outer environment. How many times have you said, "I see it now" when the germ or essence of the idea was perceptible solely to you?

In fact, as we examine the steps of creativity described by several noted authors (Getzel, 1980; Arieti, 1977; Rowan, 1986; Wonder and Donovan, 1984; and Edwards, 1986) we see the working interrelationship between the R- and L-modes. During the preparation phase, the L-mode gathers information, defines the problem and the goals. The disciplining L-mode comes to focus in the concentration phase but soon gives way to the R-mode with immersion in the project. In the incubation phase, the R-mode is sifting and sorting the various parts of the problem into a coherent whole. The R-mode continues to be in charge and supplies any necessary imagery to produce the sudden intuitive awareness. Finally, the valuation phase, the L-mode

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

assesses the practicality and the necessary steps needed to implement the intuitive idea.

Techniques for accessing the inner intuitive tool known as imagery will be presented in what follows.

PSI AND INTUITION Dr. Douglas Dean, a well known parapsychologist, studied how executives utilized their intuitive processes in decision-making. The results on a ten year study, described in his book Executive ESP (1974), showed how top executives relied on "gut feelings" to make unpredictable and unexpected decisions. Aside from these important findings, the public's attention was drawn to the term ESP and, of course, parapsychology, or as 'we know them today, psi processes.

PARAPSYCHOLOGY is considered to be the experimental investigation in laboratory settings of psychic phenomena. Also known as psi, this is the formal study of the interactions between individuals (and animals) and their external environment which occur under conditions precluding participation of the sensorimotor system. Stripped of technical jargon, this means you can find out about the world without using your familiar five senses or any motor skills. For example, someone may tell you who will win the ball game next week and predict the exact score. No one provided any of the information before the game through any of the "normal" avenues of sight and hearing.

The familiar term ESP refers to Extra Sensory Perception. ESP is used to go beyond the five senses for increased awareness about people and events in the environment. The functions of ESP also known as "Extended Sense Perception" consist of Telepathy or mind to mind communication; Clairvoyance or clear seeing of distant events; and Precognition or knowing about future events before they occur. Many people will comfortably use the term intuition, but deny having any ESP, psychic, or (as expressed in the current vernacular), channeling experiences. These terms have a negative connotation to the person who thinks a special power is associated with these abilities.

ESP is only one-third of the psi story. Another part is Psychokinesis (PK) or "extra-motor" abilities such as bending spoons without physical energy expended. The last psi area, called Survival continues to amass research documentation to show that survival after physical death is indeed real.

ESP AND INTUITION. The focus in this presentation is to show the intimate relationship between intuition and ESP. Intuition is a broader term; ESP spells out the operations. ESP has been scientifically demonstrated through laboratory research. To put these two terms together, I remind you of our earlier definition focusing on intuition as a clear knowing about people and events in your environment. ESP, then can be considered another name for intuition and specifically shows how we arrived at the intuitive informa-

Intuitive Awareness

tion. You can use your ESP to telepathically send your spouse a message to call home. Clairvoyantly, the queasy feeling in the pit of your stomach can be related to the ongoing chaos at your office some 50 miles away. Precognitively, you may sense an impending car accident after seeing this mishap in a dream.

Alan Vaughan, acknowledged to be the most successful predictor by the Central Premonitions Registry, responded to my question about the difference between intuition and ESP. In a personal correspondence (1984) he said, "Intuition includes ESP but is a broader (and vaguer) term. When one is operating in the real world and not in the lab or under controlled conditions, it is easier to call it intuition--since you don't know for certain that normal or logical explanations can be excluded." For example, I may anticipate that 25 people will attend my workshop. It is difficult to say if this is an accurate precognition or clever logic at work based on past experience. Since I have no reason to estimate how many will actually arrive based on past or present experience, I call my estimate "intuition".

Back to Dr. Dean and his Executive ESP research. The use of intuition in decision making is further clarified by a passage in the book describing the initial research goal. (Dean, 1974, p. 35).

Why not probe the intuitive decision from the perspective of parapsychology? Intuition is an emblematic sort of word that catches together many processes. Yet no matter how you view it, intuition involves knowing, apart from logic, how something is going to work out in the future.

Parapsychological research has provided such strong research evidence to support the manifestation of our intuitive abilities. Some of this work will be touched upon briefly in a later portion of this essay. I am still astounded that some current researchers negate this view. Agor, in his recent book (1986) presents an agenda for future research. His suggestion to the reader is:

take as your working hypothesis that intuition is simply a rational and logical brain skill that can be used to help guide decision making. It is not paranormal. Allow your mind to imagine the possibility that hard science has not yet developed the ability to quantify step-by-step how this process in fact works, but that this capability will be developed sometime during the balance of this century.

Though this view is cited in Agor's book, according to the reference Laurence Sprecher suggested this view of intuition in a letter to the editor in Public Management (February 1983). My sentiments are diametrically opposed. I suggest we consider the superb research findings emanating from the psi laboratories these past 26 years since psi was

legitimated as a burgeoning science during its affiliation with the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) on December 27, 1970. As the popular saying goes, "We've come a long way, Baby" and the challenge remains to consolidate findings and eliminate redundant terminology. Perhaps when that is accomplished, I would not have to spend so much time defining intuition, considering overlapping terms, and comparing it to related processes.

And to those that decry psi research because of insufficient scientific validity, I can only remind them of William James poignant advice to his colleagues in 1896, "If you wish to upset the law that all crows are black...it is enough if you prove one single crow to be white." Despite the cynicism from others, psi research continues, and among its probings, helps us learn more about the intuitive mind.

SPIRITUALITY AND INTUITION. To gain perspective on the interrelationship between these two realms, I want to go back some 2500 years to hear Aristotle admonish his followers to "know thyself." Since those words were spoken, man has created various philosophical and psychological theories to explain behavior. Most formulations seemed inadequate to describe the complex inner nature of man or woman. For example, the theories failed to penetrate deep enough to answer questions like "who are you?" and "Why are you here?" As man continues the quest for self-understanding, insights into his "raison d'etre" have come intuitively by turning to the God or Christ within. To be spiritually aware, contact with the all knowing mind of God is paramount. To go to the oldest source book of all, the Bible, we find Elijah discovering that the "still, small voice" was the voice of God himself as supreme guidance and wisdom (I Kings 19:12). The still small voice is obviously your intuitive power from the highest source of all. With this framework, intuition and spirituality are indivisible. Frances Vaughan, a trans-personal psychologist, reminds us that "intuitively knowing who we are gives us more authenticity." (Awakening Intuition, 1979). To be authentic is, of course, to be true to ourselves by pursuing realistic work goals, compatible family undertakings and enjoyable recreational activities. So, broadly speaking, all intuitive power emanates from the supreme power and is, of course, spiritual.

LEVELS OF INTUITIVE ABILITY. There is another context for understanding the spiritual dimension of intuition. Frances Vaughan (1979) refers to this level of intuitive experience along with three other levels: the physical, emotional and mental. I will add a fifth level from my research which focuses on environmental cues that signal us about impending events.

The physical level is easy to apprehend as you recall your body providing the intuitive cue in the form of some sensation. Some people may say "my ears tingle" or "I feel a pricking in my thumbs." I remember a strong dose of physical intuition when I suddenly felt violently ill in the

Intuitive Awareness

middle of teaching a class. I later found out that a robbery occurred at my home the moment I took ill at school. We often receive strong cues that we disregard by attributing the stomach ache, for example, to a health problem rather than an intuitive warning for help.

People frequently experience intuition on the emotional level when they are immediately attracted to someone they have just met. Have you ever gravitated toward or away from someone without a logical explanation? Becoming more intuitively attuned emotionally will help you choose the people and situations most beneficial for your growth and development.

Can you recall working endlessly to solve a problem? Suddenly, everything falls into place as you shriek "Eureka--I've Got It!" Mental intuition helps you put the separate pieces of a problem into a coherent whole. Albert Einstein is a good example of someone using mental intuition to make outstanding discoveries. In respect to his theoretical work emanating from his stay at Princeton University, he found his thoughts crystallized more readily while he drifted about aimlessly in a canoe.

Intuitive experiences on a spiritual level unite us with cosmic energy facilitating sudden realizations or insights. Some probing answers to the perennial questions of "why am I here?" or "what am I to do?" may be discovered. These spiritual experiences are mystical unions with universal consciousness.

I have noted a separate classification of cues completely unrelated to any of those mentioned. For example, the flat tire on the car sitting in the garage carries the implicit warning to stay home. When searching for your lost glasses, the environment is telling you to rest your eyes from reading.

To end Section One detailing the ramifications of the Intuitive process, it seems fitting once again to remind you that this intuitive energy which is synonymous with the R-mode, knows all about you and delights in lighting your way. Your intuition is always correct. If you made a "wrong choice or decision" your intuition did not lead you astray. Perhaps you engaged in wishful thinking or fearful thinking. Or, you may have projected your needs onto someone else. Your intuition will help you identify what you truly want.

ELICITING RIGHT BRAIN IMAGERY

GETTING STARTED. The best tool for getting started is an affirmation. Also known as a conditioning phrase or self-programming, words are used in the present tense to form a statement. Implicit is the assumption that the desired result has already been accomplished. For example, you might repeat the following statement aloud several times during the day: My intuitive ability grows more reliable every day.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

Practicing an affirmation is most effective when you become still and lower your brainwave frequency. When you enter this altered state of consciousness called an alpha state, every part of your being will be relaxed and receptive to your receiving intuitive information from the inner mind.

As you know from experience, calming your busy mind filled with L-mode information can be challenging. You might need to retreat from a noisy environment as well as soothe an agitated body and nagging emotions. How do you become still inwardly and outwardly? I'd like to suggest using a mandala. Mandalas have been used by some Eastern religions to graphically represent the universe. Mystics have used these symbols to concentrate so they could attain heightened states of awareness and enlightenment. You can use any geometrical pattern or create one of your own. The best mandalas I know come from nature. Do you have a plant on your desk? Flowers in your home? Symmetrical patterns in the wall paper or grains of wood? As you stare at your Mandala, you will be silencing the L-mode and becoming more receptive to the symbols and pictures presented by the R-mode.

INTUITIVE DEVELOPMENT. The following factors are necessary to arouse your intuitive development. You must: breathe properly; relax; use music as a facilitator and generate imagery. A brief sentence or two about each factor followed by your R-mode experience should sufficiently "show you" the ABC's of intuitive development.

Deep breathing is the key for increased body energy and deep relaxation. Complete relaxation of each bodily part will facilitate receptivity to the intuitive mind. Music must be carefully selected so relaxation is heightened and not disturbed. As the breathing and relaxation exercises are practiced, playing background music on a tape recorder would be helpful. Imagery is akin to strengthening inner vision or any of the sense modalities from within. Inner sight, for example, is ultimately connected with seeing the intuitive light bulb or other flashes. Intuitive abilities fully thrive when every kind of imagery is activated.

ESP RESEARCH AND INTUITION

TELEPATHY. The intent in this section is to present a brief reminder of some of the earlier significant ESP research showing the close link between ESP and intuitive development. Telepathy is indeed an ancient art of communication between people. Among the many instances in the Bible, you may recall the conversation between the Samaritan woman and Jesus. When she said, "I have no husband," Jesus replied, "Thou sayest well, 'I have no husband', for thou hast had five husbands and he whom thou now hast is not thy husband. This hast thou said truly." (John 4:17, 18). Returning to modern times and your own experiences, have you

Intuitive Awareness

ever needed a ride because your car just went out of commission, when a friend suddenly called to find out if you need a lift someplace? Perhaps you've been stuck in the middle of nowhere with a flat tire when your best friend just happens to discover you in this out-of-the-way location. Telepathic attunement can alert you to disaster, bring loved ones closer to you, and even let others know when you need a helping hand.

Most telepathy experiments have a sender intent on sending an impression to the receiver, located in a distant vicinity. Since any form of direct communication is precluded, the experimenters will know that the final result has been impressed upon the inner mind. Extensive telepathy research focused on how thoughts were transmitted from one mind to another in the dream state. The Brooklyn, New York based Maimonides hospital was the setting for ongoing telepathy experiments over a ten year period. The results of these fascinating studies are described in Ullman, Krippner and Vaughan's book on Dream Telepathy (1973). Focusing on dreams at the Maimonides Dream Center, the sender tried to transmit the image of a picture to the sleeping receiver in another room. The highly significant results for most of these dream experiments showed a highly accurate correspondence between the dream transcript and target picture. Sometimes surprising results showed the receiver picking up additional information about the sender. For example, the receiver may sense details about an auto accident which is totally unrelated to the target picture, but represented an accident experienced by the sender's close friend. Through the night, or at any other time of the day, we can be highly receptive to the telepathic messages sent by friends.

Dr. Douglas Dean's pioneering work showed how the physical telepathy response could be measured. Dr. Dean physiologically monitored telepathy responses with a medical instrument known as a plethysmograph. Changes in the blood volume of the body's extremities are monitored with this machine. The graph recordings show that physiological changes occur in the body when telepathic messages are being received. Subconscious bio-communication triggered physiological changes in the body in response to a subject responding to emotionally laden names sent by a sender in the next room. The body was able to respond appropriately to the telepathic message even when the subject was unaware of the name or the actual moment of the transmission. Telepathy was measured through the plethysmograph recordings and verified through repeated test administrations.

The experiments performed years later showed how telepathic messages bridged the 3000 miles between France and New Jersey. The telepathic bond between couples, families and close friends close by and at distant locations barely needs documentation. Have you ever felt family member or friend located some distance away literally crying out for help? Seriously attend to your next impulse to check on someone you think needs help. You don't have to be

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

hooked to a plethysmograph to prove that someone is reaching out to you emotionally. In fact, it takes only a moment to verify your hunch by contacting the person crying out to you. "Telepathy in Action" is frequently experienced in the business community. Instead of using the word "telepathy" or even "intuition", you hear the familiar phrase "you got my signal." By any other name, this sending and receiving involves sensitivity known as intuition.

CLAIRVOYANCE. Clairvoyant faculties may be used to view ongoing events and people at a distance with uncanny accuracy. The word clairvoyance, translated from its French derivative means "clear seeing." Among the references made to the clairvoyant abilities of man in the Bible, you might recall when Jesus meditated under a fig tree and saw Nathaniel before he came into the Master's presence (John 1:47). Remote viewing, the recent scientific term for clairvoyance, had been studied for a ten year period at the Stanford Research Institute (SRI) in California beginning in 1972. Under the direction of Dr. Harold Puthoff and Mr. Russell Targ, experiments showed how individuals blocked from the usual avenues of sight can accurately describe people and settings in distant locations. The results of these studies were incorporated in their early book Mind Reach (1977) as well as Targ and Harary's Book Mind Race (1984). Targ and Puthoff initially tested hundreds of subjects in the laboratory. They found that many people described these distant events quite accurately and emphasized how effortlessly the inner images appeared. In time, experimentation showed that the gap between wide distances such as 2000 miles or across the Atlantic did not interfere with clear descriptions of the target. (Rauscher, 1976; Schlitz, 1980). Remote viewing, also called mind traveling, shows the mind's capability for traveling to distant locales in order to accurately view the ongoing activities at that site. As a practical application, imagine the intuitive capability of the traveling executive who can use remote viewing to check the ongoing office activities. When something is amiss, such as the staff searching frantically for the lost contract papers, one call to the office can relieve the anxiety. To return to my initial questions about searching for a lost object or waiting anxiously for a late comer, realize that one picture in your mind's eye combats the anxiety of indecision. And most importantly, excess energy or time is not expended in vain searching or waiting.

In 1978, Stephen Schwartz founded the Los Angeles based Mobius Corporation. The talents of a number of psychics are used for solving crimes and other projects. As a result of their joint impressions, for example, archaeologists discovered extensive ruins in the vital areas designated by the psychics (Alexandria Project, 1983). In a similar vein, intuitive consensus is used in settings where one can discover more of the situation clairvoyantly. Back to Executive ESP: we may appreciate the intuitive agility of Conrad Hilton and others who used gut feelings, hunches and

Intuitive Awareness

even clairvoyant sight to make correct bids and profitable transactions.

PRECOGNITION. Precognition has ever been a part of human experience and history. Traveling to the site of the ancient Greek civilization in 700 B.C. you can see the famous Oracle of Apollo located in the village of Delphi. The Greeks believed the Gods spoke through the lips of an Oracle when they had messages for mortals. Of the hundreds of correct predictions that came through the Delphic Oracle, we are most familiar with the legend of Oedipus. In fact, a current business practice has actually been named the Delphi Technique (Ascher, 1978). The experts get together to pool their opinion about what the future will be and make projections based on the common consensus of the experts. Also, precognition was tested in the marketplace in 1982 when Dr. Russell Targ and Keith Harary made nine predictions of future silver prices from October through December, 1982. With nine correct predictions, the stock broker trading was able to net over \$100,000. This staggering gain reminds me of Dean and Mihalsky's research (1974) showing how "prophets make profits." In their studies, the executives with the highest precognitive scores generated the most profits for their companies.

We go way back when we consider the many examples of precognition in the Old Testament of the Bible. And, of course, the most famous account concerns Joseph. "And Pharaoh said unto Joseph, I have dreamed a dream and there is none that can interpret it; and I have heard say of thee, that thou canst understand a dream to interpret it." (Genesis 41:15).

Predictions or precognitive warnings have continued through the centuries when people received premonitions of impending disasters in dreams and even spontaneously while awake. Alan Vaughan in his book Edge of Tomorrow (1985) gives examples of many of his precognitive dreams including the assassination of Robert Kennedy. Targ and Puthoff at the SRI conducted considerable research on Precognitive Remote Viewing (Mind Race, 1984). The precognitive remote viewing experiments using Hella Hamid and other receivers, showed that people could accurately describe events that were hours, days and even years into the future. In a remarkable precognitive remote viewing experiment, Soviet psychic Djuna Davitashvili described two different targets located more than 10,000 miles away. The description, given six hours before Djuna randomly selected the San Francisco site of a "merry-go-round" on Pier 39, was "a round structure with a cupola in the center of a small plaza. Inside the round structure, she saw a profile of an animal's eye. The animal had pointy ears," (Brain Mind Bulletin, 1984). Researchers at the Maimonides Dream Laboratory actively studied the precognitive dream from 1960-1970 and reported their findings in Dream Telepathy. (Ullman, et.al., 1973) Three-fourths of the subjects who previously could not recall any precognitive dreams, eventually had these predictive dreams.

Precognition addresses the future oriented component of our intuitive ability. If any family member is going through the "what will I do for a living" dilemma, you can intuitively peer into the future to see various alternatives for making the most sensible choice. In fact, taking this glimpse into the future will give meaning to the common phrase, "forewarned is forearmed."

CURRENT RESEARCH

In the years to come, when I am invited to appear before a learned society again, I hope the proportion of time spent with each section of this presentation is reversed. That is, I hope agreement and articulation of the intuitive concept will be such that I spend relatively little time talking about the parameters of the field. Perhaps the question of whether intuition is or is not a logical skill, for example, will be resolved. In contrast, I hope to spend considerable time talking about the research conducted. At this given moment in time, there is a paucity of research studies on the topic of intuition.

Weston Agor (1984) tested more than 2000 managers nationwide to show that effective managers rely most heavily on their feelings and intuition when they make their most important decisions. He went on to interview those executives that scored in the top ten percent on his intuition survey instrument. In his recent book (1986) he presents the results from interviewing and testing his sample of 100.

To test intuitive ability, Agor innovated the "Test Your Management Style and Response Form" based on selected questions from the intuition portion of the MBTI and the brain styles portion of the Human Information Survey. According to Agor, the test measures underlying potential to use intuition, as well as giving an indication of whether it is actually being used on-the-job to make decisions. In addition to Agor's instrument, which has been streamlined into the AIM survey (Agor, 1985), instruments for testing intuitive ability have appeared in several books (Fisher, 1982; Goldberg, 1983; Loye, 1982; Schwartz and DeMattel, 1982); and Torrance and Taggart, 1983). The validity of these paper and pencil tests awaits clarification. Many of these tests have been used in my informal research. Most of the respondents comment on the transparency of the questions and lack of flexibility in transferring from one situation to another. For example, you may not give orders at work, but certainly do so at home. Many books have been written on the theme of developing intuitive ability (Blakeslee, 1980; Burden, 1975; Buzan, 1974; Fisher, 1982; Goldberg, 1983; Vaughan, 1975; Zdenek, 1983; Rowan, 1986). Others have been cited throughout this presentation. Passing through the intuitive gateway, one sees many other road signs such as creativity, brain style, psychic ability, ESP, dreams, insight, learning styles, management by this or that. The list is endless. I have yet to see a piece of research or book that continues the fine tradition set by Dr. Douglas

Intuitive Awareness

Dean and his associates. I return to a statement from his book that I mentioned above: "Why not probe the intuitive decision from the perspective of parapsychology?" Hopefully, the research of tomorrow will bring these two processes back into the same ball park.

Intuitive management articles spotlight "intuition in the marketplace" for business people. My informal research shows people in all walks of life using intuition to manage their everyday affairs. From the Doctor knowing where to probe despite the X-rays, to teachers making learning a creative and meaningful experience, to psychologists and service workers knowing when to reach out to the emotionally troubled, to the reporter asking the right question, to the sales person knowing the right pitch to use, and to the many people reaching out to loved ones and those in need who will intuitively know the right words and the right time for reaching out. Many, in fact, need a simple "how-to" manual to encourage them in developing their skills.

Finally, I return to the challenge expressed earlier in this presentation, of helping people function effectively by utilizing both modes of cognition, the R and L. Anyone functioning by relying on only one mode is incomplete. To help people become truly intelligent, by utilizing the intellect and intuition for better decision making and problem solving, is the challenge of anyone working in the area of Intuitive Awareness.

Agor, Weston. Aim Survey: Trainer's Guide. Bryn Mawr, PA: Organizational Design and Development, 1985.

Agor, Weston. Intuitive Management. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1984.

Agor, Weston. The Logic of Intuitive Decision Making. Westport, CT: Quorum Books, 1986.

Agor, Weston. "Top Executives Disclose Use of Intuition for Strategic Decisions," Leading Edge. May 13, 1985, Vol. 14.

Arieti, Silvana. Creativity. New York: Basic Books, 1980.

Armstrong, Ellen. "Bottom Line Intuition." New Age Journal. December, 1985.

Ascher, William. Forecasting: An Appraisal for Policy-Makers and Planners. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978.

Bisaha, J.P. & B.J. Dunne, "Multiple Subject and Long-Distance Precognitive Remote of Geographical Locations," in J.D. Morris, W.D. Roll, & R.L. Morris (eds.) Research in Parapsychology, 1976. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow, 1977.

Brain Mind Bulletin. "Remote Viewing: Soviet Healer Sees U.S. Target." December 31, 1975.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

- Burden, Virginia. The Process of Intuition. Wheaton, IL: Theosophical Publishing House, 1975.
- Buzan, Tony. Use Both Sides of Your Brain. New York: E.P. Dutton, 1983.
- Dean, D. & J. Milhalsky. Executive ESP. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1974.
- Edwards, Betty. Drawing on the Right Side of the Brain. Los Angeles: Tarcher, 1979.
- Fisher, Milton. "How Intuitive Are You?" New Women Magazine. May, 1982.
- Fisher, Milton. Intuition: How to Use it for Success and Happiness. New York: E.P. Dutton, 1981.
- Getzels, L.W. "The Psychology of Creativity." Carnegie Symposium on Creativity, Inaugural Meeting of the Library of Congress Council of Scholars, November 19-20, 1980.
- Goldberg, Philip. The Intuitive Edge: Understanding and Developing. Los Angeles: Tarcher, Inc., 1983.
- Hurley, Daniel. "The Hit Parade." Psychology Today. July 1986.
- James, William. "President's Address." Proceedings of the Society for Psychical Research. London: Vol. 12, 1986, p.5.
- Jung, C.G. Memories, Dreams, Reflections. New York: Vintage, 1986.
- Levy, Jerre. "Right Brain, Left Brain: Fact or Fiction". Psychology Today, May 1985.
- Loye, David. Manual for the HCP Profile Test. Carmel, CA: Institute for Futures Forecasting, 1982.
- McKean, Kevin, "Of Two Minds: Selling the Right Brain." Discover. April 1985.
- Rauscher, E.A., G. Weismann, J. Sarfatti, P. Sirag. "Remote Perception of Natural Scenes, Shielded Against Ordinary Perception," in J.D. Morris, W.G. Roll, & R.L Morris (eds.), Research in Parapsychology. 1975. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1976.
- Rhine, J.B. & J.G. Pratt, "A Review of the Pearce-Pratt Distance Series of ESP Tests." Journal of Parapsychology. Vol. 18, no. 3, 1954, pp. 165-177.
- Rowan, Roy. The Intuitive Manager. Boston: Little, Brown & Company, 1986.
- Schlitz, M. & E. Gruber. "Transcontinental Remote Viewing." Journal of Parapsychology. 1980, Vol. 44, pp. 305-317.
- Schwartz, Stephen. The Alexandria Project. New York: Delacorte, 1983.

Intuitive Awareness

Schwartz, Stephan and R. DeMattei. "Mobius Psi-Q Test." Omni, October, 1981.

Sperry, R.W. "Hemisphere Disconnection and Unity in Conscious Awareness." American psychologist. 23:1968: 723-33.

Sperry, R.W., M.S. Gazzaniga, and J.E. Bogen. "Interhemispheric Relationships: The Neocortical Commissures; Syndromes of Hemisphere Disconnection." Handbook of Clinical Neurology. P.J. Vinken and G.W. Bruyn, eds. Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Co., 1969, 273-89.

Sprecher, L. Letter to the Editor, Public Management. 652, February 1983, p. 18.

Springer, S. & G. Deutsch. Left Brain, Right Brain. New York: W.H. Freeman, 1985.

Targ, Russell and Harold Puthoff. Mind Reach. New York: Delacorte, 1977.

Targ, Russell and Keith Harary. The Mind Race. New York: Villard Books, 1984.

Torrance, E.P. and W. Taggart. Human Information Survey. Bensenville, IL: Scholastic Testing Service, 1983.

Ullman, M., S. Krippner & A. Vaughan. Dream Telepathy. New York: Macmillan, 1973; Penguin, 1974.

Vaughan, Alan. Personal Correspondence, April 15, 1985.

Vaughan, Frances. Awakening Intuition. Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor, 1979.

Von Franz, M. & J. Hillman. Jung's Typology. New York: Spring Publishers, 1971.

Wonder, J. & P. Donovan. Whole Brain Thinking. New York: Morrow, 1984.

Zdenek, Marilee. Right Brain Experience. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1983.

Marcia Rose Emery is an adjunct faculty member at Aquinas College. Her address is 3512 McCoy, S.E., Grand Rapids, MI. 49506.

AN EXPLORATION OF C.G. JUNG'S INTERPRETATION
OF OCCULT/PSYCHIC PHENOMENA

Elizabeth W. Fenske

Drawing on the Collected Works of C.G. Jung, the author explores the sources and many facets of Jung's speculative study of psychism. She includes some attention to Jung's interest in adapting empiricism to the study of this subject and also to Jung's concept of synchronicity.

Carl Gustav Jung, the Swiss Psychiatrist and founder of Analytical Psychology, was an individual who, in his life's work, explored both the fields of psychical research and religion. Distilling the essence of his writings, however, is no easy task, largely because of the difficulty involved in isolating those ideas which pertain to a certain concept. He was always defining and redefining his concepts in new and different ways. This causes overlapping throughout his published works, as does the interrelatedness of the "psyche" with all his ideas. Even up to his death he was struck with awe regarding the "Unknown" and was intrigued by riddles and mysteries.

The more Jung sought to unravel his concepts about the psyche, the more he recognized the complexity of life, but also, paradoxically, the closer he came to the unity of all life. The integration and acceptance of the unconscious into consciousness was for him "the process of individuation." This meant becoming reconciled with one's total personality and with the activities and experiences of this lifetime. Individuation was, therefore, a gradual process that continued to develop during one's life. A similar religious term may be self-realization. Jung states, "I use the term 'individuation' to denote the process by which a person becomes a psychological 'in-dividual'--that is, a separate, indivisible unity or 'whole'."¹

This paper seeks to deal with some of the ways in which Jung explained occult/psychic phenomena and parapsychology. Often an individual is able to explore and unravel certain concepts because of pressing personal needs. In part, this suggests that psychic experiences may actually be generated out of emotional need. This seemed to be the situation of Jung. Early in his life he experienced inner psychic events which affected him very deeply. In his late thirties confusing events and experiences, including dreams, visions, etc., took place in his psyche. (Experiences which some have labeled as psychotic behavior.) It was his own psychological concepts which helped him to understand and cope with these situations during this time of intense self-analysis.

This paper does not, however, try to prove the existence of spiritual entities; nor does it deny the possibility of their existence. Its point is merely to

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

explore Jung's explanations for certain psychic and parapsychological phenomena as they manifest in the lives of certain individuals and take on the psychic reality of a religious or spiritual experience.

This paper will deal with three major areas of concentration:

1. The Psyche and Psychic Reality;
2. The Manifestation of Spirits, Belief in Spirits, and a Possible Origin of Spirits;
3. The Meaning of Synchronicity.

THE PSYCHE AND PHYSICAL REALITY

In Jungian theory, the psyche represents for man the totality of both the conscious and unconscious psychic process--that is, the events which take place in the individual. This includes the levels of the conscious, personal unconscious, and collective unconscious. Most of Jung's studies on the unconscious are directed toward the collective unconscious aspects of the psyche. It is this part of the individual's being that is the contact between the individual and the cosmos. For Jung, psyche includes both mind and soul--consciousness and unconsciousness.

In Jung's works seele can be translated to mean "soul"; however, he replaces soul ultimately with "psyche." Geist, which can mean ghost or apparition, can also be translated as "mind," and in the same way, Jung replaces it with the term "psyche." Thus, the adjective "mental" becomes "psychic."²

For Jung there was always the conflict of trying to remain true to science, or the empiricist he called himself, and to his interest and concern for the religious, or what he later came to call the "metaphysical." He states, "A psychology that satisfies the intellect alone can never be practical, for the totality of the psyche can never be grasped by intellect alone."³ Man is more than a thinking being. Man is also a feeling being, a being who senses, and a being who intuitively knows. In another of his writings, Jung says, "I am of the opinion that the psyche is the most tremendous fact of human life. Indeed, it is the mother of all human facts; of civilization and of its destroyer, war."⁴

Science seeks to arrive at knowledge to satisfy the intellect. But since intellect is only one of the fundamental psychic functions, it can not, in and of itself, give a complete picture of the world.

The nature of the psyche reaches into obscurities far beyond the scope of our understanding. It contains as many riddles as the universe with its galactic systems, before whose majestic configuration only a mind lacking in imagination can fail to admit its own insufficiency.⁵

There are places where Jung reduces "soul," "mind," "spirit," and "life" to an empirical basis and replaces these words by the phenomenological concept of "psychic reality." This "psychic reality" becomes the basis of Jung's investigation. It is only a delusional system we have set up when we think we know more about matter than about a metaphysical mind or spirit. Material causation to Jung does not afford us a true explanation of life. Jung said, "...Matter is just as inscrutable as mind. As to the ultimate things, we can know nothing, and only when we admit this do we return to a state of equilibrium."⁶

From the point of view of the naturalist everything spiritual is illusion. Jung points out that the very conflict we experience between nature and spirit is itself a reflection of the paradox of psychic life. There is this contradiction only because we do not understand the meaning and nature of psychic life.⁷ "All that I experience is psychic," states Jung.⁸

Certain psychic contents seem to relate to the material world, or the environment of physical bodies, while others appear to relate to a spiritual world. To some, the spiritual world appears to be different from the material world. Yet, one is no less real, from the standpoint of our experience or psychic reality, than the other. The external fact of trying to imagine or picture the house one wishes to live in next year, or trying to imagine where the soul of a dead relative resides are both psychic realities. One deals with thoughts about the so-called material world (a house), and the other deals with thoughts in regard to the so-called spiritual world--the life of the soul.

If I shift my concept of reality on to the plane of the psyche--where alone it is valid--this puts an end to the conflict between mind and matter, spirit and nature, as contradictory explanatory principles. Each becomes a mere designation for the particular source of the psychic contents that crowd into my field of consciousness.⁹

Primitive man puts all experiences on the same plane, be they physical events, the influence of spirits, or magical rituals. For him spirit and matter interpenetrated each other. With the dawn of a more civilized/industrialized way of living, the division of spirit and nature becomes much more distinct. The West moves more toward the rationalistic approach of nature (matter), and the East explains things in terms of the spiritual, holding that matter is merely "Maya," or illusion. This East-West division, as are all divisions, is man-made. Behind everything is a unity, a oneness, a wholeness. If psychic reality exists in oneness, then man must move to a recognition that both the material and the spiritual are constituent elements of the one psyche. Psychic reality:

...alone enables us to understand the manifestations of the psyche in all their variety and uniqueness. Without this idea it is unavoidable that we should explain our psychic experiences in a way that does violence to a good half of them, while with it we can give its due to that side of psychic life which expresses itself in superstition and mythology, religion and philosophy.¹⁰

In his short article, "The Real and the Surreal," published in Berlin in 1933, Jung makes his point that it is only the psychic which has immediate reality.¹¹ Even those "unreal" thoughts and ideas that are imagination or delusion have a real effect on individuals and the cosmos. It is the strength of the thought, be it real or unreal, that influences its effectiveness.

Greater than all physical dangers are the tremendous delusional ideas, which are yet denied all reality by our world-blinded consciousness....The world-powers that rule over all mankind, for good or ill, are unconscious psychic factors, and it is they that bring consciousness into being and hence create the sine que non for the existence of any world at all. We are steeped in a world that was created by our own psyche.¹²

These words were published in the country which produced the Hitler of the Second World War. Now many people are coming to the point of recognizing the possible power of thought projection and the place this might have played in Hitler's unquenchable drive for control. Consider the possibilities and ramifications of Jung's position when he says, "Between the unknown essences of spirit and matter stands the reality of the psychic reality, the only reality we can experience immediately."¹³

Essentially the psyche consists of a series of images which have meaning and purpose. To grasp the riddle of life itself involves the use of mental imagery. Speculations and facts about matter may be images that have been created by man's mind. How does one know color and sound? Does not one's perception and experience of color and sound come from the storehouse of images which reside in one's mind?

Thus there is, in a certain sense, nothing that is directly experienced except the mind itself. Everything is mediated through the mind, translated, filtered, allegorized, twisted, even falsified by it.¹⁴

Thus, it is difficult to know anything fundamental regarding the distinctiveness of body, mind, or spirit. To dissect and distinguish one from the other may ultimately be an impossibility. The unity may lie in the reality of the psychic. Jung says, "And the doubt as to whether mind and body may not ultimately prove to be the same thing also applies to the apparent contrast between 'spirit' and

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

'living being.' They too are probably the same thing."¹⁵
In another of his writings he states:

Spirit and matter may well be forms of one and the same transcendental being. For instance the Tantrists, with as much right, say that matter is nothing other than the concreteness of God's thoughts. The sole immediate reality is the psychic reality of conscious contents, which are as it were labelled with a spiritual or material origin as the case may be."¹⁶

In his Introduction to The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation, Jung states that:

Psychic reality is a controversial concept, like 'psyche' or 'mind'....Psychic existence is the only category of existence of which we have immediate knowledge, since nothing can be known unless it first appears as a psychic image.¹⁷

Every image which appears is subjective in that it is involved in the experiences of the person who has the image. Objectivity thus becomes an impossibility, for everything is perceived, in the final analysis, subjectively. Does this then make truth relative only to the given situation and to the perceiver?

THE MANIFESTATION OF SO-CALLED SPIRITS

During the summer holidays in 1898, when Jung was a medical student, two events¹⁸ took place in his home which he shared with his widowed mother and fourteen-year-old sister. The first event involved the splitting of the top of a heavy round walnut dining table. The table was an heirloom from Jung's paternal grandmother. Jung was in an adjoining room when this explosion took place. The second event happened about two weeks later when his mother, sister and the maid were present. This time a heavy steel knife in the cupboard had been snapped in several pieces. That these two events were just coincidence did not seem possible to Jung.

Several weeks later it came to his attention that some of his relatives were involved in spiritualistic phenomena--that is, communication with the dead. As a consequence, during the years 1899-1900, he also participated in seances.¹⁹ During these sittings a fifteen-and-a-half-year-old Protestant female, Miss S. W., served as a medium while she was in somnambulist states. The results of these experiences and the experiments of two years are recorded in Jung's doctoral dissertation (published in 1902) entitled, "On the Psychology and Pathology of So-called Occult Phenomena."

In 1900, when he was preparing for his state examinations, he waited until last to study Krafft-Ebing's book, Lehrbuch der Psychiatrie. He expected to be bored with the

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

study. However, an experience came to him while reading the preface which changed his direction from internal medicine to psychiatry.

...the author called the psychoses 'diseases of the personality.'...Here alone the two currents of my interest could flow together ..Here at last was the place where the collision of nature and spirit became a reality.²⁰

Thus, Jung's inner promptings seemed to be supported by certain outer circumstances, and his destiny, involving a career that spanned over a half century, began.

It is interesting to observe a man whose work and writings through the years continued to raise and deal with many of the same questions which he was concerned about when he wrote his dissertation. Let us now look at some of the points around which the issues revolve.

While the fifteen-and-one-half-year-old girl (a sensitive personality) was in the somnambulistic or trance state, utterances from other personalities would come through her voice box.

In her somnambulistic dialogue she copied in a remarkably clever way her dead relatives and acquaintances, with all their foibles, so that she made a lasting impression even on persons not easily influenced.²¹

The personalities which emerged from Miss S. W. were really of two types: the grandfather, a pietistic sanctimonious clergyman, a compulsorily educated bigot; and Ulrich von Gerbenstein, a silly boisterous school girl of fifteen (with nothing masculine but the name). Miss S. W., who became Jung's patient, was really a dual mixture of the two.²² Jung states, "The patient is obviously seeking a middle way between two extremes; she endeavors to repress then and strives for a more ideal state."²³

In the building up of the unconscious personalities of S. W., suggestion played a role. She was already acquainted with table-turning in her own home and among friends. She did some table-turning several times in the family circle with friends, and it was discovered that she had mediumistic abilities. It must be pointed out that she was expecting communication to take place.

One can see...how the unconscious personality builds itself up; it owes its existence simply to suggestive questions which strike an answering chord in the medium's own disposition.²⁴

Each question that the medium is asked helps to give an opportunity for synthesizing or building up the unconscious personality. Merely to ask the question, "Who is speak-

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

ing?", suggests that it could possibly be someone other than the medium.

The darkening of the seance room also increases the suggestibility of the medium. This heightened sense of awareness of the sense organs produced drowsiness in S. W., which was equal to a state of partial hypnosis. The personality split from the unconscious thus appears as an independent spirit. The suggestion that the personality is appearing thus makes it possible for a visual image, having the character of an hallucination, to be produced.

Miss S. W., Jung says, had just reached the age of puberty.

...we must suppose that there was some connection between these disturbances and the physiological changes of character at puberty...features of an inherited degenerate character, which do not appear in the child at all or only sporadically, now become fixed.²⁵

In discussing somnambulistic symptoms common to puberty situations, Jung writes:

It is, therefore conceivable that the phenomena of double consciousness are simply new character formations, or attempts of the future personality to break through, and that in consequence of special difficulties (unfavorable circumstances, psychopathic disposition of the nervous system, etc.) they get bound up with peculiar disturbances of consciousness.²⁶

It should also be noted that the psychiatric history of S. W.'s family left much to be desired. Jung calls her a girl with "poor inheritance."²⁷

While in the trance state the medium performed at a higher level than when she was functioning consciously. Material emerged that was not ordinarily available during her conscious psychic activity. In the situation with S. W. there appears to be a case of heightened performance known as cryptomnesia. Cryptomnesia is, "...the coming into consciousness of a memory-image which is not recognized as such in the first instance, but only secondarily, if at all, by means of subsequent recollection or abstract reasoning."²⁸ Generally while in a trance state one is more susceptible to receive things. Jung quotes Binet as saying, "According to the calculations that I have been able to make, the unconscious sensibility of an hysterical patient is at certain moments fifty times more acute than that of a normal person."²⁹ Therefore carried in the unconscious are all those memories which have been lost to consciousness. The unconscious is also able to act as the originator for hunches and intuitive ideas which enter consciousness intrapsychically.

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

In one of the seances, in March 1900, S. W. had Jung draw a diagram.³⁰ This diagram was a circle. Is it meaningful coincidence or is it chance that this circle seems to be a representation of Jung's later development of the Mandala? Was this for the young medium an unconscious urge toward wholeness? Interestingly, after the appearance of this figure, S. W.'s work started declining. This development would be logical if, in fact, the various splinter personalities were gradually becoming integrated. It would also follow that the appearance of the circle, and later the mandala, would signal this movement toward wholeness because both are emblematic of the integrated psyche, which has at its center the spiritual force, the primary force, the original cause of creation.

In this, Jung's first work, we see concepts emerging which would be repeated throughout his life and writings. Concepts such as: a) the unconscious portrayed as the carrier of memories which are lost to consciousness; b) the unconscious acting as an intuiting station with a receptivity which far exceeds that of the conscious mind; c) the psyche as the holding tank for all history, for the world's mythology, and for the history of religion (the collective unconscious); d) events that emerge from the unconscious having a teleological significance for the individual; e) the autonomy of unconscious psychic contents, such as hallucinatory visions, sensations or voices, which may be interpreted as spirits, etc. It is this autonomy which gives rise to the building up of a second personality and/or others. For a discussion of this last point let us turn to Jung's writing on "The Psychological Foundation of Belief in Spirits."

BELIEF IN SPIRITS AND A POSSIBLE ORIGIN OF SPIRITS

One of the most universal beliefs among the followers of primitive religion is the existence of "spirits" or "ethereal beings." These spirits or beings exercise an invisible, yet very powerful, influence upon people. They are recognized as the spirits or souls of the dead. Therefore, for the primitive man, an active world of spirits, or a spiritual reality exists, as does the physical environment of everyday existence. These two worlds are interwoven into one Psychic Reality.

Primitive man, therefore, really lives in two worlds. Physical reality is at the same time spiritual reality. The physical world is undeniable, and for him the world of spirits has an equally real existence, not just because he thinks so, but because of his naive awareness of things spiritual. Wherever this naivete is lost through contact with civilization and its disastrous 'enlightenment,' he forfeits his dependence on spiritual law and accordingly degenerates.³²

On July 4, 1919 Jung read a paper at the Society for Psychical research in London on "The Psychological Founda-

tion of Belief in Spirits." It was published in 1920 in the Proceedings of the Society, republished in 1928 and revised and expanded in 1948. Jung points out that for the majority of educated Westerners in the last one hundred and fifty years, because of rationalism and scientific enlightenment, belief in Spirits has been suppressed along with other metaphysical beliefs. He states:

...in my view it is equally certain that psychic phenomena occur no less frequently with civilized people than they do with primitives. The only difference is that where the primitive speaks of ghosts, the European speaks of dreams and fantasies and neurotic symptoms, and attributes less importance to them than the primitive does. I am convinced that if a European had to go through the same exercises and ceremonies which the medicine-man performs in order to make the spirits visible, he would have the same experiences...It is well known that Europeans have very curious psychic experiences if they have to live under primitive conditions for a long time, or if they find themselves in some other unusual psychological situation.³³

For the primitives there are three main sources of information that contribute to the foundation of the belief in spirits.³⁴

- 1) The seeing of apparitions of ghosts
- 2) Dreams
- 3) Pathological disturbances of psychic life

The ghosts, or disembodied spirits of the dead, are assumed by the civilized man to be mere superstition, and it is further assumed that a person only sees such visions if he is ill. Primitive people believe that the people who appear as actors in their dreams are spirits or ghosts. The primitive takes his dreams quite seriously, talks about them, and often treats them as if they were reality. When "the dead appear in dreams, the primitive naively takes them for revenants."³⁵ The pathological disturbances of the psychic life such as psychogenic diseases and nervous disorders (especially of a hysterical character), mostly stem from unconscious psychic conflicts. The primitive feels these disturbances are caused by persons, either living or dead who are subjectively connected with the conflict. The spirits of the dead are believed to be able to have harmful influences; thus ancestor worship offers a protection against the malicious attitude of the dead.

There can be no doubt that mental illnesses play a significant part in causing belief in spirits...In all ages and all over the world, insane people have been regarded as possessed by evil spirits and this belief is supported by the patient's own hallucinations...Very often these voices are those of relatives or of persons in some way connected

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

with the patient's conflicts. To the naive mind, the hallucinations naturally appear to be caused by spirits.³⁶

Among the primitives there is a difference between beliefs in spirits and beliefs in souls. Souls seem normally to belong to a person--that is, the soul-complexes seem to belong to the ego and the loss of them appears pathological. With spirit-complexes, an association with the ego causes illness and their dissociation from it brings recovery. "Accordingly, primitive pathology recognizes two causes of illness: loss of soul and possession by a spirit."³⁷

Though the psyche's separate parts are connected with one another they are still relatively independent. For example, certain parts may never (or very rarely) become associated with the ego. Jung called these psychic fragments "autonomous complexes" and based his theory of complexes on their existence. The ego-complex, though it is the center of the psyche, is only one among the other complexes. In 1934 Jung made the statements, "Today we can take it as moderately certain that complexes are in fact 'splinter psyches'."³⁸

Autonomous complexes appear most clearly in dreams, visions, pathological hallucinations, and delusional ideas. Because the ego is unconscious of them, they always appear first in projected form. In dreams they are represented by other people, in visions they are projected, as it were, into space, just like the voices in insanity when not ascribed to persons in the patient's environment.

...Spirits, therefore, viewed from the psychological angle, are unconscious autonomous complexes which appear as projections because they have no direct association with the ego.³⁹

Jung holds that it is extraordinarily difficult to find evidence that is trustworthy in regard to the independent existence of spirits. It appears that much of the spiritualistic communication is the product of the unconscious either of the sitter, the medium, or someone else present. Therefore:

Spirits are complexes of the collective unconscious which appear when the individual loses his adaption to reality, or which seek to replace the inadequate attitude of a whole people by a new one. They are therefore either pathological fantasies, or new but as yet unknown ideas.

The psychogenesis of the spirits of the dead seems to be more or less as follows. When a person dies, the feelings and emotions that bound his relatives to him lose their application to reality

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

and sink into the unconscious, where they activate a collective content that has a deleterious effect on consciousness.⁴⁰

The basic position which Jung expressed in his dissertation he still held in 1919. He held that the forms of parapsychic phenomena connected with a medium are exteriorizations of unconscious complexes.

I have repeatedly observed the telepathic effects of unconscious complexes, and also a number of parapsychic phenomena. but in all this I see no proof whatever of the existence of real spirits, and until such proof is forthcoming I must regard this whole territory as an appendix of psychology.⁴¹

In 1948 Jung added, in the Swiss edition of the above work, a page sharing some of his thinking almost thirty years later. Although his basic position had not changed, he had come to recognize the possibility that different approaches held possible therapeutic value. Someone called his attention to the work of Stewart Edward White. White's deceased wife Betty was a psychic who communicated to her husband from the other side. The best known of the White books, though he published over forty, are: The Unobstructed Universe, The Betty Book, Across the Unknown, and The Road I Know. Some of the concepts coming from White's material were archetypal in nature--that is, ideas pertaining to the primordial image and process of the self. These ideas are very similar to some of Jung's own material. Jung states that the (Betty) case seems to "be genuine, spontaneous production of the collective archetype."⁴²

Part of the tendency of mediumistic communication is to filter the contents of the unconscious into consciousness. He writes:

I have studied a wide range of spiritualistic literature precisely for these tendencies and have come to the conclusion that in spiritualism we have a spontaneous attempt of the unconscious to become conscious in a collective form. The psychotherapeutic endeavours of the so-called spirits are aimed at the living either directly, or indirectly through the deceased person, in order to make them more conscious. Spiritualism as a collective phenomenon thus pursues the same goals as Medical psychology, and in so doing produces, as in this case, (White) the same basic ideas and images--styling themselves the 'teachings of the Spirits' which are characteristic of the nature of the collective unconscious. Such things, however, baffling they may be, prove nothing either for or against the hypothesis of spirits.⁴³

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

Closely connected with this statement from Jung is his work with active imagination and the power of thoughts. In "The Transcendent Function"⁴⁴ he deals with the place of "active imagination" in the production of the contents of the unconscious that lie below the threshold of consciousness. White's book, The Road I Know, also deals with the method of "active imagination." Jung used active imagination as a therapeutic tool in the treatment of neurosis to seek to bring to consciousness unconscious contents.

In the added Prefatory note (1958-59) to "The Transcendent Function," Jung speaks with much more reservation than he does in the 1948 comment in "The Psychological Foundation of Belief in Spirits." Here he appears to recognize the dangers of opening a Pandora's box without some direction. The material must be integrated into the total personality and the person must be confronted with the moral demands.

In a footnote in 1948 regarding the belief in Spirits Jung makes these comments:

After collecting psychological experiences from many people and many countries for fifty years, I no longer feel as certain as I did in 1919. To put it bluntly, I doubt whether an exclusively psychological approach can do justice to the phenomena in question. Not only the findings of parapsychology but my own theoretical reflections, outlined in 'On the Nature of the Psyche,' have led me to certain postulates which touch on the realm of nuclear physics and the conception of the space-time continuum. This opens up the whole question of the transpsychic reality immediately underlying the psyche.⁴⁵

The last major section of this paper will deal with a phenomenon of Jung's which speaks to the space-time continuum: Synchronicity.

SYNCHRONICITY

Outer happenings at times coincide in a meaningful way with inner psychological conditions. For example, one may have a dream which is precognitive of that which will take place at some future time. Jung feels that often these prophetic dreams or visions can be explained psychologically, as being projections of contents of the collective unconscious.

Synchronicity⁴⁶ is the term which Jung used for meaningful coincidences of events. These events are separated in space and/or time. He states:

Causality is the way we explain the link between two successive events. Synchronicity designates the parallelism of time and meaning between psychic and psycho-physical events, which scien-

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

tific knowledge so far has been unable to reduce to a common principle...Synchronicity is a modern differentiation of the obsolete concept of correspondence, sympathy and harmony.⁴⁷

When synchronistic phenomena are taking place, the content, which is perceived by an observer, can be represented at the same time by some outside event which has no apparent connection. This would seem to indicate that either the psyche cannot be localized in the space-time continuum, or space and time are relative to the psyche.

Thus synchronicity became for Jung a possible explanation for events which for years haunted and intrigued him. Influential in the development of this theory was Albert Einstein who was on several occasions, (while he was holding a professorship in Zurich in 1909-1910 and in 1912-1913) a dinner guest of Jung's. Thus, it was Einstein discussing his first theory of relativity that started Jung thinking about a possible relativity of time and space and the psychic conditionality of time and space.

Jung states that ever since the middle twenties the problem of synchronicity has puzzled him. While he was investigating the phenomena of the collective unconscious, he would keep coming across connections. These connections he simply could not explain as chance groupings or "runs."⁴⁸

It was not until May 10, 1930 in Munich in his memorial address for Richard Wilhelm that Jung formally presented the concept of synchronicity. He made the statement:

The science of the I Ching is not based on the causality principle, but on a principle (hitherto unnamed because not met with among us) which I have tentatively called the synchronistic principle.⁴⁹

In his work, "The Soul and Death,"⁵⁰ (1934), Jung speaks of the telepathic faculties of the psyche regarding spatial and temporal phenomena. These experiences have caused him many a headache!

The limitations of consciousness in space and time is such an overwhelming reality that every occasion when this fundamental truth is broken through must rank as an event of the highest theoretical significance, for it would prove that the space-time barrier can be annulled. The annulling factor would then be the psyche....Under certain conditions it would even break through the barriers of space and time precisely because of a quality essential to it, that is, its relatively trans-spatial and trans-temporal nature.⁵¹

There are a number of different reasons why some people respond favorably to the possibility that telepathic experiences are real. Some respond naturally, just as the

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

primitive people of centuries past responded; others respond because of what they have read and believe from the ancient lessons of wisdom literature. Still others are favorably disposed because of their various needs and feelings, and many others may respond on the basis of the fact, as they experience it, of telepathic perception. Thus, for these individuals, experientially, the psyche participates in existence which, according to synchronicity, transcends space and time and appears to be a part of eternity.

In his "Forward to the I Ching,"⁵² (written before 1950, and found in the Richard Wilhelm/Cary F. Baynes translation), Jung gives an explanation of synchronicity in relation to the I Ching. It is:

a concept that formulates a point of view diametrically opposed to that of causality. Since the latter is a merely statistical truth and not absolute, it is a sort of working hypothesis of how events evolve one out of another, whereas synchronicity takes the coincidence of events in space and time as meaning something more than mere chance, namely, a peculiar interdependence of objective events among themselves as well as with the subjective (psychic) states of the observer or observers.⁵³

Jung's point is that synchronicity is in operation regarding the hexagram which is arrived at from either the random division of the forty-nine yarrow stalks or by the equally random throw of the three coins.

Preceding Jung's major work on synchronicity was an essay in 1946, "On the Nature of the Psyche,"⁵⁴ which covers a major part of his whole field of concepts with reference to consciousness and the unconscious. Here he again deals with the possibility of psyche and matter being two different aspects of one and the same thing. In this regard he states:

The synchronicity phenomena point, it seems to me, in this direction for they show that the nonpsychic can behave like the psychic, and vice versa, without there being any causal connection between them.⁵⁵

In seeking to explain psychic phenomena with clarity one comes to the point of assuming that archetypes⁵⁶ have a nonpsychic aspect. It is synchronicity which causes one to be able to make this assumption.

As soon as a psychic content crosses the threshold of consciousness, the synchronistic marginal phenomena disappear, time and space resume their accustomed sway, and consciousness is once more isolated in its subjectivity.⁵⁷

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

Jung goes on to point out that the physicist's term for this phenomenon is "complementarity."⁵⁸ The synchronistic manifestation ceases whenever the contents from the unconscious pass into consciousness. Since this is the case, placing an individual in a trance state, where the conscious mind may be somewhat by-passed, can produce synchronistic phenomena. Common examples of this phenomenon can be observed when certain clinical symptoms--skin rashes, etc.--disappear when unconscious contents are made conscious, understood and assimilated. Also psychosomatic phenomena can be induced by hypnosis, either hetero- or auto-hypnosis.

Jung's work, "On Synchronicity,"⁵⁹ was a lecture given in 1951 at the Eranos Conference in Ascona, Switzerland. In 1952 his more extensive work, "Synchronicity: An Acausal Connecting Principle,"⁶⁰ was published together with a work by Professor W. Pauli (in the book, The Interpretation of Nature and the Psyche). In these two works Jung deals with many events of an extrasensory or telepathic or psychokinetic nature. These events consist of two factors:

- a) An unconscious image comes into consciousness either directly (i.e., literally) or indirectly (symbolized or suggested) in the form of a dream, idea or premonition.
- b) An objective situation coincides with this content.⁶¹

In this work Jung also deals at length with an astrological experiment and with some of the experimental ESP work of J. B. Rhine, then at Duke University in Durham, North Carolina, USA.

Synchronicity may also be the factor at work in relation to Unidentified Flying Objects. In Jung's book, Flying Saucers: A Modern Myth of Things Seen in the Skies, Jung points out that because of the threatening situations in the world today, where everything is at stake, the people's "projection creating fantasy" soars into the heavens and into interstellar space. This is the place, mythologically, where the gods-archetypes, who were the rulers of human fate, once had their dwelling places.⁶² It surpasses our comprehension "that something psychic, possessing material qualities, and with a charge of energy, could appear by itself high in the air at a great distance from any human mediums..."⁶³

Jung goes on to say:

It may be they are synchronistic phenomena or 'meaningful coincidences.' The psychic situation of mankind and the UFO phenomena as a physical reality bear no recognizable causal relationship to one another, but they seem to coincide in a meaningful manner. The meaningful connection is the product on the one hand of the projection and on the other of the round and cylindrical forms

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

which embody the projected meaning and have always symbolized the union of opposites.⁶⁴

Thus possibly, as with other synchronistic events, Flying Saucers are due to an unconscious identification between occurrences in the collective unconscious and external incidents.

Synchronicity, to the writer of this paper, is a concept which not only seems intellectually satisfying but is also experientially meaningful. On December 31, 1970 a couple was traveling from Georgia to Pennsylvania. The wife was driving and had planned to take a by-pass route around Washington, D.C. For some reason, however, she had a premonition that she would miss the by-pass. The husband was asleep but was expecting the wife to take the by-pass they generally used. She missed the turn-off completely, not even having had any feeling when she missed it. This was not an unfamiliar route; however, it appeared that way on this particular day. Just as she arrived in the downtown Washington area and was driving approximately 15 miles per hour, because a truck was in front of her, the right front tire blew out. She was going around the Federal Building, and because it was a holiday, there was no problem about parking in the parking lot. This was a once-in-a-lifetime kind of blow-out. The rim of the wheel actually broke and cut the tire. Was it possible that her unconscious was aware that the tire, which was already in the process of reaching its breakdown, was going to blow out? Was it possible that her unconscious caused her to miss the by-pass and thus avoid being in the situation where she would have been driving 65-70 miles per hour, rather than 15 miles per hour? Is it not conceivable that events are unconsciously set in motion before they actually take place? If not limited by space and time, is it not possible that the unconscious could reveal that which has not yet actually taken place in consciousness in its final state?

Jung states that the term "synchronicity"

...explains nothing, it simply formulates the occurrence of meaningful coincidences, which in themselves, are chance happenings, but are so improbable that we must assume them to be based on some kind of principle, or on some property of the empirical world.⁶⁵

CONCLUSION

Jung, as a person, was always seeking questions and always willing to deal with them. His major concern was to bring about for each individual a psychic state "of fluidity, change and growth where nothing is eternally fixed and hopelessly petrified."⁶⁶ He was aware of the fact that it is impossible for any man to be completely objective. He said of himself:

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

I know well enough that every word I utter carries with it something of myself--of my special and unique self with its particular history and its own particular world.⁶⁷

It is Jung's position that men universally and spontaneously develop a religious function, and it is the psyche which expresses religious feelings and ideas.⁶⁸ While this discussion had been directed toward psychic phenomena and experience, rather than religious phenomena and experiences, Jung clearly sees the two as aspects of the same set of operatives and related in the larger sphere of mental processes. Thus, Jung's psychology can not be separated from his thoughts on religion for "a religious experience is a psychic process."⁶⁹ In his work, "Psychology and Religion,"⁷⁰ he presents good evidence for the possible psychic origin of religious phenomena. A clear statement of the contrast between the battle of Jung to be scientific, yet remain open to the Unknown, is portrayed when he conveys the thought that there is no place

for invisible, arbitrary, and so-called supernatural powers--unless, indeed, we descend with the modern physicist into the obscure, microcosmic world inside the atom, where, it appears, some very curious things happen. But that lies far from the beaten track. We distinctly resent the idea of invisible and arbitrary forces, for it is not so long ago that we made our escape from that frightening world of dreams and superstitions, and constructed for ourselves a picture of the cosmos worthy of our rational consciousness--that latest and greatest achievement of man."⁷¹

(All works cited by title in the footnotes are those of Jung. Volume numbers refer to volumes in the Collected Works.)

¹"Conscious, Unconscious, and Individuation," Vol. 9.1, p. 275.

²For a more complete discussion of the difficulties of translating these words see Vol. 8, pp. 303; 319-320; 329.

³"On the Psychology of the Unconscious," Vol. 7, p. 130.

⁴"The Psychology of Rebirth," Vol. 9.1, p. 116.

⁵"The Soul and Death," Vol. 8, p. 414.

⁶"Basic Postulates of Analytical Psychology," Vol. 8, p. 342.

⁷Vol. 8, p. 352.

⁸Vol. 8, p. 353.

⁹Vol. 8, p. 353.

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

- 10Vol. 8, p. 354.
- 11"The Real and the Surreal," Vol. 8, p.384. (For the same point, see also, "Basic Postulates of Analytical Psychology," Vol. 8, p. 353)
- 12Vol. 8, p. 384.
- 13Vol. 8, p. 384.
- 14"Spirit and Life," Vol. 8, p. 327.
- 15Vol. 8, pp. 326-327.
- 16"The Phenomenology of the Spirit in Fairytales," Vol. 9.1, p. 12.
- 17"Psychological Commentary on The Tibetan Book of the Great Liberation," Vol. 11, p. 480.
- 18C. G. Jung and Aniela Jaffe, recorder and editor, Memories, Dreams, Reflections, pp. 104-113.
- 19"On the Psychology and Pathology of So-called Occult Phenomena, C.W., Vol. 1, p. 17.
- 20C. G. Jung and Aniela Jaffe, pp. 108-109.
- 21Vol. 1, p. 19
- 22Vol. 1, p. 77.
- 23Vol. 1, p. 77.
- 24Vol. 1, p. 53.
- 25Vol. 1, p. 64.
- 26Vol. 1, p. 79.
- 27Vol. 1, p. 17.
- 28Vol. 1, p. 81.
- 29Vol. 1, p. 80.
- 30Vol. 1, p. 40.
- 31"The Psychological Foundation of Belief in Spirits," Vol. 8, pp. 301-318.
- 32"The Psychological Foundation of Belief in Spirits," Vol. 8, p. 303.
- 33Vol. 8, p. 303.
- 34Vol. 8, pp. 303-310.
- 35Vol. 8, p. 304.
- 36Vol. 8, pp. 304-305.

- 37Vol. 8, p. 309.
- 38"A Review of the Complex Theory," Vol. 8, p. 98.
- 39"The Psychological Foundation of Belief in Spirits," Vol. 8, p. 308.
- 40Vol. 8, p. 315.
- 41Vol. 8, p. 318.
- 42Vol. 8, p. 317.
- 43Vol. 8, p. 317.
- 44"The Transcendent Function," Vol. 8, pp. 67-91.
- 45"The Psychological Foundation of Belief in Spirits," Vol. 8, p. 318.
- 46"Synchronicity: An Acausal Connecting Principle," Vol. 8, pp. 417-519.
- 47"On Synchronicity," Vol. 8, p. 531.
- 48"Synchronicity: An Acausal Connecting Principle," Vol. 8, p. 437.
- 49Vol. 8, p. 452.
- 50"The Soul and Death," Vol 8, pp. 404-415.
- 51Vol. 8, pp. 412-413.
- 52"Forward to the I Ching," Vol. 11, pp. 589-608.
- 53Vol. 11, p. 592.
- 54"On the Nature of the Psyche," Vol. 8, pp. 159-234.
- 55Vol. 8, p. 215.
- 56For a discussion of archetypes, see Vol. 9.1.
- 57"On the Nature of the Psyche," Vol. 8, p. 231.
- 58Vol. 8, p. 232.
- 59"On Synchronicity," Vol. 8, pp. 520-531.
- 60"Synchronicity: An Acausal Connecting Principle," Vol. 8, pp. 417-519.
- 61Vol. 8, p. 447.
- 62Flying Saucers: A Modern Myth of Things Seen in the Skies, Vol. 8 p. 10.
- 63Flying Saucers, Vol. 8, p. 151.

Jung's Interpretation of Occult/Psychic Phenomena

- 64 Flying Saucers, Vol. 8, p. 152.
- 65 "On Synchronicity," Vol. 8, p. 531.
- 66 "The Aim of Psychotherapy," Vol. 16, p. 46.
- 67 "Freud and Jung: Contrasts," Vol. 4, p. 336.
- 68 "Freud and Jung," p. 339.
- 69 "Introduction to Religious and Psychological Problems of Alchemy," Vol. 12, p. 9.
- 70 "Psychology and Religion," Vol. 10, pp. 3-105.
- 71 "Archaic Man," Vol. 10, pp. 54-55.

BIBLIOGRAPHY: BOOKS

- Campbell, Joseph, editor. The Portable Jung. New York: The Viking Press, 1971.
- de Laszlo, Violet S., editor. Psyche and Symbol. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday/Anchor, 1958.
- Harding, M. Esther. Psychic Energy--Its Source and Its Transformation Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1973.
- Jacobi, Jolande. The Psychology of C. G. Jung. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1973.
- Jung, C. G. The Collected Works of C. G. Jung. Translated by R. F. C. Hull. 20 Volumes. Bollingen Series 20. 2nd ed. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1968.
- Volume 1: Psychiatric Studies (1970)
- Volume 3: The Psychogenesis in Mental Disease (1960)
- Volume 4: Freud and Psychoanalysis (1961)
- Volume 7: Two Essays on Analytical Psychology (1953)
- Volume 8: The Structure and Dynamics of the Psyche
- Volume 9.1: The Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious (1959)
- Volume 9.11: Aion Researches Into the Phenomenology of the Self (1959)
- Volume 10: Civilization in Transition (1964)
- Volume 11: Psychology and Religion: West and East (1958)
- Volume 12: Psychology and Alchemy (1953)
- Volume 15: The Spirit in Man, Art, and Literature (1966)
- Volume 16: The Practice of Psychotherapy (1966)
- Jung, C. G. Flying Saucers--A Modern Myth of Things Seen in the Skies. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1959.
- Jung, C. G. Memories, Dreams, Reflections, Aniela Jaffe, editor and recorder. New York: Vintage, 1963.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

Jung, C. G. Modern Man in Search of a Soul. New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1933.

Otto, Rudolf. The Idea of the Holy. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1973

Progoff, Ira. The Death and Rebirth of Psychology. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1973.

Progoff, Ira. Jung's Psychology and Its Social Meaning. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday/Anchor, 1973.

Serrano, Migual. C. G. Jung and Hermann Hesse--A Record of Two Friendships. New York: Schocken, 1966.

Singer, June. Boundaries of the Soul. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday/Anchor, 1973.

JOURNAL ARTICLE

McGuire, William, editor. "The Freud/Jung Letters: You Have Not Been Injured by My Neurosis," Psychology Today, February, 1974.

Elizabeth W. Fenske is Past President of SFF and a Jungian psychotherapist. Her address is 3310 Baring St., Philidelphia, PA. 19104.

PSYCHIC PERCEPTION AND PERSONAL INTEGRITY

Claire G. Walker

Healing, religious conversion, problem-solving, and "peaks" of various kinds result from psychic perception. The psychic individual, however, may not be either benevolent or spiritual. This paper offers criteria for evaluating the credibility of cults and psychic practitioners. It also affirms the religious role of psychic power as the tool which guarantees survival in this age.

We are living in a time of great fascination on the part of the public with dramatic manifestations of psychic power. Experiences of altered states of consciousness, including healing, religious conversion, problem-solving, and "peaks" of various sorts are part of the unfolding of psychic powers which has been rapidly expanding for the last 100 years. This is just as predicted in the 1890's. As is to be expected, the psychic instrument may or may not be motivated by hope of personal gain or afflicted with an exaggerated self-importance. The problem I see is not so much whether psychic powers are real, or whether the psychic and the spiritual have similar dimensions, though these discussions are always interesting. The immediate question is, what kind of manifestation of the psychic can we trust?

I feel strongly that a responsible organization should take a look at psychically operating groups and practitioners and make an attempt to help the public understand and evaluate them. Sometimes we seem to be on the edge of a new age of faith, a gullible open-mindedness almost afraid to reject anything. It is as if we were afraid of being "closed-minded".

In a recent book, Sir George Trevelyan, the British leader of New Age thought, has painted an attractive picture:

A new age is being born and a new society is forming, composed of those who have found within themselves the power of light and love. The spiritual within man unites with the spiritual in the cosmos, and out of this union a new order begins to crystallize.¹

Recognizing that no one path to fulfillment is the only right one, Trevelyan notes the many different ways in which this great spiritual advance shows itself. It does not have to be a psychic path; in fact, sometimes this is dangerous. Twenty years ago Raphael Kherumian wrote:

Parapsychology, while consolidating much scientific knowledge, turns us toward a religious conception of life, but its ways leads through the pitfalls of divination and magic, which abound in

pitfalls of divination and magic, which abound in errors and in possibilities of harming another.²

A Los Angeles newspaper this year printed a large and inclusive survey of the New Age movement, and raised the question: Will the churches be able to resist the pull of the paranormal?³ Last year a Denver paper printed a description of the New Age movement as the bloom of a new subculture⁴. Evidences of the present groundswell have been around us for some time. It seems to be a movement in at least two, and often contradictory, directions at the same time. The continuing and general liberalization of thinking is accompanied by the backlash of reactionary conservatism, and both minister to public curiosity about psychic phenomena. Many observers recognize a kind of spiritual groping underneath all of these, but the present scene seems to be dominated by an excitement, a sort of renaissance, based on an endless fascination with "miracles."

In all the material mirroring this development is recorded the warning that there are dangers attendant on the pursuit of psychic power. Mary Carman Rose pointed out pitfalls in some appeals that reach our questing spirits, especially unclarity, unfounded prophecy, unkindness, untruth, inconsistency, real danger, and growing dependence.⁵ All of these have been easy to discern in the present scene. Psychism is not the easy way to get all you want! In fact, as suggested some ten years ago by a Quaker observer, perhaps the biggest hazard is a two-way deception, and the bigger victim may be the psychic who succumbs to ego-inflation as the result of his or her special gift.⁶ That "paranormally-gifted people are not infallible nor even necessarily on the best theological track" was pointed out by Lawrence Althouse.⁷ We often hear the admonition of St. John of the Cross, "Beware of your visions, even if they are of angels."

As for the channeling aspect of psychic powers, warnings against indiscriminate opening of ourselves to discarnate entities and unknown influences are now coming to us from a number of directions. Booklet #1 in the 30th Anniversary SFF series (1986) has many of them under its title, THE PSYCHIC AND SPIRITUAL: WHAT'S THE DIFFERENCE? Particularly relevant are the cautions expressed by its authors during this time when there's a guru behind every tree and a voice from beyond on every tape. Two of the articles seem to be especially timely: "True Spirituality is a Cut Above Psychism" by Marg-Riette Montgomery and "Are There Dangers in Psychic Development?" by Harmon Bro. There's no urgency, no need for headlong hurry about sound growth, and it is not sound psychic growth which has a goal of self-advancement. Common sense should be kept with us, and dependency discouraged. Alice Bailey's voluminous channeled works, which are the base for the New Group for Creative Meditation, talk about the same glammers which victimize psychics.

Psychic Perception and Personal Integrity

After all, such warnings are not new. They have been sounded from the very beginning of the movement which gave rise to the new interest in the paranormal after its long suppression in a positivistic age. The noted psychic Helena Blavatsky, founder of the Theosophical Society, herself fell into the psychological trap of indiscreet use of her power. She soon realized this, and became strong warning voice. In 1890, in a message to American theosophists, she talked about coming developments in the 20th century:

As the preparation for the new cycle proceeds, as the forerunners of the new sub-race make their appearance on the American continent, the latent psychic and occult powers in man are beginning to germinate and grow.⁸

She went on to say that such movements as Christian Science, Mind Cure, Metaphysical and spiritual healing are neither spiritual nor divine, but merely the exercise of powers belonging to the lower planes of nature. She considered ethics much more basic to spiritual development than psychic laws. Three weeks before her death in 1891 she warned against misuse of the psychic:

Psychism, with all its allurements and all its dangers, is necessarily developing among you, and you must beware lest the Psychic outruns the Manasic [intellectual in the highest sense] and Spiritual development.⁹

The present international President of the Theosophical Society told at the annual convention in Adyar, India:

Preoccupation with subsidiary aims [rather than the inner apprehension of truth], study of methods to improve physical health, research into psychic phenomena and so forth do not help humanity to a wiser way of life, although they have their uses.¹⁰

Similarly, the American President Dora Kunz has expressed concern about channeling as "the opening of one's mind to mostly unknown sources and receiving messages of different kinds", and calls for caution in accepting the influence of others, especially if they are paid.¹¹

So we have both warnings about, and recognition of, the inevitability of latent human powers coming into manifestation. If in these are included clairvoyance, clairaudience, dowsing, plant consciousness, precognition, channeling, psychokinesis, deja-vu, regression, transpersonal guidance, flashes of vision and insight, ecstasy, incidents of synchronicity, OBE's and NDE's, precipitation, telepathy, telemetry--and even fire-walking!--is there any one of us who has not had more than one encounter?

Furthermore, such experiences are not limited to specifically New Age seekers. Exorcism is practiced in

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

mainstream churches. An Episcopal priest left his congregation because he was in bondage, he said, to a witch who cursed him in college.¹² Oral Roberts, during his campaign for millions of dollars of support, awoke in the night to feel the devil choking him and called his wife to chase the Evil One away.¹³ This did not prevent him from making a new appeal after his original goal was realized, for some more millions. American Health reported in February, 1987 a survey of the National Opinion Research Council of Chicago showing the 67% of American adults have experienced ESP and 42% believe they have been in contact with a deceased relative or close friend.¹⁴ A Wall Street Journal critic has described channeling as the "latest craze in California." The Amazing Randi, or stage magician James Randi, member of CSICOP, is being supported in his efforts to debunk psychism with a grant of \$272,000 from the John and Catherine MacArthur Foundation.¹⁶ This is at the same time that commercial catalogs are offering seekers self-help records and tapes that will help them love themselves and create their own reality--two enormously popular catch phrases for the successors of the me-generation. The music makers have identified a new source of profit in New Age recordings with colorful titles.¹⁷ Last year a Philadelphia jury awarded a claimant against Temple University Hospital \$988,000 damages for loss of her psychic power following a CAT scan, and this was in spite of the judge's instruction to ignore the psychic part of the plaintiff's case.

Despite all denunciations and misgivings, there is a growing deep belief that the psychic has a role in the guidance we can receive and also maintain our personal integrity. More and more it is believed now, as stated 50 years ago, that "There are spiritual forces in the world which continually seek proper instruments or channels through which they may manifest themselves."¹⁹ The accent is on the word "proper". The Quaker already referred to, and writing in the Friends Journal, saw implications of the psychic in relation to our spiritual quest for which its role is greater than in pragmatic matters like healing, dowsing, and hypnosis. He named an expanded concept of the human potential, recognition of the reality of the Universal Mind and the oneness of all life, the suggestion of life beyond bodily existence, hence a greater purpose for life, and a new appreciation of spiritual teachings and of Jesus.²⁰

More recently the SFF Newsletter carried some sober advice from Elva Curry, a "believer" whose statement has a lot more than this passage that is worthy of quoting:

We must run any information we hear from prophets on either side of the veil through our own inner guidance system. We have our own built-in safety system to protect us from misguided prophets, whether they are malevolent or simply ignorant. If any information we hear causes our system to go "tilt", it is time to run, not walk, away from that channel.²¹

Psychic Perception and Personal Integrity

Much advice about response to psychic encounters comes down to this same idea.

Then there is the optimistic prediction of Dr. Elmer Green of the Menniger Foundation that the next 20 years will bring much progress in legitimate research into psychic healing.²² The Institute of Noetic Sciences intends to help bring about the same progress for psychic channeling, with a commission to Arthur Hastings to write on this phenomenon. Hasting's preliminary observations are positive, yet sober. He gives some caveats about the spiritual quality of channeled sources, and points out the "...human tendency to overreact to the nature of the source, whether to elevate it or dismiss it. The pragmatic viewpoint is that value must be determined by the content and the consequences, not by the origin of the material."²³

This last sentence says something important for us in the 1980's. If we add the premise that the main function of the psychic should be to serve spiritual growth, we can also say that we can make errors of both ill-advised trust and over-hasty dismissal when we are looking at reports of the psychic. A century ago there was Madame Blavatsky; now we have Shirley MacLaine, Argatha, the Course in Miracles, Dick Sutphen, and a host of others. Can we avoid the error made by the English Society for Psychical Research in accepting the famous Richard Hodgson denunciation of Blavatsky, which is only now being slowly set right.²⁴ The degree of total and absolute conviction felt by anyone who has had positive and direct contact with a psychic experience is in marked contrast with the skepticism of someone who gets a second-hand account. Judgment, if any, must be cautious and not arrogant, and based on transpersonal parameters rather than one's own paradigm. For the contribution of the psychic factor to religious or spiritual growth is important to every individual.

I am not referring here to the dramatic exercise of supersensory power or to demonstrations for a price, but to the deliberate and systematic work everyone can choose to do, to integrate and transform the little self into a whole Self. This Self has the realization of a "spirit of life and creativity within all that is, and of [the individual's] connectedness with that spirit."²⁵ In the light of its awareness this Self has purpose in living and a sense of meaning. This is the psychic serving the spiritual, through a faculty of each individual that is tapped every day consciously or unconsciously. We see this faculty operating in new procedures and new perceptions of old ones, in recognition of new levels and sources of communication, and certainly in implications of the hypothesis now being advanced that consciousness may be the ultimate building block of matter. In developing this psychic power the individual risks no danger, and the power is not dependent on the gift vouchsafed to only a few chosen persons. It works without glamor and without motive of gain in any

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

sense. The new doors of psychic perception are open to all, and may very well reveal the promise of our future.

I have tried to arrive at a solution of my concern for validity, and for the puzzlement everyone faces in confronting the psychic surge in which we find ourselves. To avoid both the extremes of gullibility and the intractable stance of incredulity has been my aim. I want to propose for comment and criticism seven simple questions to aid in validating the messages, miracles, and missions we encounter almost daily.

To arrive at these seven I started with a list of 20 questions grouped around the ideas of accessibility, effect on lifestyle, nature of the appeal, tone of leadership, and the role of money. Experimenting with various persons and groups who were good enough to lend their good judgment seemed to indicate that normally about half the questions were answered negatively and half affirmatively when there was no cause for uneasiness about the psychic effect in question.

From these preliminaries, and with quite a lot of advice from colleagues, I derived the seven questions which seem basic and critical, all calling for affirmative responses if a valid benevolent and credible psychic manifestation is being considered.

The preliminary questions and seven basic ones are given herewith. I want again to urge the compelling importance which I believe this exercise has for us now and will have increasingly in the future.

PRELIMINARY QUESTIONS

1. Is the teaching, practitioner, or group readily accessible to you?
2. Must you agree to believe in or do something as a condition of acceptance?
3. Are there special obligations other than annual dues connected with continued access and association?
4. Will your experience here lead to your own further development?
5. Can you see your association as life-transforming in a positive sense?
6. Will you be led to deviate in showy ways of dress and life-style from your cultural mainstream?
7. Can you be free of self-deception or damage to your health or self-respect?
8. Can you continue to function as a responsible member of your society or nation?
9. Will you feel comfortable to discuss your experience with respected associates who are uninvolved in it?
10. Do you hear claims made for possession of the only and ultimate truth?
11. Are promises, special rewards, or special privileges offered exclusively to those who are committed?

Psychic Perception and Personal Integrity

12. Is the teaching consistent with the best you know of science, ethics, and spiritual truth?
13. Does the whole operation revolve around a single personality?
14. Does the leadership make demands that are not to be questioned?
15. Is teaching based on unverifiable authority?
16. Is an individual's charisma or psychic power crucial to the movement?
17. Can you envisage that your interest and devotion will be long-term?
18. Can you subscribe without reservation to the way funds are being used?
19. Are raising and spending money openly done and clearly understood?
20. Does the need for money seem proportionate to the goals of the work?

(#1-3: on accessibility; #4-8: on effect of life-style; #9-12: on nature of the appeal; #13-17: on tone of leadership; and 18-20: on role of money)

BASIC AND CRITICAL 7 QUESTIONS

Does the message or teaching:

1. "feel right", have the "ring of truth" to you? (That is, does it appear compatible with the best emotional, intellectual, and spiritual insights you have? Or does it strain your credulity with undue complexity?)
2. lead to further learning and independent growth which enrich life?
3. recognize personal commitments? (Or does it encourage or even demand the abrogation of your responsibilities?)
4. limit its demands to a reasonable share of followers' resources of time and money? (Or does it call for total submergence?)
5. refrain from promising exclusive rewards or privileges and from proclaiming the only ultimate truth which one is required to accept without question?
6. rest on a benevolent world view in which oneness of all life is affirmed? (Or does it include threats and prophecies of doom?)
7. come from leaders who themselves exemplify the preeminence of spiritual values? (Or does it come from opportunists who seek personal gain or importance?)

NOTES

¹George Trevelyan, Vision of the Aquarian Age. p. 20-1.

The Academy of Religion and Psychological Research

- ²Raphael Kherumian, "Can Parapsychology Prove Religious Experience?" p. 68. in SFF Anniversary Booklet #1: The Psychic and the Spiritual: What's the Difference?
- ³"Can Churches Resist the Pull of the Paranormal?" in Los Angeles Times, 15 Feb., 1987.
- ⁴"New Age Sub-cultures Blooming Across the U.S." in Denver Post, 5 Oct., 1986.
- ⁵Opening talk at ARPR Conference, May , 1986.
- ⁶R.H. Morris, "Psychic Expansion and Spiritual Discernment" in Friends Journal, 1 april, 1976.
- ⁷Laurence Althouse, "Spiritual Experience and Parapsychology", in SFF Quarterly Journal, Fall, 1986m p. 223.
- ⁸Reprinted in American Theosophist, March, 1987. p. 61.
- ⁹Ibid., p. 62.
- ¹⁰Radha Burnier, "An Inner Revolution". loc. cit. p. 59.
- ¹¹Dora Kunz, "Viewpoint". op. cit., p. 54.
- ¹²"Episcopal Priest's Resignation Leaves Parishioners in Shock", Baltimore Sun, 19 June, 1986.
- ¹³"Money Furor Sent Him to Hell and Back". Los Angeles Times, 21 Feb., 1987
- ¹⁴Andrew Greeley, "Mysticism Goes Mainstream" in American Health, Jan.-Feb., 1987, p. 47.
- ¹⁵Wall Street Journal, 1 April, 1987
- ¹⁶"A Ghostbuster Gets A Grant" Newsweek, 28 July, 1986
- ¹⁷"New Age Music Wins Wider Following As Many People Grow Too Old For Rock" Wall Street Journal, March, 1987.
- ¹⁸"PA. Jury Awards \$988,000 over Loss of Psychic Powers" Baltimore Sun, 29 March, 1986.
- ¹⁹G. de Purucker, 15th General Letter, 11 July, 1934. Quoted in Eclectic Theosophist, Jan.-Feb., 1986.
- ²⁰R.H. Morris, supra.
- ²¹Elva Curry, "Trance Channels", SFF Newsletter, March, 1987.
- ²²"Mind-Force Probes Encouraging, Preliminary Results Indicate", SFF Newsletter, Dec., 1986.
- ²³"Investigating the Phenomenon of Channeling", Noetic Sciences Review, Winter, 1986.

PSYCHIC PERCEPTION AND PERSONAL INTEGRITY

²⁴Theosophical History, London, Eng.: Jan. and Oct., 1985 and Oct., 1986; Also, Vernon Harrison, "J'Accuse". Journal of the Society for Psychical Research, April, 1986.

²⁵David Spangler, Emergence, p. 61-3.

²⁶Charles Wise's questions about "Source Messages" were printed in Spiritual Frontiers, Winter, 1987. His questions are:

1. Do they [the source messages] feel right to me, click as true?
2. Do they square with what I know spiritually?
3. Do they instruct me to do harm, hurt others, break the law?
4. Do they order me to make money gifts to specific causes?
5. Have they made specific prophecies or predictions of disasters?
6. Do they refuse to permit disagreement with or skepticism about their pronouncements?
7. Does the level of instruction remain high or is there an insidious coarsening of quality?

Claire G. Walker is Editor of Reflections of A Theosophist and a member of the Board of Trustees of ARPR. Her address is Broadmead A13, 13801 York Rd., Cockeysville, Md. 20130.

The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research

MEMBERSHIP APPLICATION

Please type or print

Date.....

Please enroll me as a member of the ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH in the membership category marked below. Enclosed are my annual membership dues in the amount of \$.....for the year beginning.....19.....

PATRON: \$100 and over

ACADEMIC: \$25....

SUPPORTING: \$15....

(Contributions and dues to THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH, an academic affiliate of SPIRITUAL FRONTIERS FELLOWSHIP, are deductible for income tax purposes under an Internal Revenue Service ruling of July, 1960.)

NAME.....

ADDRESS.....

CITY.....STATE.....ZIP.....

TELEPHONE.....

My present position, qualifications, terminal degrees are as follows: (For completion by those applying for Academic Membership. Please attach biographical sheets, outlines of work accomplished, etc. if available.)

.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....

Please enclose this application with your check or money order made payable to THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH and send to:

Boyce Batey, Executive Secretary
THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
Post Office Box 614
Bloomfield, Connecticut 06002

Phone (203) 242-4593

STATEMENT OF OWNERSHIP (as filed May, 1988)

The Proceedings of the 1987 Annual Conference of The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research, P.O. Box 614, Bloomfield, CT, 06002, an academic affiliate of Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship, Inc., 10819 Winner Road, Independence, Missouri, 64052. The Editor is Mary Carman Rose, Ph.D., 402 Gittings Avenue, Baltimore, Maryland 21212. The owner is Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship, an organization incorporated under the Illinois General Not-For-Profit Corporation Law to conduct business in the State of Missouri (with no stockholders), represented by The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research with a mailing office at Bloomfield, Connecticut.

STATISTICAL DATA	AVERAGE FOR PRECEDING YEAR	SINGLE ISSUE NEAREST FILING
Total copies printed.....	400	400
Paid circulation:		
Sales from office.....	0	0
Mail subscriptions.....	309	271
Total paid circulation.....	305	271
Free distribution.....	2	42
Total distribution.....	307	313
Office use, leftover, etc....	93	87
Total.....	400	400

I certify that the statements made by me above are correct and complete.

Boyce Batey,
Executive Secretary

* S T A R *
O R D E R F O R M

Date _____

Please send this Order Form with check to: STAR, 6940 Cairo Road, Cocoa, FL 32927 (305) 631-6117

Please send me the following cassettes recorded at the 12th Annual Conference, "PSYCHICAL RESEARCH AND SPIRIT", of The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research at Rosemont College, Rosemont, PA, May 24-26, 1987. The cost of each cassette is \$6.00 which includes handling and mailing costs. Make checks payable to STAR.

CASSETTE NUMBER	TITLE OF PRESENTATION	NO. OF COPIES	TOTAL (\$)
2067	Keynote Address: THE SPIRIT OF WHOLENESS by C. Alan Anderson, Ph.D.	_____	_____
2068	HAUNTED HOUSES: THE DARK SIDE OF SURVIVAL by Karlis Osis, Ph.D.	_____	_____
2069	AFTERLIFE TRADITIONS AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH by Ry Redd	_____	_____
2070	SCIENCE AND RELIGION LOOK AT THE IMAGE OF GUADALUPE by Frank C. Tribbe	_____	_____
2071	DEBUNKING THE "DEBUNKERS": WHERE IS THE PIKE FOR CSICOPS? by Charles Franklin Adams, M.T.S.	_____	_____
2072	INTUITIVE AWARENESS by Marcia Rose Emery, Ph.D.	_____	_____
2073	AN EXPLORATION OF C. G. JUNG'S INTERPRETATION OF OCCULT/PSYCHIC PHENOMENA by Rev. Elizabeth W. Fenske, Ph.D.	_____	_____
2074	ALTERED STATES OF CONSCIOUSNESS AND PSYCHIC PHENOMENA: EXPLORING THE SHAMANIC EXPERIENCE by Maxim Kramer, M.A.	_____	_____
2075	PSYCHIC PERCEPTION AND PERSONAL INTEGRITY by Claire G. Walker, M.A.	_____	_____
2076	IS THERE A RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN GOD AND PSI? by the winner of the 1987 Robert H. Ashby Memorial Award competition for the best paper on this topic, Rev. Robert Winterhalter, Ph.D.	_____	_____
		TOTALS:	_____

Please send the above items to: (Please Print)

Name _____ Telephone No. () _____
Address _____ City _____ State _____ ZIP _____

For information on the Purposes, Principles, and Membership of The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research, including the Conference Proceedings, The Journal of Religion and Psychical Research, and back issues of the journal and Proceedings and Order Forms for presentations at prior Academy conferences, contact:

THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
P. O. BOX 614
BLOOMFIELD, CONNECTICUT 06002

PHONE: (203) 242-4593

PURPOSES OF THE ACADEMY

THE ACADEMY OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH was formed in October, 1972 as an academic affiliate of Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship. Its purposes are threefold:

FIRST, to encourage dialogue, exchange of ideas and cooperation between clergy and academics of religion and philosophy and scientists, researchers and academics of all scientific and humanistic disciplines in the fields of psychical research and new disciplines as well as the historic sciences.

SECOND, to conduct an education program for these scholars, the Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship membership and the general public, blending data already available in the area of their common interest with the interchange of views stimulated in these scholars, to the end that both the scientific and religious communities may be better informed about such facts and views and their propriety, value and respectability.

THIRD, to work closely with, and offer good offices to, all reputable organizations having related interests in the fields of education, religion, science and psychical research.

The ACADEMY will endeavor to sponsor conferences and symposia for the presentation of scholarly data, points of view and interchange of ideas in the area where religion and psychical research interface; publish papers resulting from such meetings and other appropriate materials on this area that will be of interest to academics, scientists and clergy; and encourage formation of local chapters.

The ACADEMY is governed by a Board of Trustees composed of people of academic stature holding a post-graduate degree or the equivalent in outstanding activity relevant to the interests of the ACADEMY.

CATEGORIES OF MEMBERSHIP IN THE ACADEMY

- PATRON MEMBER: Open to anyone donating \$100 or more in a given calendar year. Includes full membership privileges for a one year period.
- ACADEMIC MEMBER: Open to academic religionists involved in research or teaching or those who have the proper terminal degrees (Ph.D., Th.D., St.D., and sometimes St.M. and M.A.) Also, academically or otherwise qualified psychical researchers, pastoral counselors, behavioral and humanistic psychologists, parapsychologists, and other academics teaching or contributing to research knowledge. Dues are \$25 annually.
- SUPPORTING MEMBER: Open to persons wishing to attend conferences and meetings, receive printed materials and desirous of helping finance the work of the ACADEMY. Dues are \$15 annually.

BENEFITS OF MEMBERSHIP IN THE ACADEMY

- THE JOURNAL OF RELIGION AND PSYCHICAL RESEARCH, a scholarly quarterly published in January, April, July and October.
- PUBLICATIONS - Members receive copies of Proceedings, papers and other materials published at intervals by the Academy.
- LENDING AND RESEARCH LIBRARY - Offers members an opportunity to borrow books by mail from one of the largest collections available on psychical, mystical, and allied fields. Library lists and progressive reading lists are available on request.
- REGISTRATION DISCOUNT - 20% discount when attending ACADEMY-sponsored programs.

To apply for membership, send check payable to the ACADEMY to the Executive Secretary, Boyce Ratey, P.O. Box 614, Bloomfield, CT. 06002 Phone (203) 242-4593.

The Journal of Religion and Psychical Research is indexed with abstracts in Religion Index One: Periodicals, American Theological Library Association, Chicago, available online through BRS (Bibliographic Retrieval Services), Latham, New York and DIALOG, Palo Alto, California.